Offering a fragrant holocaust: A priesthood of encounter and kenosis

Author: Wing Seng Leon

Persistent link: http://hdl.handle.net/2345/bc-ir:108279

This work is posted on eScholarship@BC, Boston College University Libraries.

Boston College Electronic Thesis or Dissertation, 2018

Copyright is held by the author, with all rights reserved, unless otherwise noted.

Offering a Fragrant Holocaust: A Priesthood of Encounter and Kenosis

A thesis submitted in partial fulfillment of the requirements for the Licentiate in Sacred Theology (S.T.L.) degree from the Boston College School of Theology and Ministry

By

(Jerome) Wing Seng Leon, SJ

Supervisor: Prof. John Baldovin, SJ Reader: Prof. Thomas Stegman, SJ

August 2018

TABLE OF CONTENTS

Introduction	1
Priesthood and the Society of Jesus	
Objectives of this Thesis	
History	7
The Church, the Priesthood and the Estrangement in the Early Modern Period	
Ignatius of Loyola and the Foundations of the Order	
Preti Reformati – The Orders of Clerk Regulars	
Instituting a Priestly Order – Discerning and Responding to the Divine Will	
Identity	
A Sacerdotal Society?	
A Ministerial Society	
A Religious Society	
The Jesuit Priesthood	
Theology	74
Ignatius, the Jesuits and St. Paul	
The Pauline Priesthood	
A Rahnerian Reading of the Pauline and Jesuit Priesthoods	
Kenosis: Drama, Sacrifice and Mediation	
Jesuit Priesthood: Self-Abnegation and Encounter	
Conclusion	
Bibliography	

CHAPTER I INTRODUCTION

Priesthood and the Society of Jesus

Writing to Thomas Jefferson in May, 1816, regarding the re-institution of the *Society of Jesus* after a forty-year suppression, John Adams opines:

I do not like the late Resurrection of the Jesuits. They have a General, now in Russia, in correspondence with the Jesuits in the U.S. who are more numerous than everybody knows [...] In as many shapes and disguises as ever a King of the Gypsies [...] In the shape of Printers, Editors, Writers, School masters etc. [...] If any Congregation of Men could merit, eternal Perdition on Earth and in Hell, [...] it is this Company of Loiola.¹

Adams portrays Jesuits negatively, highlighting their apparent "shiftiness" and chameleon-like qualities. His disdain for the men of the society is understandable given that it was made in an era and place where anti-Catholic sentiments remained high and tall tales of alleged Jesuit calumny were still circulating among the people. Although the Society of Jesus continue to have its fair share of detractors even in this day and age, Adams' assertion would seem rather exaggerated by today's standards.

Even if we dismiss Adams' two hundred year old statement as excessively critical and hyperbolic, it does raise some interesting questions relevant for the understanding of the Society of Jesus. First and foremost, it highlights the question of Jesuit identity. Historically speaking, religious institutes were founded in order to respond to particular needs of the Church or to embrace a particular Christian lifestyle according the vision of their respective founders, or both.² Thus, the communal lifestyle and primary ministries of a religious congregation are invariably related to its identity. However, such an approach in articulating identity appears to

¹ Abigail Adams, John Adams, and Thomas Jefferson, *The Adams-Jefferson Letters: The Complete Correspondence Between Thomas Jefferson and Abigail and John Adams*, ed. Lester J. Cappon (Chapel Hill, NC: University of North Carolina Press, 2012), 474.

² John W. O'Malley, "One Priesthood: Two Traditions," in *A Concert of Charisms: Ordained Ministry in Religious Life*, ed. Paul Kevin Hennessy (New York, NY: Paulist Press, 1997), 20.

present certain challenges for Jesuits. The men of the Society of Jesus are involved in a wide variety of ministries that are seemingly unrelated. Moreover, there is a popular perception that Jesuits are "individualistic" and they do not express their common vocation as members of the same religious order by living in a particular way. For instance, traditional orders, like the Dominicans and Franciscans have uniquely identifiable religious habits, while the Jesuits do not. Jesuits are also not required to pray the liturgy of the hours in choir, which is mandated for the other religious congregations. Thus, the members of the society apparently do not have a strong sense of communal life that is reflective of their shared religious identity. Perhaps Adams is correct in asserting that Jesuits are like "kings of the gypsies," who take on many "disguises" in their diverse works and ways of living that conceal rather than inform their collective identity. Furthermore, over the history of the society, Jesuits have been involved in endeavors that would hardly be considered "church ministries." Jesuit schools centered on a humanistic education and their scientific enterprise are examples of their works in the secular realm. Jesuit historian John O'Malley notes that the Jesuits' "engagement with secular culture became a hallmark of the order" and it was "neither occasional nor incidental but systemic."³ The strong commitment to these secular works further puts into question their identity as ecclesial ministers and members of a religious order.

The issue of Jesuit identity is further compounded by the fact that majority of its members live a dual vocation consisting of vowed religious and ordained ministers of the Church. The Society of Jesus is formally defined by the Church as an order of "clerk regulars" or religious priests.⁴ Taken at face value, this label suggests that a religious priest is merely an

³ John W. O'Malley, *The First Jesuits* (Cambridge, MA: Harvard University Press, 2001), 242.

⁴ Ibid., 159. O'Malley reports that the principal founder of the society, Ignatius of Loyola, had asserted that all professed members should be priests. There are Jesuit temporal coadjutors (brothers) who are not ordained but only priests can be admitted to the "fully professed" grade.

ordained minister who has an "add-on" identity of a religious because he has professed vows and gained membership to a particular congregation. However, is the integration of these two dimensions so simple and straightforward? The roles and identities of ordained ministers and vowed religious are essentially distinct in our common and popular understanding. Ever since the Council of Trent, there is a tendency to associate the ministerial priesthood almost exclusively with the diocesan priesthood, following a parish-based model.⁵ While the contemporary Church has broadened the definition of the priesthood in terms of ministries, there is still a bias towards its sacerdotal aspect. In contrast, religious congregations, traditionally, have other emphases, such as working in spiritual but non-sacramental ministries, cultivating self-perfection, and as previously mentioned, fostering a strong communal life.

Furthermore, there are other contradictory demands in his life as a priest and that of a vowed religious. For example, on the one hand, a religious is expected to live a life according to the evangelical counsels that calls for poverty and humility, and to stand witness against that which the world holds dear, such as power and authority. But on the other hand, by virtue of his ordination, a priest is spiritually empowered to "teach, rule and act in the person of Christ in the Eucharistic sacrifice,"⁶ and these special roles are generally associated with authority and power. Therefore, the pertinent question for any religious priest, is how does he resolve or at least mitigate this tension in order to live faithfully to his religious vows and at the same time discharge his governing duties as a priest? Differences in these "identity-defining elements" certainly present a challenge in developing any meaningful synthesis of the two aspects religious priesthood.

⁵ O'Malley, "One Priesthood: Two Traditions," 5–7.

⁶ Second Vatican Council, "Lumen Gentium [Dogmatic Constitution on the Church], November, 21 1964," in *Vatican Council II the Conciliar and Post Conciliar Documents*, ed. Austin Flannery, new rev. ed. (Collegeville, MN: Liturgical Press, 2014), #10, 361.

Objectives of this Thesis

The purpose of this thesis is to investigate and articulate an understanding of the priestly vocation in the Society of Jesus with the hope of addressing and clarifying some of the issues that have been raised above. Neither questions pertaining to priestly identity nor attempts at answering them are new. The Second Vatican Council has offered its vision of the priestly office.⁷ Over the course of the last fifty years, different popes and the Church hierarchy have continued to deliberate on the same question,⁸ in response to the apparent vocation crisis that the Church has been experiencing since the end of the Second Vatican Council.⁹ However, the Church's official treatment on the subjects of priestly identity, ministry and theology, may be inadequate in addressing similar concerns of ordained ministers who are also members of religious orders.¹⁰ Although the study in this thesis is neither comprehensive nor the final word on the question of priestly identity, it is my hope that it will offer some new insights in our understanding of the Jesuit priesthood.

O'Malley has suggested that in order to arrive at any meaningful understanding of

priesthood in the context of a religious institute, one needs to go beyond its spirituality associated

⁷ See Second Vatican Council, "Presbyterorum Ordinis [Decree on the Ministry and Life of Priests], December 7, 1965," in *Vatican Council II the Conciliar and Post Conciliar Documents*, ed. Austin Flannery, new rev. ed. (Collegeville, MN: Liturgical Press, 2014), 863–902; Second Vatican Council, "Lumen Gentium."

⁸ An example is Pope St. John Paul II, who was very involved in addressing the issues related to priestly identity. He started the tradition of writing to a letter to all priests on Holy Thursday each year, and also issued the Apostolic Exhortation, *Pastores Dabo Vobis*, considered to be an essential document on priestly formation and the theology of the priesthood. For more details of John Paul II's contributions on the topic of priesthood, see Thomas J. McGovern, *Priestly Identity: A Study in the Theology of Priesthood* (Dublin: Four Courts Press, 2002), 13–15.

⁹ Ibid., 1–3. The vocation crisis, marked by declining numbers entering seminarians and large numbers leaving the priesthood, is generally attributed to the loss of priestly identity due to the changes and innovations coming out of Vatican II, and also the impact of secular culture.

¹⁰ O'Malley, "One Priesthood: Two Traditions," 13; John W. O'Malley, "Priesthood, Ministry, and Religious Life: Some Historical and Historiographical Considerations," *Theological Studies* 49, no. 2 (1988): 223–224. O'Malley notes that while the Church acknowledges "one ministerial priesthood," Church documents relevant to this topic deal almost exclusively with the diocesan priesthood and treat its religious counterpart almost as an afterthought.

with that particular order and investigate their mission and ministries.¹¹ This is certainly not to say that spirituality is unimportant in understanding the identity of religious priesthood. However, he asserts that ministry is the crucial factor in shaping the "self-understanding of vast majority of religious orders founded since the thirteenth century."¹² It is by examining the category of ministry that one could arrive at some defining trait that characterizes the priesthood associated with a specific religious order. For example, previous studies on Jesuit priesthood have identified it as a "prophetic" or "missionary" priesthood, cast in the image of the "wandering prophet" from the Old Testament, or the Apostles in the New Testament, due to the society's emphases on preaching the Word of God and their vision of embracing an itinerant lifestyle.¹³ In a way, Jesuit ministries concretely express their spirituality. It is through their works that Jesuits respond to God. Given the diverse ministries in the early Society of Jesus, are there other characteristics that could help define the Jesuit priesthood? I think it is not only an interesting question but also quite an important one since Jesuits have been involved with works that could hardly be considered "mobile" even from very beginning of the society.¹⁴ Thus, is there another feature or image that could integrate these different aspects of missions and ministries, and offer a more coherent understanding of the Jesuit priesthood?

While the above historical approach certainly clarifies some of the issues related to Jesuit identity, it does not or only sparingly explore the underlying theology of the Jesuit priesthood.

¹¹ O'Malley, "Priesthood, Ministry, and Religious Life," 223.

¹² Ibid., 255.

¹³ Michael J. Buckley, "Likewise You Are Priests ...': Some Reflections on Jesuit Priesthood," in *Spirit, Style, Story: Essays Honoring John W. Padberg*, ed. Thomas M. Lucas (Chicago, IL: Loyola Press, 2002), 25; O'Malley, "One Priesthood: Two Traditions," 240.

¹⁴ The society officially became involved in the education apostolate in 1548. See O'Malley, *The First Jesuits*, 366; Society of Jesus, *The Constitutions of the Society of Jesus and Their Complementary Norms: A Complete English Translation of the Official Latin Texts.* (St. Louis, MO: Institute of Jesuit Sources, 1996), #274, [CN 324].

The ministerial priesthood is, after all, instituted by Jesus Christ¹⁵ and a participation in the Christ's priesthood.¹⁶ Thus, in exploring the topic of priestly identity, it is also important to understand the christology that underlies it. In other words, the pertinent question is "how is the Jesuit priesthood theologically related to the priesthood of Christ?"

In this thesis, I will attempt to address the two aforementioned questions, namely, to offer an alternative image of the Jesuit priesthood, and to provide a theology to support and explain it. I will suggest that mission of Jesuit priesthood is a mission of "encounter," and it is a notion that could possibly synthesize the disparate features of ordained ministry in the society. Following O'Malley's insight that Jesuit ministries "implicitly" follows a Pauline model,¹⁷ I will propose that certain theological elements found in the epistles of St. Paul, likewise, can help illuminate our understanding of the Jesuit priesthood. I submit that the idea of *kenosis* (Phil 2:6–8) and together with Paul's notion of "freedom for self-renunciation" (1 Cor 9:19–23) could provide the necessary theological grounding.

This thesis is organized as follows. Following this introductory chapter, chapter two will consider the historical factors that influenced Jesuit ministry and the society's genesis as a priestly order. Chapter three discusses the Jesuits' self-understanding of their priestly and religious identity by examining their works, and its official documents and also primary sources attributed to the members of the early society. The proposed theology of the Jesuit priesthood, as mentioned previously, will be explained in chapter four. Chapter five contains the conclusion.

¹⁵ Second Vatican Council, "Presbyterorum Ordinis," #2, 865.

¹⁶ Catholic Church, *Catechism of the Catholic Church* (London, UK: Geoffrey Chapman, 1994), #1545, 346.

¹⁷ O'Malley, "Priesthood, Ministry, and Religious Life," 242. O'Malley points to Jerome Nadal's assertion that it is "in Peter that the society finds stability and direction, but it is Paul who inspires the society's ministries."

CHAPTER II HISTORY

Was it divine providence and careful discernment or the confluence of historical forces that led to the founding of the *Society of Jesus* as an order of religious priests? This chapter serves to provide an overview of the early history of the Jesuits and also the historical events and actors that have shaped it during its inception. Although the order is almost five hundred years old, its foundations continue to have lasting effects on the lives on contemporary Jesuits in how they would understand themselves as ordained ministers of the Catholic Church, and how they would discharge their duties accordingly. Following the spirit of *ressourcement* of the Second Vatican Council,¹⁸ these men continually look towards the examples of the early Jesuits and their foundational documents for inspiration and guidance in living up to their calling as Jesuits and priests.

The Jesuit order was founded during a time of great social, political and ecclesial changes. Particular attention is given to the questionable state of the Catholic Church and the priesthood at that time which precipitated the reformation movement. Even though the society was not founded specifically as a response to the reformation, the general mood of day must have, at the very least, influenced the new religious order indirectly.¹⁹

Although the early Jesuits claimed that their founder is Jesus Christ and so the society bears his name,²⁰ any discussion of early the history of the society would be incomplete without considering the contributions of St. Ignatius of Loyola. The histories of the Jesuits and Ignatius

¹⁸ Second Vatican Council, "Perfectae Caritatis [Decree on the Up-To-Date Renewal of Religious Life], October 28, 1965," in *Vatican Council II the Conciliar and Post Conciliar Documents*, ed. Austin Flannery, new rev. ed. (Collegeville, MN: Liturgical Press, 2014), #2, 612.

¹⁹ O'Malley, *The First Jesuits*, 17.

²⁰ José García Castro Valdés, "Ignatius of Loyola and His First Companions," in *A Companion to Ignatius of Loyola: Life, Writings, Spirituality, Influence*, ed. Robert A. Maryks (Leiden, Netherlands: Brill, 2014), 69.

are indubitably intertwined. The minor Basque nobleman and former courtier was instrumental in the foundations of the order and nurturing the first generation of Jesuits. It follows that Ignatius' personal experiences and understanding of priesthood and religious life would have also affected the way the Jesuits approach to ordained ministry.

The innovative reforms implemented by Ignatius and the Society of Jesus will also be revisited in this chapter. The society was among a number of new religious congregations collectively known as "reformed orders of clerk regulars,"²¹ who felt the need to respond to the rampant clerical abuses at that time and sought to address them by offering alternative ways of exercising the priestly ministries, and living out the priesthood and religious life.

The Church, the Priesthood and the Estrangement in the Early Modern Period

Just before Lent in the year 1515, a crime was committed in the township of Azpeitia, in the Basque Country of Spain. The felony was reported to have been inflicted upon the clergy of the local parish of San Sebastián and perpetrated by two brothers from the family of the local nobility: the young Ignatius of Loyola and one of his older brothers, Pero López.²² While the particularities of the crime remain unclear, historical records do note that the transgression was committed with such malice and pre-meditation that it was considered a "very serious" offense.²³

Azpeitia is the township in which the Loyola homestead was located and in which the Loyola family wielded great influence. A little more than a century before the Loyola brothers' indiscretion occurred, the family had been given lordship and patronage of not only Azpeitia but also the parish Church of San Sebastián by the Castilian crown, and this endowment was later

²¹ Mark Lewis, "The First Jesuits as 'Reformed Priests," *Archivum Historicum Societatis Iesu* 65 (1996): 115–116.

²² James Brodrick, *Saint Ignatius Loyola: The Pilgrim Years, 1491-1538* (San Francisco, CA: Ignatius Press, 1998), 45.

²³ Ibid. The crime was reported as "*muy enormes*" or "very huge" shows the gravity of Ignatius and Pero's act.

also confirmed by the Spanish bishops.²⁴ The brothers' crime was somewhat related to their family's patronage over Azpeitia and the local parish. There was a simmering dispute between the rector of the parish, Juan de Anchieta and the Loyola family. Both parties had claimed jurisdiction over a Franciscan convent founded by María López de Emparán, a cousin of Ignatius.²⁵ Other than the question of legal rights, there were also financial concerns. The rightful patron would undoubtedly have claims over the revenues of the convent. Anchieta and local clergy would also have to contend with a reduction of income if portion of tithes and donations were to be diverted away from the parish and to the convent.²⁶ Moreover, Anchieta and the Loyolas also contested for control over the parish. The Loyolas had plans to appoint Pero López to the benefice of San Sebastián parish. Even though Pero was a priest of questionable morals and repute, and came to father children even in the clerical state, the lords of Azpeitia saw it their given right to make such an appointment.²⁷ Again, being endowed with a parochial benefice would also mean a source of income since the parish likely owned property and other holdings. Anchieta had other ideas. The rector was an influential figure in his own right, as he was at some point the "Master of the Chapel Royal" of the Spanish king and queen, and also a religious writer and court musician of some repute.²⁸ He believed that as rector of the parish, he also retained the right to appoint his nephew, García López de Anchieta, to the benefice of the parish.²⁹ These two sore points, among other things, had probably led to Ignatius' and Pero's criminal act that landed them in trouble with the law.

²⁴ William W. Meissner, *Ignatius of Loyola: The Psychology of a Saint* (New Haven, CT: Yale University Press, 1992), 7.

²⁵ Ibid., 159.

²⁶ Brodrick, Saint Ignatius Loyola, 45.

²⁷ Ibid.

²⁸ Ibid., 44; Meissner, Ignatius of Loyola, 160.

²⁹ Brodrick, Saint Ignatius Loyola, 45.

Both Pero and Ignatius appealed to the ecclesiastical authorities for assistance hoping to claim exemption from prosecution by the civil authorities because of their clerical status. Even though Ignatius' claim of "immunity" was rejected by the provincial magistrate, as his clerical state had not been officially recorded in any registry, he still managed to escape legal consequences due to the protection he received from the church authority in Pamplona.³⁰

This episode in the life of Ignatius does not only serve as another example of his rather misspent youth, but also provides us with a glimpse into the state of the Church and the priesthood during that period of European history. Although the end of the fifteenth and beginning of the sixteenth century coincided with the dawn of the nation-state and the growing independence of civil powers, the Catholic Church in Spain continued to possess considerable influence over the everyday lives of the people. The protection and effective pardons Ignatius and Pero López had received from the church authorities also showed that the extent and magnitude of its power. In general, civil laws had not been technically applicable to members of the clergy ever since the middle age. This was to ensure that the Church was protected from any interference from the secular realm in order to maintain the "sacredness" of Church matters.³¹ There were, of course, certain exceptions to this segregation of powers. The Spanish crown granting the Loyolas patronage of the parish in Azpeitia shows that perhaps the appointment of ecclesial benefices by civil rulers was one such exception. There were other exceptions in the Iberian Peninsula. The dawn of the sixteenth century was also an era considered as the "golden age of Spain." While the Catholic monarchs of Spain recognized the Rome's authority on all spiritual matters, they were much more willing to challenge the Church's influence in the temporal realm and demanded that the crown retain the right to appoint prelates within the

³⁰ Ibid.

³¹ Euan Cameron, *The European Reformation*, 2nd ed. (Oxford, UK: Oxford University Press, 2012), 33.

Spanish realm.³² Rather than diminishing the power of the local church, the ecclesiastical authority was, in fact, amplified since it had the backing of King Ferdinand and Queen Isabella who were fervent Christians. For instance, working with the Spanish crown, the Holy Office of the Catholic Church instituted the Spanish Inquisition in 1478³³ with widespread power and authority to arrest, prosecute, incarcerate, and torture heretics and those who were suspected of being enemies of the faith, and also executing those found guilty of such crimes.³⁴ Perhaps one of the only exceptions was that civil rulers continued to wield some influence over the appointments of benefices.³⁵

While the Church demanded preservation of their independence from the secular realm, it had no hesitation in getting involved in the affairs of the world. Clerical commissions were more than spiritual and religious offices. Popes, bishops and other members of the clergy were "politicians, administrators and landowners."³⁶ Thus, they certainly wielded considerable political and economic power during that period. The privileged state of the Church and members of its hierarchy ultimately led to the abuse the wide-ranging powers associated with clerical offices.

Although the clergy commanded a certain degree of authority, their ethics and conduct did not reflect their roles as bearers of the sacred office of the priesthood. Pero's less than exemplary lifestyle was perhaps symptomatic of the clergy during that period. It was not uncommon to find priests who had fathered children despite being bound by the oath of celibacy. The fact that the Church Council of Seville in 1512 had issued a recommendation prohibiting

³² Stanley G. Payne, *Spanish Catholicism: An Historical Overview* (Madison, WI: University of Wisconsin Press, 1984), 38.

³³ Ibid., 32.

³⁴ Ibid., 35.

³⁵ Cameron, *The European Reformation*, 33.

³⁶ Ibid., 33–34.

priests from "attending the weddings of their own children and bequeathing property to their concubines"³⁷ suggests the prevalent moral laxity among the ordained ministers of the Church. Even though Latin Church laws forbade priests from entering into matrimony, the arrangement of priests keeping concubines and bearing progeny was openly and widely accepted even in the early modern period.³⁸ Moreover, instead of strengthening the enforcement of celibacy among the clerics, some bishops saw this more as a business opportunity and demanded payment from priests who wanted to legitimize their offspring.³⁹

The discord between the Loyolas and Anchieta also showed how business and financial gains had a big role in the workings of the Church during that time. The Church at that time was receiving revenues from tithes, rents and tolls, and earnings from their various investments. Furthermore, church officials could also rightfully receive remuneration for "services" such as saying masses for particular occasions or people.⁴⁰ It is understandable that money was needed for the upkeep of the clerics, to fund the maintenance and construction of church property and to finance debt repayment, and therefore revenues from these sources were necessary. However, given the almost absolute authority of the Church in all spiritual matters, and the open practice of trading "spiritual services" for money, it was thus not surprising that these ultimately led to clerical abuses. Licenses to circumvent canon laws were readily available for a price which generated a substantial amount of income for the Church. These "indulgences" included "dispensations for marital bonds" and "retrospective legitimization of children" as previously

³⁷ Payne, *Spanish Catholicism*, 39.

³⁸ Helen Parish, Clerical Celibacy in the West: C.1100-1700 (London, UK: Routledge, 2016), 125.

³⁹ Cameron, *The European Reformation*, 42.

⁴⁰ Ibid., 30.

described.⁴¹ Pope Sixtus IV even legitimized the reduction of one's sentence in purgatory for the right amount of money.⁴²

Some members of the Church hierarchy were thus effectively living and acting like feudal lords and merchants trading in "spiritual services" and indulgences. Many priests were also absent from their parish as they held benefices of several parishes or they were simply contented with collecting the revenues from these holdings and employ "mass-priests" who were without benefice to undertake the sacramental work.⁴³ Due to this mindset, the poorer rural areas were generally deprived of clergy to serve their sacramental needs as they were unable to afford to maintain the permanent or semi-permanent presence priests in their parishes, while there was an oversupply of ordained ministers looking for work in the cities because of the greater economic opportunities there.⁴⁴ By treating the benefices and the clerical offices respectively as property, and means to a livelihood and material gains, many of priests were poorly educated since they were uninterested even in the rudiments of the Christian faith.⁴⁵

The advent of the modern era was not only characterized by the developing awareness of the importance of the individual person in relation to the world, and the gradual coming age of the nation-states, the discoveries of new worlds, but also the call for reform of the Church and clergy that was ever growing louder. It was during this time that major personalities of the reformation, such as Martin Luther and John Calvin, grew in prominence and their criticisms of the Church came to the fore. For many, the Church had somehow lost its way. Rather than the

⁴¹ Ibid., 36.

⁴² Arthur Geoffrey Dickens, *Reformation and Society in Sixteenth-Century Europe* (London, UK: Thames & Hudson, 1966), 35.

⁴³ Peter G. Wallace, *The Long European Reformation: Religion, Political Conflict, and the Search for Conformity, 1350-1750,* 2nd ed. (New York, NY: Palgrave Macmillan, 2012), 34.

⁴⁴ Ibid., 34–35.

⁴⁵ Cameron, *The European Reformation*, 41.

serving the needs of the people, members of the ecclesial hierarchy were more interested in serving their own needs and strived to maintain and even expand the powers they wielded.

It is inconceivable that Ignatius and his contemporaries were unaware of the state of the Church and the priesthood in his time. The misdeed Ignatius had perpetrated with his brother Pero López and Pero's questionable moral character show that he and his family were very much involved with ecclesial politics and business.⁴⁶ The young Basque might not have questioned the ethics of these practices at that time but he certainly had knowledge of them. Just as the people had begun hoping for the reform of the Church and its practices, it was also more than likely such an aspiration had also shaped Ignatius' worldview and influenced him after he had left behind his life of excesses and embraced a one of faith and discipleship, and founded the Society of Jesus.⁴⁷

Ignatius understood the dismal state of the clergy and the Church then, and the necessity and even urgency of their reform. He saw the distancing of the Church hierarchy from the Body of Christ made up of the faithful, and eventually he would acknowledge that something had to be done to heal the estrangement. His eventually conversion had reconciled him with God, and he would have also shared the same desire for others. As an individual and also in his leadership position in the society, Ignatius got to work.

Ignatius of Loyola and the Foundations of the Order

Francis Xavier, one of the most revered saints in the Catholic tradition, and a co-founder of the Society of Jesus, in a letter to his brother, Juan, writes:

⁴⁶ Meissner, *Ignatius of Loyola*, 161. The Loyola family continued to exercise "scandalous" control over the benefice of the parish of Azpeitia even as late as the 1530s. Martin Garcia, Ignatius' oldest living brother and lord of the family estate, had even appointed his son, Pérez de Loyola to the benefice, and an illegitimated son to another benefice in neighboring Onãz.

⁴⁷ Ibid.

In order that your Grace may clearly know what a great favor our Lord has done to me by having me come to know Lord Master Ignatius, [...] I shall never be able to repay the great debt which I owe him, both for his having frequently assisted me in my needs [...] and for having been the reason why I abandoned some evil companions whom I, through the lack of experience, did not recognized as such. [...] I earnestly entreat you not to fail to with Lord Ignatius and to believe what he tells you. His advice and conversation can be of great advantage to you, since he is a great man of God and of a very good life.⁴⁸

Xavier's high praise and trust of the older Basque reveal the great positive impact that Ignatius had on his younger compatriot while they were both students at the University of Paris. The future patron saint of foreign missions found not only a friend in Ignatius, but also a spiritual teacher and confidant, who edified and inspired him. Soon, young Xavier would also come to share in Ignatius' desire of serving Christ. Xavier was not the only person in Paris who was influenced by Ignatius and shared similar sentiments. Like Xavier, these like-minded individuals were drawn to Ignatius' charisma, shaped by the force of his personality and thus also share in his aspirations for the Church and the world. They came to be known as the "first companions" who would become the seed of the future Society of Jesus.⁴⁹ Thus, even though the Society of Jesus was founded by a group of ten companions from the University of Paris, the Basque nobleman would have been considered the nucleus of the group, the person who had brought the others together. The Jesuit order may not bear Ignatius' name, but his influence on "the Company of Jesus" cannot be overstated.

⁴⁸ Saint Francis Xavier, "To Juan de Azpilcueta, in Obanos (from Paris, March 25, 1535)," in *The Letters and Instructions of Francis Xavier*, trans. M. Joseph Costelloe (St. Louis, MO: Institute of Jesuit Sources, 1992), #6-#7, 4-5.

⁴⁹ John W. O'Malley, *The Jesuits: A History from Ignatius to the Present* (Lanham, MD: Rowman & Littlefield, 2014), 1–2. Although some sources credit the foundation of the society solely to Ignatius, it is generally attributed to a group of "first companions," namely: Ignatius, Francisco Javier (Francis Xavier), Pierre Favre (Peter Faber), Diego Laínez, Alfonso Salmerón, Nicolás Bobadilla, Simao Rodrigues, Claude Jay, Paschase Broët, and Jean Codure. While the first seven companions were gathered by Ignatius, Jay, Broët, and Codure were recruited by Favre during Ignatius' absence from Paris.

A number of years after his alleged transgression in Azpeitia, Ignatius underwent a series of life-changing transformations.⁵⁰ He was first awakened spiritually while nursing injuries he had received at the Battle of Pamplona in 1521. Ignatius saw the hand of God beckoning him to a new life in serving his "Divine Majesty." In the following two decades, he was consistently purifying his motives for following this path, and was constantly engaging in discernment to discover where God's hand was leading him. After spending some years living as a pilgrim, he finally decided to get the necessary formal education in order to be of better service to the Church and faith. He also attempted to gather a fellowship of people who shared his vision of Christianity and service. Ignatius was also engaged in spiritual and corporal works of mercy during this period despite not having been sanctioned by the Church. Due to this lack of official recognition, he was repeatedly scrutinized and even mistreated by the Church hierarchy. His earlier attempts at forming a stable group of "companions" in Spain had failed. It was only at the University of Paris where he managed to assemble a permanent group of comrades that included future saints such as Francis Xavier and Peter Faber. Their original intent was not to form a religious order, but to proceed to the holy land and serve the needs of the Christians there.⁵¹ However, this plan was thwarted by circumstances beyond his control, and Ignatius finally saw the divine hand of God drawing him and the companions to Rome and to place themselves at the service of the Universal Church under the direction of the Supreme Pontiff. The Society of Jesus

⁵⁰ Cándido de Dalmases, *Ignatius of Loyola, Founder of the Jesuits: His Life and Work*, trans. Jerome Aixalá (St. Louis, MO: Institute of Jesuit Sources, 1985). A historical account of the life and times of Ignatius is found here.

⁵¹ Saint Ignatius of Loyola and Luis Gonçalves da Câmara, "Reminiscences or Autobiography of Ignatius Loyola," in *Personal Writings: Reminiscences, Spiritual Diary, Select Letters Including the Text of The Spiritual Exercises*, trans. Philip Endean (London, UK: Penguin Books, 2004), #85, 54.

was approved as a religious order, by Pope Paul III with promulgation of the papal bull, *Regimini Militantis Ecclesiae*, on September 27, 1540.⁵²

While it is not incorrect to say that the founding of the society was a corporate endeavor involving all the first companions, Ignatius is generally recognized as its primary founder. Beyond being the central unifying figure in gathering the first companions, his vision in a chapel at La Storta, just outside of Rome, served as the turning point which ultimately convinced Ignatius that placing the companions at the pope's disposal was God's will.⁵³ He also provided the spiritual foundation of the Society of Jesus. Other than being the "spiritual master" to the first companions, Ignatius also authored one of the foundational documents of the society, the Spiritual Exercises, a spiritual treatise and an instructional manual for directing a retreat, which is grounded on his personal spiritual experiences. The first companions (and all subsequent Jesuits) had undergone the retreats based on the Spiritual Exercises. While the first Jesuits in 1539, as a group, deliberated on and submitted the founding formula of the order, also known as the Formula of the Institute, to the pope for approval, its primary authorship is generally attributed to Ignatius.⁵⁴ The first version of the *Formula*, also known as the "five chapters," was promulgated together with *Regimini Militantis Ecclesiae* in 1540. Following additional reflection on over the first decade of the society, Ignatius and his assistants also drafted a second and expanded version of the Formula. It was approved by Pope Julius III and promulgated together with the bull Exposcit Debitum in 1550. These Formulae contains the "blueprint" of the objectives of the Society of Jesus as a religious and mentions the general ways and means in which to attain these goals. Another major Jesuit document, the *Constitutions*, was written by

⁵² Society of Jesus, *Constitutions*, 3.

⁵³ Dalmases, Ignatius of Loyola, Founder of the Jesuits, 151–153.

⁵⁴ Barton T. Geger, "The First First Companions: The Continuing Impact of the Men Who Left Ignatius," *Studies in the Spirituality of Jesuits* 44, no. 2 (Summer 2012): 23.

Ignatius with the assistance of his secretary, Juan Alfonso de Polanco,⁵⁵ and which has guided the "way of proceeding"⁵⁶ of the society and shaped the identity of Jesuits ever since the beginning of the religious order.⁵⁷ Moreover, Ignatius was the first general of the society and his leadership of the order lasted for more than fifteen years. During those years, he had written numerous letters to men under his care, instructing them on matters associated with being a Jesuit, and thus helped in shaping their spiritual and moral life. Like founders of other religious orders, such as Francis of Assisi and Dominic de Guzmán, Ignatius had a profound impact on the early members of the society and also subsequent generations of Jesuits.

Perhaps one of the most important contributions Ignatius has offered, not only to the Society of Jesus but also the Church, is the systematic treatment of the practice of discernment. While the art of discernment provided Ignatius and the early Jesuits a means to help advance the spiritual life of the faithful and aid them in making wise decisions, it also reflects the openness to diversity that is inherent in Jesuit spirituality. For example, in a letter to St. Francis Borgia advising him on whether to accept a cardinalship, Ignatius writes: "Despite all this I was also convinced, and still am, that while it was God's will that I should adopt a clear position, if others adopted a contrary view and you were given this dignity, there would not be any contradiction whatsoever."⁵⁸ Thus, Ignatius, within good reasons and after proper discernment, respected a diversity of views on matters related to vocation and ministry.

⁵⁵ J. Carlos Coupeau, *From Inspiration to Invention: Rhetoric in the Constitutions of the Society of Jesus* (St. Louis, MO: Institute of Jesuit Sources, 2010), 12.

⁵⁶ John W. O'Malley, *Saints or Devils Incarnate?: Studies in Jesuit History* (Leiden, Netherlands: Brill, 2013), 179. According to O'Malley, the Jesuit "way of proceeding" encompasses many things, such customs, rules, behavior and ways of governing and ministering generally to the Society of Jesus. ⁵⁷ Coupeau, *From Inspiration to Invention*, 5.

⁵⁸ Saint Ignatius of Loyola, "Refusing a Cardinal's Hat (Francis Borgia, June 5, 1552)," in *Personal Writings: Reminiscences, Spiritual Diary, Select Letters Including the Text of The Spiritual Exercises,* trans. Philip Endean and Joseph A. Munitiz (London, UK: Penguin Books, 2004), #2, 246.

The Infusion of Humanism

In the preamble to the *Spiritual Exercises*, the foundational spiritual document of the society, Ignatius writes:

Outside the Exercises it can indeed be lawful and meritorious for us to move all who seem suitable to choose continence, virginity, religious life and every form of evangelical perfection, but during these Spiritual Exercises it is more opportune and much better that the Creator and Lord communicate Himself to the faithful soul in search for the will of God, as He inflames her in His love and praise, disposing her towards the way in which she will be better able to serve Him in the future. Hence the giver of the Exercises should not be swayed or show preference for one rather than the other, [...] should leave the Creator to work directly with the creature, and the creature with the Creator and Lord.⁵⁹

Read in a straightforward manner, this passage serves as Ignatius' instructions to retreat directors on how to they should interact with their retreatants. The key Ignatian insight here, which is also found throughout the *Exercises*, is that it is the retreatant who is undergoing the Spiritual Exercises and should therefore be given the autonomy to experience God's presence himself or herself without imposition of the retreat director. Although a statement that advocates such an individualistic approach may not sound too out of place in our time, Ignatius' advice is remarkable given that it was written in sixteenth century, a period when there was widespread persecution of those suspected of unorthodoxy.⁶⁰ The Church emphasized its own necessity in the economy of salvation. Thus, private revelations and personal enlightenment were considered by the ecclesial authorities as heresies in the mold of Pelagianism and Gnosticism. Given the situation then, it was highly probable that the *Spiritual Exercises* would face criticism, and

⁵⁹ Saint Ignatius of Loyola, "The Spiritual Exercises," in *Personal Writings: Reminiscences, Spiritual Diary, Select Letters Including the Text of The Spiritual Exercises*, trans. Joseph A. Munitiz and Philip Endean (London, UK: Penguin Books, 2004), #15, 286.

⁶⁰ Sabina Pavone, "A Saint under Trial: Ignatius of Loyola between Alcalá and Rome," in *A Companion* to Ignatius of Loyola: Life, Writings, Spirituality, Influence, ed. Robert A. Maryks (Leiden, Netherlands: Brill, 2014), 45–65. One such group were the *alumbrados* who had emphasized "personal illumination," and a more private approach to faith. They were brought to task by the inquisition. Ignatius, during his sojourn in Europe, had been mistaken for being an *alumbrado* on a few occasions and faced the wrath of the inquisition.

Ignatius and the first companions might also be denounced for communicating such theologically suspicious ideas. Despite the possible dangers, Ignatius still insisted on promoting *Exercises*.⁶¹

Ignatius' decision to popularize the *Exercises* was most likely due to his conviction that it was divinely inspired. However, we also should not discount the possibility that he was motivated by other concerns. With the founding of the Jesuit order and the increasing membership, he needed to disseminate the instructions on how to give the *Exercises* so that other Jesuits could also direct retreats for the members in formation. Moreover, from his decades of experience in giving the *Exercises*, Ignatius must have realized that he had at his disposal a very powerful means to promote and reinvigorate the faith among the laity, and thus he conceived this as an innovative approach to ministry. The "propagation of faith" by way of giving retreats (the *Spiritual Exercises*) is thus enshrined in the *Formula of the Institute* as one of the specific ministries proper to the society.⁶² Therefore, Ignatius could have perceived the common and greater good that disseminating and employing the *Spiritual Exercises* might bring.

While Ignatius' desire to serve the "common and greater good," and the heightened sense of individuality and personal liberty seem to be at odds, they are in fact characteristics of the humanistic revival movement during the early modern period. Renaissance humanism advocated the idea of "individual within community," in which the dignity and freedom of the individual person are recognized and promoted without neglecting the duties of the individual towards the good of the community. This is a contrasting view to the over emphasis of the individual person found in renaissance thinking, on the one hand, and the highly "corporate culture" of the medieval era which prioritized the needs of the community almost at the expense of the

 ⁶¹ Ibid., 57–58. Ignatius and his companions were, in fact, accused of heresy and faced trial at the end of 1538. Their supporters attested to the orthodoxy of the *Spiritual Exercises*. They were later exonerated.
 ⁶² Society of Jesus, "Formulas of the Institute of the Society of Jesus," in *The Constitutions of the Society of Jesus and Their Complementary Norms: A Complete English Translation of the Official Latin Texts*. (St. Louis, MO: Institute of Jesuit Sources, 1996), #1, 4.

individual person, on the other hand.⁶³ Renaissance humanism attempts to synthesize these the poles, or at least hold them in a workable tension.

The rediscovery and study of classical Greek and Roman literature during the advent of modernity had acted as the impetus that drove the humanistic movement in Europe. The general intellectual environment could very well have indirectly shaped the mindset of Ignatius and the first companions. Moreover, they had studied at the Universities of Alcalá and Paris,⁶⁴ two centers of the revival movement. They were most likely influenced by some aspects of humanism while studying there. Perhaps due to their own positive experiences with a humanistic education and recognizing the value it brought, Ignatius and the first companions incorporated a similar system into the formation program for the men who joined their ranks. Humanistic ideals were thus fostered even in the early society. The curriculum of studies at schools and colleges where future Jesuits were trained, was peppered with heavy doses of lessons centered on classical Greek and Latin texts. The Ratio Studiorum, or the formalized Jesuit plan of studies, officially promulgated in 1599, unequivocally states that importance of texts authored by such classical luminaries such as Aristotle and Cicero in Jesuit education.⁶⁵ Documents pre-dating the Ratio also attest to the fact that even while Ignatius was alive, the classical humanistic education played an important role in the formation of Jesuits.⁶⁶

Given the curriculum of their intellectual formation, it is thus unsurprising that certain features associated with renaissance humanism were found in the ways Jesuits express their faith and mission. Notions such as the respect of the freedom and dignity of the individual, care of the

⁶³ Ronald Modras, Ignatian Humanism (Chicago, IL: Loyola Press, 2004), 61.

⁶⁴ Ibid., 64–65.

⁶⁵ Society of Jesus, *The Ratio Studiorum: The Official Plan for Jesuit Education*, trans. Claude N. Pavur (St. Louis, MO: Institute of Jesuit Sources, 2005), #375, 155; #380, 159.

⁶⁶ Juan Alfonso de Polanco, "The Importance of Humanistic Studies in Jesuit Formation (1547)," and "Directives on Academic Progress (1548)," in Jesuit Pedagogy, 1540-1616: A Reader, ed. Cristiano Casalini and Claude N. Pavur (Chestnut Hill, MA: Institute of Jesuit Sources, 2016), 41–54.

community and positive attitude towards the secular realm, all values inculcated by humanistic education are compatible with the incarnational spirituality and practice of discernment associated with Ignatius. From a more pragmatic angle, by nurturing a love for higher learning and the art of rhetoric, hallmarks of humanism, among themselves, the Jesuits were able to become more effective in ministry as the population were slowly becoming more sophisticated. Moreover, it was the age of the Protestant Reformation and dissenters, and perhaps a more persuasive approach, following the principles of rhetoric was more fruitful in winning back the hearts and minds of those who have left the Catholic Church.

The early Jesuits' embrace of values and methods of humanism was, in fact, very much according to the spirituality promoted by Ignatius. In the "Principle and Foundation" of the *Exercises*, Ignatius writes: "The human person is created to praise, reverence and serve God Our Lord, and by so doing to save his or her soul. The other things on the face of the earth are created for human beings in order to help them pursue the end for which they are created. [...] we should desire and choose only what helps us more towards the end for which we are created."⁶⁷ Following this "principle," Ignatius and the early Jesuits perceived the usefulness of the practices and ideas associated with humanism in their exercise of priesthood, ministry and living as religious, and thus appropriated them into their formation and "way of proceeding."

Preti Reformati - The Orders of Clerk Regulars

The Jesuits came to be known as *preti reformati* or reformed priests. In fact, even before the official institution of the society as a religious order in 1540, the first companions were already identified by some people, probably based on their outward appearances and their ministries, as

⁶⁷ Saint Ignatius of Loyola, "Spiritual Exercises," #23, 289.

"reformed priests."⁶⁸ Ignatius and his early companions were not the only ones who had aspired to make positive changes to the state of Christianity during the early sixteenth century reflected by the moral laxity and the dubious practices of clergymen. There were already certain groups of clerics identified as reformed priests, technically known as orders of clerk regulars, such as the Theatines, Barnabites and Somaschans,⁶⁹ who were actively ministering to the people at that time, and who shared similar external traits as Ignatius and his brothers. Thus, many had mistaken the first companions as reformed priests because, just as the other clerk regulars, the companions were simply dressed, traveled on foot, carried books which indicated their education, their good conduct in general and also their works that brought consolation to the people.

Religious communities who identified themselves as "clerks regular" became active in Italy in the early sixteenth century. Clerk regulars were unlike the other existing religious orders. They are predominantly apostolic in their orientation, and serve the public in various capacities. And even though they share some similarities with the mendicant orders who are also apostolic, religious congregation of clerk regulars generally do not have unique and identifiable habits, show greater variations, even among themselves, on how to live the evangelical counsels and community life, and were also more active in sacramental work since they are primarily priestly orders.⁷⁰ Generally speaking, clerk regulars also gave less attention on traditional practices such as "fasting and abstinence," and the choral recitation of the Divine Office, usually associated with religious life, but instead promoted a "strong but flexible" spiritual life that entailed activities such as "mental prayers" and "spiritual reading," which gave them more latitude in

⁶⁸ Dalmases, *Ignatius of Loyola, Founder of the Jesuits*, 143; Lewis, "The First Jesuits as 'Reformed Priests," 123.

⁶⁹ Lewis, "The First Jesuits as 'Reformed Priests," 116.

⁷⁰ Ibid., 116, 118. A few other terms came to be associated with priests who led a simple and edifying life are: *honestus sacerdos* (honorable or honest priests) and *boni preti* (good priests).

attending to apostolic pursuits.⁷¹ In some instances, traditional practices were not altogether forgotten but adapted to meet the needs of the order. For example, the Theatines continued a strict adherence to the praying the Divine Office in choir. However, they introduced the creative adaption of chanting instead of singing the liturgy as a means to shorten the duration of the prayer.⁷² In this way, the spirit of the tradition proper to religious life was maintained while the form was adapted in order to accommodate the more demanding and hectic schedule of apostolic life.

Each of these new orders, perhaps shaped by their different spiritualities, also had their specific responses to the question of reform. For instance, the Theatines were particularly strict in terms of the personal conduct of their priests and their observances of evangelical poverty.⁷³ In contrast, the Barnabites were more moderate in the practice of austerity but expressed their priestly vocation through the great energy and creativity they shown in their various apostolic works, ministering to people from various backgrounds.⁷⁴ The Barnabites were effectively and radically living Jesus' edict of "loving thy neighbor."⁷⁵ In either case, the lives and works of these clerk regulars were to address the specific issues the Church faced during that era. An

⁷¹ Richard L. DeMolen, "Preface," in *Religious Orders of the Catholic Reformation: In Honor of John C. Olin on His Seventy-Fifth Birthday*, ed. Richard L. DeMolen (New York, NY: Fordham University Press, 1994), xv.

⁷² Kenneth J. Jorgensen, "The Theatines," in *Religious Orders of the Catholic Reformation: In Honor of John C. Olin on His Seventy-Fifth Birthday*, ed. Richard L. DeMolen (New York, NY: Fordham University Press, 1994), 10–11. Cardinal Gian Pietro Carafa, who later became Pope Paul IV, was one of the founders of the Theatines, placed great emphasis on communal activities, particularly the praying of the Office in choir.

⁷³ Ibid., 9–10. For the Theatines, poverty meant that all possession is held in common. They were also not allowed to beg for alms but only accept offerings freely given.

⁷⁴ Lewis, "The First Jesuits as 'Reformed Priests," 119.

⁷⁵ Richard L. DeMolen, "The First Centenary of the Barnabites (1533-1633)," in *Religious Orders of the Catholic Reformation: In Honor of John C. Olin on His Seventy-Fifth Birthday*, ed. Richard L. DeMolen (New York, NY: Fordham University Press, 1994), 60–61. The notions of "loving thy neighbor" and "serving others for the love of Christ" are rooted in the spirituality of Antonio Maria Zaccaria, the founder of the Clerk Regulars of St. Paul or the Barnabites.

edifying lifestyle among the clerk regulars would serve as an antidote to the pervasive culture of moral laxity and simony. Likewise, apostolic availability and fervor would serve the needs of the general populace who have been neglected by "absent" clergy.

Although Ignatius had already some notions of the lifestyle and ministries for the fellowship he gathered even while they were in Paris,⁷⁶ there is evidence that the new congregations of clerk regulars had also contributed to his understanding of the priesthood and religious life, and helped shape the future Society of Jesus.⁷⁷ Before they had an inkling of becoming a religious order of priest, and during their stay in Venice awaiting passage to the Holy Land, and their visits to Rome, the first companions had crossed paths with some of these "orders of reformed priests" active in Italy at that time. These encounters with the clerk regulars and the different and innovative ways they lived religious life and engaged in ministry might very well have influenced the companions' vision of their soon-to-be established religious institute. The companions must have been impressed by the apostolic zeal of these new orders as they also shared a similar outlook in their expression of Christian faith and discipleship. However, Ignatius also saw points of divergence. In a letter addressed to Cardinal Carafa, which was most likely unsent, the Basque criticized the Theatines for their preoccupation with evangelical perfection and their neglect of corporal works of mercy that minimized contact with the laity and would limit opportunities to foster conversion.⁷⁸

True to form, Ignatius adopted and adapted some of the characteristics of these orders of reformed priests that were aligned to his worldview, spirituality and ideas of how the priestly ministry should be exercised. Beyond the superficial aspects, the first companions also

⁷⁶ Saint Ignatius of Loyola and Gonçalves da Câmara, "Reminiscences," #85, 54.

⁷⁷ Lewis, "The First Jesuits as 'Reformed Priests," 112.

⁷⁸ Saint Ignatius of Loyola, "Blueprint for a Religious Order (Msgr Carafa, 1536)," in *Personal Writings: Reminiscences, Spiritual Diary, Select Letters Including the Text of The Spiritual Exercises*, trans. Philip Endean and Joseph A. Munitiz (London, UK: Penguin Books, 2004), #7, 143.

appropriated some of the practices of the other orders of clerk regulars for their new society. such as evaluating potential members by sending to work in hospitals.⁷⁹ However, the Jesuits were also clearly different from the other orders, especially in terms of the scope of their mission. The orders of clerk regulars, whom the first companions had encountered, were perhaps best described as "localized," as their activities were limited to only certain parts of Italy. In contrast, the first companions who had come from various parts of Europe had a geographically more expansive vision of their mission, even at the very beginning of the society. Jerome Nadal, an early Jesuit and among the confidants of Ignatius when the latter was superior general, had famously quipped, "We are not monks ... The world is our house."⁸⁰ Moreover, the Jesuits conceived themselves as men always on the move, a group of pilgrims and itinerant preachers. Thus, even though the Jesuits maintained the spirit of the practices long associated with the more established religious institute, they also adapted the forms of these practices to suit their way of life, even to a more radical degree than some of the other orders of clerk regulars. For instance, while the Theatines had simplified and shortened the praying of the Divine Office so that the community could continue to pray together, the Jesuits dispensed with the requirement of praying in choir altogether.⁸¹

Instituting a Priestly Order – Discerning and Responding to the Divine Will

Ignatius of Loyola, even after his conversion, did not begin with a clear intention of starting a religious order or become a priest. Inflamed by the love of Jesus, his initial plan was to emulate the great saints and perhaps to more or less work towards his own perfection, salvation, and even

⁷⁹ Lewis, "The First Jesuits as 'Reformed Priests," 118.

⁸⁰ Quoted in O'Malley, The First Jesuits, 68.

⁸¹ Society of Jesus, *Constitutions*, #586, 256.

his own glory.⁸² It was over a course of almost twenty years that he came to a gradual realization that his personal vocation was to found a new religious with companions. They put aside their own desire to serve the spiritual needs of those in the Holy Land, in order to serve the greater need of the Church and the world. For Ignatius, it was the Holy Spirit that guided him towards that turning point at *La Storta*, and it was God's grace that had finally revealed to him the roles that he and his companions would play in the divine plan. Yet, Ignatius would not deny that it was through the forces of history that the Lord had led his fellow pilgrims and himself in their journey of self-discovery.

Even at the very beginning of the society, the early companions were ready to "go anywhere and do anything, especially where the need is greatest."⁸³ Their mobility with respect to mission, including the exercise of their priesthood, may be attributed to the spirituality that they have appropriated from their spiritual and primary founder, Ignatius of Loyola. While "mobility" and "mission" are certainly important aspects Jesuits spirituality, there are certainly other important features of their spirituality that deserve consideration in their self-understanding of ministries and the exercise of the priesthood.

As previously mentioned, one such important feature is the notion of "discernment." The Basque saint had developed an incarnational spirituality that invites humanity to discern God's salvific actions throughout the created order and to participate in God's plan of redemption. Thus, there are many possible ways through which humankind can "praise, reverence and serve God."⁸⁴ Following Ignatius, the first companions lived a spirituality involving "discernment" and being responsive to the situation. Later generations of Jesuits would remain faithful to this *modus*

⁸² Saint Ignatius of Loyola and Gonçalves da Câmara, "Reminiscences," #9, 16.

⁸³ George W. Traub, "Do You Speak Ignatian? A Glossary of Terms Used in Ignatian and Jesuit Circles," in *A Jesuit Education Reader*, ed. George W. Traub (Chicago, IL: Loyola Press, 2008), 406.

⁸⁴ Saint Ignatius of Loyola, "Spiritual Exercises," #23, 289.

operandi, be committed to "reading the signs of the times and of interpreting them in the light of the Gospel"⁸⁵ and follow where light leads. But their critics claim that behind the hollow words of "discernment" and "responsive" belie the fact that Jesuits exploit any given situation for their own benefit. It is not "discernment" and "following the spirit" but simply crass opportunism. Ignatius and the first companions had seen it differently. They found their ability to carefully consider the situation, discern the movement of the Holy Spirit in it, and respond accordingly, an empowering feature of their vocation. Creative versatility is key in engaging a changing world. It is not the world that is demanding changes and adaptation but God beckoning through the changing world. In a way, for Ignatius and his fellow pilgrims, the act discernment and appropriate response, is a concrete manifestation of obedience to the divine will.

Therefore, to understand the nature of the Jesuit priesthood, one must also grasp of where God's spirit was "beckoning" Ignatius and the first companions leading up to their official formation in Rome. His mystical experience in *La Storta* was indeed an important turning point in the formation of the Society of Jesus. However, following Ignatius' advice on the discernment spirits, perhaps the fuller history of the first companions – beginning, middle and end – up to that point should be considered,⁸⁶ with the hope of uncovering consistent elements present throughout this period. One such element is the notion of divine intimacy. Ignatius' own spiritual experiences and journey were characterized by his growth in nearness to the Lord. The art of discernment, so central to the Ignatian spirituality, is grounded on one's familiarity with God. To

⁸⁵ Second Vatican Council, "Christus Dominus [Decree on the Pastoral Office of Bishops in the Church], October 28, 1965," in *Vatican Council II the Conciliar and Post Conciliar Documents*, ed. Austin Flannery, new rev. ed. (Collegeville, MN: Liturgical Press, 2014), #4, 905.

⁸⁶ Saint Ignatius of Loyola, "Spiritual Exercises," #333, 352. In rule 5 of the "Rules for discernment the spirits in the second week," Ignatius writes: "We must pay close attention to whole course of our thoughts: if the beginning, middle and end are entirely good, and tend towards what is wholly right, this is the sign of the good angel …"

be able to seek God's will, one needs to know God intimately.⁸⁷ In itself, Ignatius' experiences were nothing unique. The great saints and many holy people had similar experiences of being intimate with the divine. However, he was innovative in that he not only wished to attract likeminded individuals to share in his way of life but also desired that they also share in his spiritual experiences.⁸⁸ He wanted to help others to grow more intimate with God. The divine hand had not only directed him and his companions to a new way of life, but also beckoned them to "help the souls" of others.⁸⁹ Leading others through the spiritual exercises was a "systematic" way of achieving this end. Ignatius offered the exercises to those who soon become his companions and also a number of others whom he thought might find it helpful in the growing their relationship with God. However, he was also aware that not every person had the aptitude or disposition for the full exercises. Following his pragmatic and humanistic sensibilities, Ignatius and his men discovered, adapted and accepted alternative means of helping others grow in intimacy with God.

In contrast to the first companions' effort in helping others and themselves to develop a more intimate relationship with the divine, Christians living in the early modern age were experiencing disaffection with the Church and faith. While the Catholic Church wielded great amount of power in both the spiritual and secular realms in the early modern era, and exerted enormous influence over lives of the people, it had also neglected and alienated many. The scandalous lifestyles among many members of the clergy and the lack of effective care for the people, have led to much ill feelings towards the Church. There was clearly estrangement

⁸⁷ Society of Jesus, "The Official Directory of 1599," in *On Giving the Spiritual Exercises: The Early Jesuit Manuscript Directories and the Official Directory of 1599*, ed. Martin E. Palmer (St. Louis, MO: Institute of Jesuit Sources, 1996), #275, 347. There is a movement in the Spiritual Exercise towards union with God. According to the official directory of 1599 for giving the exercises, "the fourth week corresponds to the unitive way."

⁸⁸ O'Malley, *The First Jesuits*, 29.

⁸⁹ Ibid.

between the Church and the faithful, and by association, there was a sense of "distancing" between the people and God. Although Ignatius and the early Jesuits did not consider their primary mission was in remedying this dire situation, they were certainly aware of loss of the standing of the Church among the people and how that had also affected the faith life. The disaffection with the Church has led to schisms. As mentioned previously, even though the society was not founded to a response to the Protestant reform, it would not be too difficult to imagine that Ignatius and his companions would soon come to realize that indeed the Church and clergy needed to be reformed. For the "God's greater glory and for the salvation of souls," they were motivated to bring God into the hearts of the people, and likewise, to help restore the Church to their lives.

In the discussing the Jesuit priesthood, it is important to emphasize that even after the first companions had taken private vows at Montmartre,⁹⁰ there was hardly any indication that they considered the ministerial priesthood as part of their mission and identity. Among the ten first companions, only Faber, Jay and Broët were ordained priests when the reconvened in Italy to await passage to the Holy Land in 1537.⁹¹ It was only after their encounters with the Theatines, Somaschans and Barnabites, living and working with some of them,⁹² that the remaining companions requested ordination. Although there is no explicit historical record showing that the companions' interaction with these cleric regulars had led to their own desire to likewise receive ordination and become an order of religious priest, it is certainly not difficult to envisage the impact these experiences had on them. In the biography of St. Ignatius, Ribadeneira writes:

⁹⁰ Pedro de Ribadeneira, *The Life of Ignatius of Loyola*, trans. Claude Pavur (Saint Louis, MO: Institute of Jesuit Sources, 2014), #112, 79.

 ⁹¹ John Patrick Donnelly, *Ignatius of Loyola: Founder of the Jesuits* (New York, NY: Longman, 2004),
 50, 65. Only Faber was an ordained priest when the first seven companions took vows at Montmartre.
 ⁹² Lewis, "The First Jesuits as 'Reformed Priests," 116.

Since the time did not seem quite right yet to go to Rome [...] five of them interrupting everything else, went to the Hospital of SS. John and Paul, and the same number to the hospital known as the Incurables' to take care of the poor who were sick. Because they set themselves to the lowliest tasks with remarkable charity and care, as they did what they could to bring relief to those who were afflicted, they acquired high esteem for their goodness and holiness. They all displayed a glowing charity and a perfect victory over themselves, [...] Those fathers were at that time laying the foundations for the Society's probations.⁹³

Perhaps it was in these hospitals that the companions realized that their corporal works of mercy, such as tending to the sick and poor, served more than alleviation of bodily suffering. Like the reformed priests they lived and work with, the first companions' humility, dedication and holiness brought them admiration. In a letter to John of Avila years later, and quoting Cajetan the Dominican and Augustine of Hippo, Ignatius reminded the John, writing: "since reputation is necessary to us for the benefit of others ... [h]e who, confident of his innocence, disregards his reputation, is cruel, because he kills the souls of others."⁹⁴ If the feelings Ignatius intimated in this letter is a reflection of how he and his companions had felt during the intervening years, then it is possible they understood good works and conduct beget esteem and edification, and these would ultimately lead a conversion to God. Corporal works of mercy is also another channel to heal the heart and soul of the afflicted. Ignatius and his fellow pilgrims would have seen the examples of the Theatines, Somachans and Barnabites worthy of emulation since they draw people closer to God. Given their openness to learning and adopting new and effective ways minister, it is hardly surprising that the first companions would soon also consider becoming an order of reformed priests following the models of those whom they had met in Venice and other parts of Italy.⁹⁵

⁹³ Ribadeneira, *The Life of Ignatius of Loyola*, #126, 89.

⁹⁴ Saint Ignatius of Loyola, "To John of Avila (from Rome, January 24, 1549)," in *Letters of St. Ignatius of Loyola*, trans. William J. Young (Chicago, IL: Loyola University Press, 1959), 184.

⁹⁵ Lewis, "The First Jesuits as 'Reformed Priests," 116.

However, even if the first companions grasped the advantages of becoming a religious order engaged in apostolic ministries, this did not necessarily offer a clear indication of why they also wanted to be ordained to the ministerial priesthood. Obviously, the life and works of the reformed priests had inspired them and fueled their own apostolic imagination. But were there any more compelling reasons? There are possibly three reasons. First, they might have noted that working as ordained ministers gave them an expanded degree of official sanction by the ecclesial authority to perform public ministry. During his sojourning years, Ignatius had been repeatedly hauled before the ecclesial tribunals as he did not have the warrant to minister in public and was suspected of being a heretic.⁹⁶ These experiences would have certainly made Ignatius and his companions consider possible ways of perhaps minimizing or avoiding the risk of falling under the suspicion of being unorthodox. In a way, ordination would serve as a commission for public ministry and perhaps offer them added protection from persecution by the local Church authority.⁹⁷

Second, Ignatius and his men perhaps understood that by receiving ordination they could offer more services to the people. They could minister the sacraments reserved only for the ordained ministers of the Church. As previously mentioned, many communities during Ignatius' time were not adequately served due to absentee priests. The neglected people are those who had the most pastoral and spiritual needs that could only be met by the priests with the faculties to minister the sacraments. It is therefore, conceivable that from this perspective, the first companions saw that as ordained clergy, they could assist in addressing this issue and serving the

⁹⁶ O'Malley, *The First Jesuits*, 27–28, 33. Ignatius and also his associates were suspected of being *alumbrados* and had to defend themselves from such accusations in Barcelona, Salamanca and even in Venice.

⁹⁷ J. William Harmless, "Jesuits as Priests: Crisis and Charism," *Studies in the spirituality of Jesuits* 19, no. 3 (1987): 37. Harmless opines that ordination for the early companions served as a "union card" so that they could gain easy access to and minister in public.

unmet needs of the people. "Administering the sacraments" was not listed as a work of the society in the original 1540 *Formula the of Institute* but only appear in the 1550 formula.⁹⁸ This may be an indication that the first companions, during their deliberations in forming the society, did not consider sacramental ministries and therefore the priesthood as essential to their soon to be founded religious order. Thus, it suggests that ordained ministries and priesthood only became a central characteristic of the Jesuits during the years leading up to 1550 and the issuance of the second formula. However, there is evidence that the first companions started hearing confessions soon after they were ordained, which was prior to their decision to officially form the society.⁹⁹ Moreover, the sacrament of reconciliation had figured prominently in Ignatius' own spiritual journey,¹⁰⁰ and therefore he must have understood its importance and the importance of ordained ministries in their work of "helping souls." Despite the absence of references to sacramental ministries in the 1540 formula, they were not altogether missing in the apostolic plans of the first companions and the early Jesuits.¹⁰¹

Third, the first companions might have perceived that reformed priests, as ordained ministers, were considered by the public as the official "face" or representatives of the institutional Church. Their public conduct and actions had bearing on how people they interacted with would not only come to perceive them as clergy, but also the state of the Church on the whole. Just as poorly trained and slothful priests, living questionable lifestyles would bring disrepute to the Church, scandalize and alienate the people, virtuous and hardworking priests would not only contribute to the Church's mission but also assist in restoration of the Church's

⁹⁸ Society of Jesus, "Formulas of the Institute," #1, 4.

⁹⁹ Ribadeneira, *The Life of Ignatius of Loyola*, #137, 96.

¹⁰⁰ This is reflected in the Spiritual Exercises in which Ignatius encourages the retreatant to confess weekly and if possible, receive communion with the same regularity. See Saint Ignatius of Loyola, "Spiritual Exercises," #18, 287.

¹⁰¹ O'Malley, *The First Jesuits*, 134. O'Malley notes that sacramental confession and the ministering of communion were implicit in the ministries listed in the "Five Chapters."

image and re-establishing good relationship between the people and the Church. This was especially crucial given the challenges the institutional Church was facing with the loss authority and the rise of Protestantism.

Historical forces, such as great social changes in the fifteenth and sixteenth centuries, and Ignatius' personal spiritual experiences and interactions with others, have been vital to the founding of the Society of Jesus, not only as a religious institute but also a priestly order. The "humanism-infused" spirituality, embraced and advocated by Ignatius, imbued in him and his companions the receptiveness to learn from their experiences, the flexibility to adapt to different situations and the freedom to adopt ideas and practices they deemed helpful for their mission. Their encounter with the cleric regulars in Italy had possibly contributed to their decision to first receive ordination and then becoming a religious order. They had seen the positive impact that these reformed priests had on the communities in Venice and elsewhere in Italy. The effectiveness of these priests, living and ministering in innovative ways, might have motivated the first companions to model themselves after these reformed priests.

While it seems that Ignatius and his followers readily accepted ordination due to practical reasons, in their minds, it was certainly more than these reasons that had spurred them to receive holy orders. As previously noted, the "Principle and Foundation" of the *Spiritual Exercises* clearly states that all created things are meant to be used in the service of the Divine Majesty. This is certainly not an admission that the priesthood for Ignatius and the Jesuits only has instrumental value and nothing more. The ideas of vocation, discerning God's will and abiding by it are integral elements of the *Spiritual Exercises*.¹⁰² Thus, even the decision for the first companions to accept holy orders may seem to have been merely an opportunistic move. As

 $^{^{102}}$ Saint Ignatius of Loyola, "The Spiritual Exercises," #169-#189, 316-320. Ignatius gives treatment to the notions of vocation, procedures on "making an election" at the end of the "second week" of the *Exercises*.

proponents of an incarnational spirituality, they had most likely believed that God's hand had beckoned them to become priests in order to fulfill the divine plan and participate in Christ's mission of salvation. For Ignatius and his band of pilgrims, the divine hand had indeed guided them through their own spiritual experiences, the many people they encountered and the historical forces that had shaped the world that they lived in, and ultimately led them to place themselves at the service of the Church through Holy Father and officially formed themselves into an order of religious priests.

CHAPTER III IDENTITY

The history of the formation of the society, as discussed in the previous chapter, suggests that ordained ministry, in itself, could have been merely an after thought among the founding fathers. Only a minority of the first companions had received Holy Orders. It was after arriving in Italy that the remainder of them entertained the idea of becoming priest. Historical evidence might suggest that Ignatius and his companions became priests due to the positive impact that the new orders clerk regulars had on them during their sojourn in Italy. Another possible explanation was that they could not refused Pope Paul III's offer of Holy Orders. The companions from the University of Paris had impressed the Holy Father with their erudition, so much so that the Pope not only presented them with his blessings and money for their passage to Jerusalem, but also granted them permission to be ordained.¹⁰³ Therefore, the seven remaining companions had entered the priesthood based purely on "human reasons." But for Ignatius and his men who subscribed to an incarnational spirituality, God's will was gradually revealed through these events and encounters. While some may consider them as opportunists who had received Holy Orders out of expediency, they perceived these historical episodes as God's providential promptings. They accepted ordination and founded an order of religious priests because they believed that they were following the divine will.

However, even if the first companions believed that it was God's purpose that the future Society of Jesus should be founded as a clerical order, there is still the question of how the priesthood is related to the Jesuit vocation. Like men of other religious institutes with ordained members, many Jesuits effectively have "dual vocations" – a religious vocation and a priestly

¹⁰³ Saint Ignatius of Loyola and Gonçalves da Câmara, "Reminiscences," #93, 59; Ribadeneira, *The Life of Ignatius of Loyola*, #129, 90.

calling. Therefore, the pertinent issue is how one is related to the other. Is there one that is primary and essential to the identity of the Jesuit, and the other secondary and perhaps even instrumental in serving the mission? How do Jesuits, especially ordained members of the society, consider the priesthood in relation to charism and ministry? In short, how does one understand the Jesuit vocation as priest and religious in an integrative manner? These are some of the questions considered in this chapter. Perhaps in addressing these questions, characteristics integral to the Jesuit priestly vocation will also be brought forth and discussed.

These questions will be given treatment from three points of departure. First, the question of priesthood is revisited from the perspective of Jesuit self-understanding by examining official documents of the society and also writings of the some of the early members. Although the Jesuits were strictly not founded as a response to the Reformation, they follow in the traditions of the *preti reformati* and understandably would offer a unique understanding of the priesthood. There is also the question of lay brothers within the society. If indeed the congregation considers itself primarily as an order of priests, then how do Jesuit brothers contribute to this identity?

Second, the priesthood is investigated from the perspective of Jesuit ministries. Members of the society have traditionally engaged in a wide variety of ministries, some of which would not be considered "priestly." Historically speaking, there has always been a strong association of the ministerial priesthood with the administrations of the sacraments. The Second Vatican Council has broadened the understanding of priestly ministries through the introduction of the "threefold office" of the priesthood that encompasses other categories of ministries. While Second Vatican Council has broadened the scope of priestly ministries, there is still a strong association of the ministerial priesthood with sacramental works.

37

Third, the Jesuit priestly identity is considered from the perspective of the society's religious identity, particularly from the point of view of the evangelical counsels. This is done in the hope of reflecting on the relationship between the two crucial aspects of Jesuit life, and to investigate how they inform each other.

A Sacerdotal Society?

Responding to the special "Year for Priests" as promulgated by Pope Benedict XVI in 2009, Adolfo Nicolás, the thirtieth Jesuit general wrote to all major superiors of the society imploring them encourage all members to a deeper reflection on their vocation as religious and ordained ministers. In that letter he writes: "For us Jesuits, this year is a God-given opportunity to reflect more deeply on [...] our **understanding of the Society of Jesus as a 'sacerdotal Society**," (*GC 32, 'Jesuits Today,' No. 22 [sic]*): In what sense is the ordained priesthood 'an essential characteristic of the Society,' as Pope Paul VI reminded us in his Allocution to General Congregation 32?"¹⁰⁴ While Nicolás' letter clearly affirms the centrality the priesthood in regards to the Society of Jesus, the fact that he calls for deliberation on the matter also suggests that Jesuits, perhaps, might have a particular understanding of ordained priesthood in the context of their unique vocation as Jesuits.

It is interesting that the Jesuit leadership, echoing Paul VI, use of the term "sacerdotal Society" to describe their institute. The word "sacerdotal" is usually used synonymously with the priesthood. Indeed, the Jesuits have affirmed the centrality of the ministerial priesthood and their identity. The Thirty-Fourth General Congregation decreed: "At the time of the founding and throughout its history, the exercise of ministerial priesthood has been regarded as central to the

¹⁰⁴ Adolfo Nicolás, "Invitation to Reflect on Priesthood in the Society of Jesus," June 19, 2009. There is an error in the original letter. The reference should read "*No. 32*" instead of "*No. 22*," as only the former annotation mentions the term "sacerdotal Society."

Society's identity and apostolic mission."¹⁰⁵ Yet, the priesthood and ordained ministry are mentioned sparingly or only indirectly in the Formula and the Constitutions. Moreover, beside priests and scholastics in training for the purpose of seeking Holy Orders, there are also lay brothers or temporal coadjutors in the society. Would the membership of lay brothers argue against the assertion that the society is a priestly order? The limited references to the priesthood in the society's foundational documents and the presence of temporal coadjutors may indicate that ordained ministry, though part of life in the Society of Jesus, cannot be considered as essential element of its identity. However, as noted in the chapter two, all founding members of the society had already received the sacrament of orders prior to the officially institution of their order. Regarding this point, Pope Paul VI, in his address to the thirty-second general congregation, mentions: "Priesthood was formally required by the Founder for all professed religious, and this with good reason, because the priesthood is necessary for the Order he instituted with the special purpose of the sanctification of men through the Word and he sacraments."¹⁰⁶ Even if it is true that Ignatius and his companions considered priesthood purely as functional or instrumental, it still does not negate the fact that the society was founded as an order of priests and emphasizes the centrality of ordained ministry in the society. In other words, the priesthood is a necessity to serve the greater Jesuit mission. This assertion is further supported by the fact that unlike other religious orders, a person, other than a temporal coadjutor,

¹⁰⁵ Society of Jesus, "Decrees of the 34th General Congregation," in *Jesuit Life & Mission Today: The Decrees and Accompanying Documents of the 31st-35th General Congregations of the Society of Jesus*, ed. John W. Padberg (St. Louis, MO: Institute of Jesuit Sources, 2009), Decree 6, #8, 560.

¹⁰⁶ Pope Paul VI, "Address of Pope Paul VI to the Members of the 32nd General Congregation (December 3, 1974)," in *Jesuit Life & Mission Today: The Decrees and Accompanying Documents of the 31st-35th General Congregations of the Society of Jesus*, ed. John W. Padberg (St. Louis, MO: Institute of Jesuit Sources, 2009), 383.

must have been ordained a priest before his final incorporation into the Society of Jesus.¹⁰⁷ Therefore, these reasons support the position that the ministerial priesthood and Jesuit identity are inextricably related. Jesuit historian, John O'Malley also opines that the scarcity of references to the priesthood in the documents of the early society is that the founding Jesuits had "taken it for granted."¹⁰⁸ His opinion is perhaps supported by probably the single reference to priesthood in the revised and expanded Formula of 1550, in which Ignatius states: "Since all members should be priests, they should be obliged to recite the Divine Office [...] but privately and not in common or choir."¹⁰⁹ Ignatius' tone is casual and almost "matter-of-fact" in affirming that all Jesuits "should be priests." Moreover, as mentioned in the previous chapter, it is likely that early companions believed that they were simply following the divine will by receiving ordination and forming an order of priests. In regards to the question of lay brothers in the society, Jesuits understand them as members who "complement and contribute to the apostolic mission of the whole society,"¹¹⁰ and since the ordained ministry is vital to the character of the order, temporal coadjutors, through their efforts thus share in the common priestly mission of the society.

The term "sacerdotal," however, is also understood as a more specific expression of ordained ministry. Etymologically, "sacerdotal" is derived from the Latin "*sacerdos*," and its Greek equivalent "*hierus*." These latter terms denote someone who is "chosen and consecrated,"

 ¹⁰⁷ Michael J Buckley, "'Likewise You Are Priests...': Some Reflections on Jesuit Priesthood," in *Spirit Style Story: Essays Honoring John W Padberg, SJ* (Chicago: Loyola Pr, 2002), 18.
 ¹⁰⁸ O'Malley, *The First Jesuits*, 157.

¹⁰⁹ Society of Jesus, "The Formula of the Institute of the Society of Jesus," in *The Constitutions of the Society of Jesus and Their Complementary Norms: A Complete English Translation of the Official Latin Texts.*, ed. John W. Padberg (St. Louis, MO: Institute of Jesuit Sources, 1996), #8, 12.

¹¹⁰ Society of Jesus, "General Congregation 34," Decree 7, #3, 571.

and "set apart."¹¹¹ Thus, for some people, the sacerdotal priesthood is generally associated with an ordained ministry that is almost exclusively cultic in character. It follows an "Old Testament" understanding of the priesthood that considers a priest as one who is "consecrated" and made holy so that he is ritualistic pure and worthy to offer expiatory sacrifices. Priests were not only seen as ministers of the sacred rites, but were themselves considered sacred. In other words, there was a process of "sacralization" of the priesthood.¹¹² Another effect of such a characterization of the priesthood is the "distancing" between the ordained clergy and the other members of the Church since the former is "set apart." Over the course of the history of the Church, this separation gradually became more pronounced with its institutionalization. European history had unfolded in such a way that the Catholic Church became an institution that wielded considerable influence. Church leadership also gradually became synonymous with the priesthood. They were set apart from the general populace even outside of liturgy. Bishops and priests were not only spiritual leaders and ministers of the worship, but exercised temporal powers. Ecclesial leaders, beginning with Christianity becoming the main religion of the Roman Empire, have gradually surrendered their simpler lifestyle and ways of worship, and adopted the pomp and juridical authority associated with state officials.¹¹³ They were afforded honor and privileges inaccessible to regular people. Thus, they have become the ruling elites of society. Through the hierarchical segregation of the ordained from the people, and the dominant power and authority vested in the clergy, the priesthood effectively became clericalized.

¹¹¹ Kenan B. Osborne, *Priesthood: A History of Ordained Ministry in the Roman Catholic Church* (New York, NY: Paulist Press, 1989), 148.

¹¹² Ibid., 149–150. Osborne suggests that the process of "sacralization" of the priesthood began as early as the fourth century. Chrysostom considered priests to be spiritually more esteemed than angels. Due to the popularity of his work and his reputation, Chrysostom's "theology and spirituality" of the priesthood remained influential in the Church.

¹¹³ Justo L. Gonzalez, *The Story of Christianity, Vol. 2: The Reformation to the Present Day*, 2nd edition. (New York: HarperOne, 2010), 143.

Over the course of her history, the Catholic Church has accepted a theology of the priesthood, based on sacramental theology, which also reflects the clericalized and sacralized states of ordained ministers. One of the key elements of this theology is that the priesthood is not merely functional or simply an ecclesial office but an ontological category. By virtue of the grace given to a person through the sacrament of ordination, he receives an "indelible character mark" and becomes a priest in essence cannot be revoked.¹¹⁴ Having received the sacrament of orders not only sets the priest apart from others but also confers onto him with certain powers that are not available to others. In the *Summa Contra Gentiles*, Thomas Aquinas writes:

This spiritual power from Christ, then, flows into the ministers of the Church; the spiritual effects on us, of course, derived from Christ, are fulfilled under certain sensible signs, [...] Now, the power of orders is established for the dispensation of the sacraments. But among the sacraments that which is most noble and tends most to complete the others is the sacrament of the Eucharist as is clear from what has been said. Therefore, the power of orders must be weighed chiefly by reference to this sacrament, for "everything is denominated from its end."¹¹⁵

Therefore, according to the theology of Thomas, the ordained ministry is associated with the ministration of the sacraments. While his statement does not deny that "spiritual power" and sanctifying grace originates from Christ, it asserts the crucial role of the ordained minister in the economy of salvation – the priest is empowered by Christ and delegated authority to convey these graces through the sacraments. Moreover, for Thomas Aquinas, the priesthood is essentially associated with the Eucharist, which he considers the primary sacrament. The understanding of priesthood as "power," and tying it almost exclusively to the sacrament of the Eucharist, are not only the theological perspectives of Thomas Aquinas, but also the commonly

¹¹⁴ Thomas Aquinas, *Summa Theologiae*, trans. Fathers of the English Dominican Province, Benzinger Bros. (Online)., 1947, 3.63.5, http://dhspriory.org/thomas/english/summa/index.html.

¹¹⁵ Thomas Aquinas, *Summa Contra Gentiles, Book IV*, trans. Charles J. O'Neil (Notre Dame, IN: Univ. of Notre Dame Press, 1975), Ch. 74, #4-6.

accepted views among medieval scholastic theologians, and continued to be held by the Church until the Second Vatican Council.¹¹⁶

Even though it is clear that Thomas Aquinas contends that the priest is only authorized and empowered by the Church to act as a minister of the sacraments, there has been a tendency, at least for some people, to perceive him as a "substitute for Christ," due to strong connection of the priesthood and the Eucharistic sacrifice, asserted by the Thomas' theology. Terminologies such as *alter Christus* (another Christ),¹¹⁷ *in persona Christi* (in the person of Christ)¹¹⁸ and *in persona Christi capitis* (in the person of Christ the head),¹¹⁹ found in the utterances and documents from the Church hierarchy, even in recent years, indicate that the some quarters in the Church continue to maintain and perpetuate a theology that runs the risk of conflating the roles of the minister of the sacraments with Jesus, the originator of the sacraments and the source of grace. Moreover, such a theology maintains a clericalized and sacralized understanding of the priesthood.

A church environment that promotes and sustains clericalism, an ecclesiology that segregates the ordained from the laity, and a theology that justifies the sacredness of the clergy, encourage an atmosphere of egotism, misuse and abuse of authority by members of the Church hierarchy, and foster careerism among members of the Church hierarchy. The Protestant Reformation was, in some ways, a response to the self-serving excesses and the abuse of

¹¹⁶ Osborne, Priesthood, 208.

¹¹⁷ Pope Benedict XVI, "General Audience" (Speech, St. Peter Square, June 24, 2009),

http://w2.vatican.va/content/benedict-xvi/en/audiences/2009/documents/hf_ben-xvi_aud_20090624.html. ¹¹⁸ Second Vatican Council, "Perfectae Caritatis," #10, 361. "The ministerial priest, by the sacred power that he has, forms and rules the priestly people; in the person of Christ he effects the eucharistic sacrifice and offers it to God in the name of all people. But the priests, we call them, are ministers chosen from among us, who do all they do in our name."

¹¹⁹ Catholic Church, *Catechism of the Catholic Church*, #1548, 346. The use of "*In Persona Capitis*" distinguishes the ordained priesthood from the common priesthood of the laity, who rightly make up the "Body of Christ." By virtue of their sacerdotal consecration, the ordained act in the person of Christ who is the "Head of his Body."

authority, nurtured by such an environment that had been growing since the Middle Ages. Even though Martin Luther recognized the distinction of roles between the ordained ministers and the laity, he nonetheless proposed and advocated a theology of the common priesthood, possibly to oppose the monopoly of power held by the ordained, a clear response to the growing disaffection to the state of Church and the prevalent abuses, and a call for a return to a more egalitarian Church.¹²⁰ Although the Catholic Church addressed certain issues associated with clerical abuses and the exploitations of ecclesial offices for personal gains, the issue of clericalism and sacralization of the priesthood remained. The Council of Trent decreed:

In conformity with God's decree, sacrifice and priesthood are so related that both exist in every law ... Sacred Scripture makes it clear and the tradition of the Catholic Church has always taught that this priesthood was instituted by the same Lord, our Savior, and that the power of consecrating, offering, and administering his body and blood, and likewise the power of remitting and of retaining sins, was given to the apostles and to their successors in the priesthood.¹²¹

The Tridentine Council effectively maintained the accepted scholastic notion of the priesthood in which it is strongly linked to the Eucharistic sacrifice and the sacrament of penance. Instead of engaging in a self re-examination of the then established theology of the priesthood, the council decided to remain entrenched in it as a response to the challenges posed by the reformers.

Even though the Society of Jesus was founded about the same time as the Protestant

Reformation and the Council of Trent, the Jesuits approached the issues related to the

¹²⁰ Kenan B. Osborne, *Priesthood: A History of Ordained Ministry in the Roman Catholic Church* (New York: Paulist Press, 1989), 223. Luther writes: "We are all priests, as many of us are Christians." The Second Vatican Council also offers a theology of the common priesthood of the laity in "Lumen Gentium" #10, stating: "Christ the Lord, high priest taken from among men, made the new people "a kingdom of priests to God, his Father." The baptized, by regeneration and the anointing of the Holy Spirit, are consecrated to be a spiritual house and a holy priesthood, that through all the works of Christian men they may offer spiritual sacrifices and proclaim the perfection of him who has called them out of darkness into his marvelous light. Therefore all the disciples of Christ, persevering in prayer and praising God, should present themselves as a sacrifice, living, holy and pleasing to God. They should everywhere on earth bear witness to Christ and give an answer to everyone who asks a reason for the hope of an eternal life which is theirs."

¹²¹Quoted in Ibid., 253.

clericalization of the priesthood differently. As discussed in chapter two, Ignatius of Loyola had personally witnessed and experienced the corruption and abuse of power prevalent among members of the Church hierarchy and how these elements had alienated the people. This would have been certainly a source of motivation for Ignatius and the Jesuits to improve the clerical culture and the relationship between the Church and those who were estranged. After all, many considered them as "reformed priests." However, unlike the radical reformers, the Jesuits were always careful to work under the authority of the Church. They have declared their loyalty to the hierarchy and orthodoxy is found in the Formula of the Institute, stating that members of the society "serve the Lord alone and the Church, his spouse, under the Roman pontiff, the vicar of Christ on earth."¹²² Another indication of the Jesuits' fidelity to the Church and faith is found in their foundational spirituality. The "Rules for Thinking with the Church," appended to the Spiritual Exercises, categorically demands fealty of Christians to the Church.¹²³ Furthermore, in the same document, Ignatius urges the faithful not to be openly critical of the Church authority despite acknowledging their shortcomings, but rather to privately counsel them so as to address the issues.¹²⁴ Following the spirit of the founding companions, the early Jesuits were also "renaissance men," well-versed in the classical studies, and also intellectually curious enough to be opened to new horizons of knowledge. Their receptiveness to new ideas and possibly their innovative approach to religious had brought the Society of Jesus unwelcomed scrutiny by the hierarchy and theologians, suspicious of their orthodoxy.¹²⁵ There might have been concerns that

¹²² Society of Jesus, "The Formula of the Institute of the Society of Jesus," #1, 3.

¹²³ Saint Ignatius of Loyola, "Spiritual Exercises," #352-3, 356. Fidelity and obedience to the ecclesial authority could not be made clearer than by Ignatius of Loyola calling for "the laying aside all our own judgements" and being "ready to obey the true bride of Christ Our Lord, our holy mother, the hierarchical Church."

¹²⁴ Ibid., #362, 357.

¹²⁵ O'Malley, *The First Jesuits*, 294–295. There were possibly political motives for suspecting the early Jesuits for being unorthodoxy or even teaching heresy. Many of them were "new Christians" or

their progressive outlook would lead them to publicly deny accepted Church teachings and theology. However, the Jesuits affirm their orthodoxy in the Constitutions by stating: "In theology there should be lectures on the Old and New Testaments and on the scholastic doctrine of St. Thomas."¹²⁶ This adherence to scholastic theology, such as the teachings of Thomas Aquinas and Bonaventure, is also found in the appendix of the Spiritual Exercises.¹²⁷ While the early Jesuits were men of the renaissance, they were also citizens of a Europe coming towards the end of the middle ages and therefore inherited many ideas from that period. Even though they exercised their priesthood creatively and differently, they continued to subscribe to the "medieval idea" that the sacramental priesthood is necessary for the celebration Mass and the "confection of the Eucharist."¹²⁸ Therefore, these show that while Ignatius and the early Jesuits might have agreed with the radical reformers and the Protestants that the clericalized ecclesial environment was causing disaffection among the people, they would not, like them, overtly challenge and repudiate the scholastic theology that sustained this culture. The demand of an almost unreserved submission to the will of the Church must have been a clear expression of humility. Despite the fact that they were well-educated and intelligent individuals, and may even have questions pertaining to the state of affairs within the institutional Church, they humbly submit themselves to the Church authority. Their loyalty was put to the test, and one which they passed, in their docile acceptance of the universal suppression of the order between 1773 and

conversos, whose families had converted from Judaism. The anti-Semitic sentiment in some parts of Europe had probably fueled the persecution of the Jesuits.

¹²⁶ Society of Jesus, *Constitutions*, #464, 182; Society of Jesus, "Decrees of the 31st General Congregation," in *Jesuit Life & Mission Today: The Decrees and Accompanying Documents of the 31st-35th General Congregations of the Society of Jesus*, ed. John W. Padberg (St. Louis, MO: Institute of Jesuit Sources, 2009), Decree 9, #44, 88. The importance of scholastic theology in Jesuit formation has been reaffirmed in recent years as shown in GC 31, Decree 9.

¹²⁷ Saint Ignatius of Loyola, "Spiritual Exercises," #363, 357.

¹²⁸ O'Malley, The First Jesuits, 157.

1814.¹²⁹ More recently, the society showed their obedience to the Church by accepting Pope John Paul II's representative to oversee the order when the then superior general, Pedro Arrupe, was incapacitated, even though the pope had acted contrary to tradition.¹³⁰

The early members of the society were attempting to reform the Church culture, heal the wounds of estrangement and win the people back through more subtle and gradual ways. They perceived the issues surrounding the Protestant Reformation as pastoral problems rather than doctrinal disputes.¹³¹ Living up to their moniker as "reformed priests," one approach was through edification by their proper conduct, dedication to their ministries and sincere care for the people. Perhaps to counter the clerical culture of their time, characterized by the pursuit of status and power, the newly founded Jesuit order vehemently emphasized the need for their men to abhor these trappings. The *Constitutions* states:

It will also be of the highest importance toward perpetuating the Society's well-being to use great diligence in precluding from it ambition, the mother of all evils in any community or congregation. This will be accomplished by closing the door against seeking, directly or indirectly, any dignity or prelacy within the Society [...] The professed should similarly promise to God our Lord not to seek any prelacy or dignity outside the Society and, as far as in them lies, not to consent to being chosen for a similar charge [...] Each one should desire to serve souls in conformity with our profession of humility and lowliness, and to avoid having the Society deprived of the men who are necessary for its purpose.¹³²

Living out the virtue of "humility" is certainly not a special dictate placed exclusively on the Jesuits. While members of other religious orders and clerics are expected to embrace this positive quality, the society has stressed the importance of this demand, so much so that their members are strictly prohibited to aspire for higher office, within and beyond the society. Jesuit despise of "ambition" is further emphasized by the fact that other than professing the vow

¹²⁹ William A. Barry and Robert G. Doherty, *Contemplatives in Action: The Jesuit Way* (New York, NY: Paulist Press, 2002), 55.

¹³⁰ Ibid., 59.

¹³¹ O'Malley, *The First Jesuits*, 16.

¹³² Society of Jesus, Constitutions, #817, 403-404.

formula, candidates admitted to final vows are also expected to further pronounce the "five simple vows" which includes a similar strong rejection of any "dignity and prelacy."¹³³ On the one hand, the "lowliness" and "humility" are expressions of discipleship and means of attaining Christian perfection. Ignatius of Loyola asserts that be able to live "perfect humility" is to become intimate with Christ and to imitate him.¹³⁴ His strong view on humility is better understood from the perspective of the Spiritual Exercises. In the Exercises, Ignatius considers "riches, honor, and pride," as "snares laid by Satan" to enslave people and lead them astray.¹³⁵ Thus, the practice of humility is therefore not only a way of perfecting oneself but also defense against the temptations of the world. On the other hand, the society also considers that living in humility and declining the honor of high office serve an apostolic purpose. When he was the superior general, Ignatius was noted to have been particularly strict with his men, including priests, who lacked humility, and he would readily discipline or even dismiss them from the society, even though they were considered talented and devout.¹³⁶ In his letter to King Ferdinand I, explaining his reasons for declining the king's offer of bishoprics to Jesuits, Ignatius highlights the fact that episcopal dignities and benefices would curtail their mobility, hinder their effort to go to places with the greatest need, and limit their freedom in acting according to God's plan.¹³⁷ It is clear that holding these offices is detrimental to the missionary effort of the society and goes against the spirit in which it is founded. In that same letter to Ferdinand, Ignatius writes:

 ¹³³ Ibid., Comp. Norm 134, 207. Those admitted to final profession not only renounce any desires for higher office but are also obligated to report to the Society those who hold such aspirations.
 ¹³⁴ Saint Ignatius of Loyola, "Spiritual Exercises," #167, 315.

¹³⁵ Ibid., #142, 311.

¹³⁶ See examples reported in Luis Gonçalves da Câmara, *Remembering Iñigo: Glimpses of the Life of Saint Lgnatius Loyola / The Memoriale of Luis Gonçalves Da Câmara*, trans. Alexander Eaglestone and Joseph A. Munitiz (St. Louis, MO: Institute of Jesuit Sources, 2004), #50, 33-34; #63, 42-43.

¹³⁷ Saint Ignatius of Loyola, "Refusing Episcopal Dignity (Ferdinand I, 1546)," in *Personal Writings: Reminiscences, Spiritual Diary, Select Letters Including the Text of The Spiritual Exercises*, trans. Philip Endean and Joseph A. Munitiz (London, UK: Penguin Books, 2004), 168–169.

We would provide much ammunition for widespread gossip and criticism, scandalizing many people, people for whom Christ Our Lord died on a cross. Already when any of us go into the palaces of the Pope, of princes, of cardinals or of nobles, so corrupt has the world become that people think we are being ambitious. If we now accepted a bishopric, it could very easily set off talk and gossip that would cause offence to God Our Lord.¹³⁸

In Ignatius' opinion, by accepting ecclesial honors and benefices, Jesuits would run the risk of causing scandal, cast aspersion on themselves, alienate people and ultimately undo the spiritual progress of the many people they have helped. On the contrary, a priesthood that lives out the virtue of humility would edify others, promote good relationship between the people and the Church and help people grow in the spiritual lives. Jesuits embrace the virtue of humility not only as a way to self-perfection but also to serve as an apostolic end of edifying others and drawing them deeper into the faith. Luis Gonçalves da Câmara, the writer of the *Autobiography of St. Ignatius*, also noted that according to the first superior general of the society, the Jesuit "vocation was to help souls by way of humility."¹³⁹ The priesthood, thus, has always been central to the Jesuit vocation since the inception of the society, however, the early Jesuits were also aware of the detrimental effects of ambition among some priests and they were deliberate in attempting to stymie any traces of elitism and desire for clerical power in their order.

The fact that the Jesuit *Constitutions* explicitly forbids any of its members seeking high ecclesial offices is also a clear indication that members of the Society of Jesus consider themselves constituting priestly order. As these positions are reserved for clerics, the unqualified prohibition against any members of the society of even having ambition to such offices suggests that ordained membership within the society is normative since its inception. Thus, Jesuits consider themselves belonging to a priestly order since its members are generally ordained ministers of the Church.

¹³⁸ Ibid., 170.

¹³⁹ Gonçalves da Câmara, *Remembering Iñigo*, #368, 206.

The very first sentence of the first paragraph in the first chapter of the Constitutions reads: "This least congregation, which at its earliest foundation was named the Society of Jesus by the Holy See, was first approved by Pope Paul II, of happy memory, in the year 1540,"¹⁴⁰ Other than presenting a brief introduction of the origin of the Jesuit order, it may also provide a clue of how the Jesuits perceived themselves, or hope to become. Ignatius, the official author of the Constitutions, uses the term "the least congregation" to describe the Society of Jesus. This description perhaps contrasts directly with the particular meaning of the "sacerdotal society," one which might conjure up an image of an elite group of men, elevated above the fray of the profane world. However, from the discussion thus far, it appears that Ignatius' characterization of the society, as the "least congregation" is much more appropriate. The virtue of humility is not only one of the fundamental elements of Ignatian spirituality but also strongly emphasized in the Jesuit life and mission. Jesuits express their humility through their expected loyalty to the ecclesial hierarchy and great deference to the teachings and authority of the Church. Recently, Pope Benedict XVI reminded Peter-Hans Kolvenbach, the twenty-ninth Superior General, of the society's "peculiar fidelity to the magisterium of the Church and the Successor of Peter 'perinde ac cadaver',"¹⁴¹ highlighting the tradition of Jesuit utmost dedication and deference to the proper ecclesial authority. Jesuits at the Thirty-Second General Congregation affirm the importance of humility manifested concretely through solidarity with the poor, living with them and working for them. The congregation writes: "Through such humble service, we will have the opportunity to help them find, at the heart of their problems and their problems and their struggles, Jesus

¹⁴⁰ Society of Jesus, *Constitutions*, #1, 23.

¹⁴¹ Pope Benedict XVI, "Letter of Pope Benedict XVI to Father General Peter-Hans Kolvenbach, SJ (January 19, 2008)," in *Jesuit Life & Mission Today: The Decrees and Accompanying Documents of the 31st-35th General Congregations of the Society of Jesus*, ed. John W. Padberg (St. Louis, MO: Institute of Jesuit Sources, 2009), 811. The phrase "*perinde ac cadaver*," translated as "as if it were a lifeless body," is originally written in #547 of the *Constitutions* and refers to the correct disposition of an individual Jesuit should have in expressing obedience to his superior.

Christ living and acting through the power of the Spirit. Thus can we speak to them of God our Father who brings to Himself the human race in a communion of true brotherhood."¹⁴² While humility is thus a key ingredient in effective ministry, serving those who are most in need of God's care, since they are also in humblest of situation, the virtue of humility, as noted by the early Jesuits, is also an expression of solidarity and intimacy with them, so that they too can see Christ in these close encounters.

The Society of Jesus is without doubt a "sacerdotal society" in that it is a religious order originally founded as a company of priests. Jesuits consider the lay brothers in their midst as sharing in the corporate priestly mission of the society. They do not question the well acceptable notion that sacramental ministries, especially the celebration of the Eucharist, are essential to the character of the ministerial priesthood, and also do not challenge the validity of the Thomistic assertion that priesthood is an ontological category. However, they generally have an expanded understanding of the priesthood. While not denying the unique roles and functions of priests within the Church, the society at the onset was careful de-emphasize the elitist mindset that these notions might bring. One quality that characterizes the society and also the Jesuit priesthood, and repeated emphasized by Ignatius of Loyola, is the virtue of humility. The Jesuits, as an order of priests, are expected to humbly place themselves under the yoke of obedience to the Church hierarchy and at their service. They are also similarly expected to humbly serve the needs of Christians and those who have yet to hear the Gospel. Jesuits draw them closer to the faith and the Church through the humility they display in their life and work. In a way, the early Jesuits understood and put into practice the notion of "humble service" as an antidote to the separation

¹⁴² Society of Jesus, "Decrees of the 32nd General Congregation," in *Jesuit Life & Mission Today: The Decrees and Accompanying Documents of the 31st-35th General Congregations of the Society of Jesus*, ed. John W. Padberg (St. Louis, MO: Institute of Jesuit Sources, 2009), Decree 4, #50, 310.

and distancing between the Church and the people during their time. By doing so, the Jesuit order is also a "least society" of priests.

A Ministerial Society

In the previously mentioned address, which Pope Paul VI had given to the thirty-second general congregation of the society, he characterized Jesuits in a number of ways, and in describing one of them he states:

You are, moreover, *apostles*, that is, preachers of the Gospel, sent in every direction in accordance with the most authentic and genuine character of the society. You are men whom Christ himself sends into the whole world to spread his holy doctrine among the people of every state and condition ... This is a fundamental and irreplaceable characteristic of the true Jesuit, who indeed finds in the Exercises, as in the Constitutions, continuous inducement to practice the virtues proper to him, those virtues indicated by St. Ignatius ... The diversity of ministries to which the Society dedicates itself takes from these sources its most profound motive of that apostolic life which must be lived *pleno sensu*.¹⁴³

Likewise, the society, through the decrees of recent general congregations, has affirmed the apostolic character of their order.¹⁴⁴ Jesuits consider themselves as members of an apostolic body given the shared mission of "continuing Christ's saving work in the world."¹⁴⁵

The Society of Jesus also borrowed from the "*vita apostolica*" traditions of the earlier monastic and mendicant orders in envisioning their corporate identity and mission. However, their expression of an "apostolic life," modeled after the life and works of St. Paul the Apostle, is directed towards "mobility" and "active ministry."¹⁴⁶ Moreover, as discussed previously, the early society was more than likely influenced by the reformed priestly orders whose charisms

¹⁴³ Pope Paul VI, "Address to General Congregation 32," 383.

¹⁴⁴ Society of Jesus, "General Congregation 31," Decree 13, #3, 97; Society of Jesus, "General Congregation 32," Decree 2, #21, 294.

¹⁴⁵ Society of Jesus, "General Congregation 32," Decree 2, #21, 294.

¹⁴⁶ Harmless, "Jesuits as Priests: Crisis and Charism," 41. Jerome Nadal, the primary interpreted of Ignatius' writings and the Jesuit Constitutions, provided this nuanced definition of *vita apostolica*.

were also apostolic in nature. Orders such as the Theatines and Barnabites were engaged in ministries such as working with the poor and running hospitals. If indeed the ordained members of the Society of Jesus have been called to live their priesthood in the fullest sense and also be committed fully to their apostolic calling, then arguably, following the *preti reformati* tradition, the Jesuits also have an expanded understanding of priestly ministry beyond that which is exclusively associated with cultic worship and sacramental work.

From a contemporary Catholic perspective, it is not a completely novel idea to associate the priesthood with a wider range of ministerial functions. The Second Vatican Council affirms that priests are called to share in Christ's in the ministries of "Teacher, Priest and King."¹⁴⁷ This is commonly referred to as the "threefold office" or the "*trimunera*." First, a priest is to serve as a "minister of God's Word" to preach the Christ's Gospel of salvation to the world and instruct the faithful of Christian doctrines.¹⁴⁸ Second, he is to be a "minister of the sacraments and the Eucharist," participating in Jesus' work of sanctifying the world through the ministering of the sacraments and leading liturgical celebration, especially the Holy Eucharist.¹⁴⁹ A priest is also considered a "ruler of God's people" in that he is given the authority to shepherd and care for the people under his charge, helping them in the spiritual growth and to build up their community.¹⁵⁰

A direct reading of the *Formula of the Institute* reveals that there is much congruence between the *trimunera* and what are traditionally and officially regarded as Jesuit ministries. As briefly mentioned in chapter two, the 1550 *Formula of the Institute* provides quite an extensive list of ministries, traditionally known as the *consueta ministeria* or "customary ministries,"¹⁵¹

¹⁴⁷ Second Vatican Council, "Presbyterorum Ordinis," #1, 863.

¹⁴⁸ Ibid., #4, 868-870.

¹⁴⁹ Ibid., #5, 870-872.

¹⁵⁰ Ibid., #6, 872-875. "Priests as Rulers of God's People" is the sub-heading found in this edition of the document.

¹⁵¹ O'Malley, *The First Jesuits*, 5–6.

through which members are expected to "strive for the defense and the propagation of the faith and for the progress of souls in Christine life and doctrine."¹⁵² The list explicitly states ministries associated with the dissemination of the Word and the "administration of the sacraments."

The ministry of sacramental reconciliation is clearly mentioned in the *Formula*, and perhaps it reflects the Jesuits' affinity to this ministry given that the founding members were conscientiously engaged in it soon after their ordinations. Furthermore, the labor of "healing wounds of division," "bringing people closer to the Church and God" or simply the work of "reconciliation," has been the priority since the time of the first companions. The Jesuits, since the inception of their order, has considered the reconciliation between the estranged and God, whether they have been separated due to the issues of the Reformation, or alienated because of the atheistic mindset of the contemporary world, as their mission. They desire to draw people closer to God.

The *Formula* lacks any explicit reference to ministries linked to what one may refer to as the "kingly" office, usually associated with the exercise of authority in leading a given faith community. Concerning this office, *Presbyterorum Ordinis* asserts that priests have been given the spiritual power and authority to "build up the Church," helping the faithful "reach Christian maturity," and to help them "carry out their duties in a Christian way in the community of their fellow men." ¹⁵³ The normative understanding of this statement and others in the same document is in the context of the diocesan priesthood or at least those working in a similar setting.¹⁵⁴ Indeed, there are certainly Jesuits whose primary apostolates fit neatly into this category, such as those who are working in parishes and campus ministries. However, in general, how does the

¹⁵² Society of Jesus, "The Formula of the Institute of the Society of Jesus," #1, 4.

¹⁵³ Second Vatican Council, "Presbyterorum Ordinis," #6, 872-873.

¹⁵⁴ Ibid., #1, 863. The document states that it "refers in a special way to those way are engaged in the care of souls" but is applicable to religious priests if and when their circumstances allow.

"kingly" office relate to the Jesuit priesthood? One innovative element found in the list is that it contains an almost carte blanche definition of what constitutes a Jesuit ministry in that it calls members of the society to "perform any other works of charity, according to what will seem expedient for the glory of God and the common good."¹⁵⁵ Working for the betterment of the common good is likely due to the humanistic influences to which the early companions were exposed.¹⁵⁶ It may be argued that this intentionality towards the common good is an expression, at least in the corporate sense, of the "kingly" office of the priesthood. Given their incarnational spirituality and their more holistic understanding of the human person that saw the essential relationship between body, mind and soul,¹⁵⁷ they also consider their corporal works of mercy strongly related to the advancement of the spiritual of the people. Moreover, Jesuits have an expansive view of community. The Church, for members of the Society of Jesus, transcends the parish boundaries. Therefore, the pursuit of the common good would also ultimately have a positive impact on the faith and the Church. For instance, Jesuits consider their education apostolate not only as a means to renew of the Church through the transmission of faith and doctrine, but also as an avenue for Christianity to engage the world and contribute to the greater community of human persons and their intellectual endeavors.¹⁵⁸ Another instance of the Jesuit exercising their "kingly" office is in the pastoral care of the poor, sick and marginalized, which the Second Vatican Council has affirmed is a proper expression of the ministerial priesthood particularly through the "kingly" office.¹⁵⁹

¹⁵⁵ Society of Jesus, "The Formula of the Institute of the Society of Jesus," #1, 4.

¹⁵⁶ O'Malley, *Saints or Devils Incarnate*?, 60. The Jesuits were strongly influenced by the writings of Cicero, such as the *De Officiis*, which encouraged officials to work for the public good.

¹⁵⁷ O'Malley, *The First Jesuits*, 18. The phrase "salvation of souls" that commonly appears in Jesuit documents does not refer exclusively to a person's spiritual life but concerns the wellness of the whole person.

¹⁵⁸ Society of Jesus, "General Congregation 31," Decree 28, #2, 168.

¹⁵⁹ Second Vatican Council, "Presbyterorum Ordinis," #6, 874.

Similar to the order of ministries listed in *Presbyterorum Ordinis*, the society has implied the primacy of the ministry of the Word by listing it first in the *Formula*.¹⁶⁰ This follows from the tradition of the first companions who were not only involved with preaching in liturgy, but also in informal settings, such as in the streets and market places.¹⁶¹ However, Jesuits have an expanded notion of ministries focused on the "proclamation of the Gospel" that is not limited to preaching of the Gospel or catechesis. In this regard, the society provides a rather general definition of this ministry in stating that "any ministration whatsoever of the word of God."¹⁶² One example of such ministry was the early companions and Jesuits engagement in spiritual conversations with people, which is perhaps another unique contribution of St. Ignatius and the society to the ministerial landscape of the Church. During his years as a "pilgrim," Ignatius would regularly meet people would and spoke about matters regarding faith and their spiritual experiences.¹⁶³ These encounters, despite being informal meetings and exchanges, would still bring about much "spiritual progress" among the people.

The Jesuits' broader definition of the ministry of the Word goes beyond conversations pertaining to faith and spiritual matters, and even merely writings and spoken words. In a letter encouraging his men to form "friendships of spiritual quality" with university students in the German territories to perhaps stem the rise of defection from the Church to Protestantism,

¹⁶⁰ Society of Jesus, "The Formula of the Institute of the Society of Jesus," #1, 4. The 1540 *Formula* contains a more concise list of ministries. However, like the *Formula* of 1550, the earlier document also named the "ministry of the Word" first among the list. The primacy of ministries associated with the Word has been affirmed in General Congregation 34, Decree 6, #21, stating that "the ministries of the Word – the ministries named before all others in the Formula of our Institute – have always been of primary importance for Jesuit priestly ministry."

¹⁶¹ Saint Ignatius of Loyola and Gonçalves da Câmara, "Reminiscences," #95, 59-60. For example, the first companions, while stationed in Venice in 1537, would go to different city squares and "began their sermons, first shouting loudly and calling the people with their caps."

¹⁶² Society of Jesus, "The Formula of the Institute of the Society of Jesus," #1, 4.

¹⁶³ For example, during his times in Manresa, Alcalá and Flanders, Ignatius not only begged for alms but also had spiritual conversations with people. See Saint Ignatius of Loyola and Gonçalves da Câmara, "Reminiscences," #26, 24; #57, 40; #77, 50.

Ignatius adds: "For the same reason, conversation and friendship with this same kind of people should be cultivated. Then, though it may sometimes be right for the sake of human interest to take extraneous subjects, that appeal to the human intellect, one should draw the conversation back to things that are of real profit, so that such conversations may not be useless."¹⁶⁴ It can be extracted from Ignatius' advice that other forms of contact between Jesuits and the people whom they serve that would bring about goodwill are important. Especially for those who already have doubts about faith and may feel alienated from the Church, cultivating goodwill and fostering friendship are important to gain trust and receptiveness. Moreover, exchanges and dialogues concerning other matters can serve as a "stepping stone" to deeper and meaningful encounters regarding matters of faith. From a contemporary perspective, the Jesuit broad-based approach to their ministering the Word of God is similar to what is known as "pre-evangelization." Speaking of the activities of the Church in the modern world, Pope Paul VI notes:

"She carries out this first proclamation of Jesus Christ by a complex and diversified activity which is sometimes termed 'pre-evangelization' but which is already evangelization in a true sense, although at its initial and still incomplete stage. An almost indefinite range of means can be used for this purpose: explicit preaching, of course, but also art, the scientific approach, philosophical research and legitimate recourse to the sentiments of the human heart."¹⁶⁵

The key idea, supposedly, is to seek out channels for engagement and through them build relationships, and through these the Gospel is proclaimed. Thus, the society's wide range of ministries, some which may seem to have little or nothing to do with the Church's mission, have certain value in helping communicate the Word of God. Furthermore, this approach also agrees

¹⁶⁴ Saint Ignatius of Loyola, "Spreading God's Word in a German University (September 24, 1549)," in *Personal Writings: Reminiscences, Spiritual Diary, Select Letters Including the Text of The Spiritual Exercises*, trans. Philip Endean and Joseph A. Munitiz (London, UK: Penguin Books, 2004), 233.

¹⁶⁵ Pope Paul VI, "Evangelii Nuntiandi [Apostolic Exhortation to the Episcopate, to the Clergy and to All the Faith of the Entire World]," *Vatican Website*, #51, last modified December 8, 1975, accessed July 16, 2017, http://w2.vatican.va/content/paul-vi/en/apost_exhortations/documents/hf_p-vi_exh_19751208_evangelii-nuntiandi.html.

with the spirituality of the Jesuits, since it is another expression of the "Principle and Foundation" of the *Spiritual Exercises* in which human beings are called to use all other created things to "praise, serve and reverence God."

The Jesuit strategy of proclaiming the Word or evangelization is perhaps also rooted in classical rhetoric, which made up a substantial part of the humanistic education many members of the society had received.¹⁶⁶ According to Aristotle, rhetoric is defined as "the capacity to discover the possible means of persuasion concerning any subject."¹⁶⁷ Perhaps the early Jesuits had realized that during the time of political and religious upheaval, and discontent with the Church, the most effective way to heal the division and conversion of the hearts, was by communicating the Word of God in a persuasive manner. The three modes of classical rhetoric, generally associated with the writings of Aristotle and Cicero, are namely pathos, logos and *ethos*.¹⁶⁸ *Pathos* is the mode in which the speaker appeals to the goodwill of the audience in order to make himself or herself likeable. Aristotle expresses this idea succinctly by stating that, "to the one who is friendly, the person about whom he passes judgment seems not to do wrong or only in a small way."¹⁶⁹ Thus, developing friendship with the intended audience helps them to be more receptive to the Word of God. As discussed previously, Ignatius was careful to emphasize this point. Even in engaging hostile Protestants, he instructed Jesuits to befriend them and convince them of their errors not by polemics, but through making friends and manifesting the

¹⁶⁶ de Polanco, "The Importance of Humanistic Studies in Jesuit Formation (1547)." As mentioned in chapter two, the writings of Aristotle and Cicero, concerning various subjects and including rhetoric, were essential to the curriculum of studies in Jesuit schools.

¹⁶⁷ Quoted in Erik Gunderson, *The Cambridge Companion to Ancient Rhetoric*, Cambridge companions to literature (Cambridge, UK ; New York: Cambridge University Press, 2009), 1.

¹⁶⁸ George A Kennedy, *Classical Rhetoric & Its Christian & Secular Tradition from Ancient to Modern Times*, 2nd ed., and enl. (Chapel Hill, NC: University of North Carolina Press, 1999), 82.

¹⁶⁹ Aristotle, *On rhetoric: a theory of civic discourse*, trans. George A Kennedy (New York, NY: Oxford University Press, 1991), II.1.4.

signs of God's love.¹⁷⁰ For the Jesuits, the objective has always been to win the person over, for the salvation of his or her soul, and not to claim victory over the argument.

As discussed before, the society demand their men to live exemplary lives that would edify and inspire others to also live as good Christians. From the perspective of classical rhetoric, leading virtuous and reputable lives also serve to as means to spread the Good News through the mode of *ethos* – persuasion through the reputation of the speaker. Concerning *ethos*, Cicero writes: "Now feelings are won over by a man's merit, achievements or reputable life, qualifications easier to embellish, if only they are real, than to fabricate where non-existent."¹⁷¹ Accordingly, a speaker of good repute would be more trustworthy, and command greater respect and authority. It is likely that Ignatius and the first companions understood that a less than virtuous clergy would effectively hinder the mission of the Church in communicating the Gospel to the people. Perhaps in their evaluation, it was not disagreement pertaining to the Church's teachings that contributed to the Reformation, but rather the people's aversion and distrust of the supposed heralds of God's Word, the ordained ministers, due to the latter's less than exemplary lifestyle. Therefore, the society has ever since been insistent that Jesuits live an "upright life" and one of "Christian virtue," and "doing good deeds."¹⁷² The call to live humbly and working for the poor and marginalized, mentioned previously, are instances of employing *ethos* to preach the Word of God. One's reputation may also be enhanced, besides living virtuous, by one's accomplishments, such as education and social status. The general population would likely heed the advice from a more knowledgeable and educated person than one who is not. Thus, the society's focus on academic formation of their men, would also serve the ministry of the God by

¹⁷⁰ Saint Ignatius of Loyola, "Spreading God's Word in a German University," 234.

¹⁷¹ Marcus Tullius Cicero, *De oratore. Books I-II*, trans. E. W Sutton (Cambridge, MA: Harvard University Press, 1948), II.182.

¹⁷² Society of Jesus, *Constitutions*, #637, 294. In ways to help the souls, "living an exemplary life" is listed first in the *Constitutions*.

the mode of *ethos*. Despite the disaffection among people with the Church during Ignatius' time, there remained those who still abide by the feudalistic organization of the society in which ordained ministers continued to enjoy certain status and authority, especially in countries that clearly remained Catholic. Just as Jesuit priests have been given the authority for public ministry by the Church through their ordination, their status as priests also gave them certain public recognition and therefore would likely aid in their evangelization effort. As mentioned in the previous chapter, Ignatius wrote to Cardinal Carafa advising him to ensure that the Theatines, the religious order of reformed priests that Carafa co-founded, have a greater public presence performing corporal and spiritual works of mercy to edify the laity and even other clerics.¹⁷³ The founding general of the society thus regarded the importance of priests having a public presence, exhibiting the dedicated service and virtuous living, as another mean to strengthen the faith of others. These may possibly be instances of the application of *ethos* and *pathos*.

Communicating the Gospel message and Church doctrines is also an intellectual endeavor. The Word of God must be logically compelling so that the audience can be convinced and accept it as the Truth. The mode of *logos* is persuasion through the exercise of logic and reason. Therefore, other than responding to the fact that majority of the clerics were insufficiently educated during their time, Ignatius and the co-founders of the society ensured that their men were provided with rigorous intellectual formation so that they could have the requisite knowledge to be ministers of the Word. Jesuit priests must have the capacity to explain the faith rationally to the intended audience. The society felt so strongly about this issue that they even started to educate non-Jesuit candidates for Holy Orders. In fact, prior to the institution of seminaries for training the diocesan clergy following the Council of Trent, the early Jesuits had

¹⁷³ Saint Ignatius of Loyola, "Blueprint," #7, 143.

already set up schools, such as the *Collegio Romano* and the *Collegio Germanico*, to educate not only lay students and Jesuits, but also those training to be diocesan clergy.¹⁷⁴

The Word of God, for Ignatius and the Jesuits, have never been about abstract notions of God, but pertains to the "Word made flesh," Jesus Christ (Jn 1:14). This emphasis is clearly reflected by the fact that most of the Spiritual Exercises concerns contemplating on the person of Jesus and his salvific mission.¹⁷⁵ In effect, *the Exercises*, the foundation of Jesuit spirituality, is a process through which a person could become intimately familiar with Jesus Christ. Given their readiness to adapt to different situations, it is understandable that in an analogous manner to the *Exercises*, the Jesuit ministry of Word consists of more than the conventional channels through which the Word is formally proclaimed. Moreover, Ignatius has insisted that not all can undergo the full Exercises, and therefore, it made sense for the Jesuits to consider different ways for others to share that similar experience of conversion through the personal encounter with Christ. It is, after all, a question of mediation. The ministry of the Word is a ministry of mediation through which the divine is made present in the person of Jesus – it is the ministry of encountering the person of Christ. Even though the Ignatian dictum, "leave the Creator to work directly with the creature, and the creature with the Creator and Lord," should apply to all their ministries, there must still be some form of mediation. For instance, in the retreat ministry, Christ is encountered through the different meditations and contemplations, and the dynamics of the *Exercises.* Thus, from the perspective of mediation, the ministry of the Word can certainly take on many different forms. It can, therefore, be argued that other categories of ministry, such as

¹⁷⁴ O'Malley, *The First Jesuits*, 232–233.

¹⁷⁵ Saint Ignatius of Loyola, "Spiritual Exercises," #4, 283-284. The annotation reads: "The exercises that follow are made up of four Weeks, corresponding to the four parts into which these Exercises are divided: namely, the First is the consideration and contemplation of sins; the Second is the life of Christ Our Lord up to, and including, Palm Sunday; the Third, the Passion of Christ Our Lord; the Fourth, the Resurrection and Ascension, with the three ways of praying."

sacramental works or corporal works of mercy, make present the person of Jesus Christ, and may be subsumed under the broader definition of the "ministry of the Word."¹⁷⁶

However, from the analysis of the ministry of the Word on the basis of rhetorical principles, especially the elements of *pathos* and *ethos*, suggests that the proclamation of the Gospel goes beyond formal and even informal ministries. As Pope Paul VI rightly notes that even activities supposedly paving the way for the formal proclamation of the Gospel, generally known as "pre-evangelization," are already evangelization in progress. In a sense Ignatius and the early Jesuits share Paul VI's view in that they understood that it is in these activities the character and disposition of the minister are revealed. It is through these activities that the ministers live out the Gospel message and demonstrate their likeness in Christ. For instance, a minister of the Word who exhibits the quality of mercy, will also reflect the mercy of Christ, and possibly through such an encounter bring about conversions in others. Writing to the scholastics in Coimbra regarding their formation in the society, Ignatius asserts:

Thus it is that we say, '*Sol et homo generant hominem*.' Similarly, if God wants to shape people in the forms of humility, prudence, charity and so on, it follows that God also wants the direct cause used to shape others in this way, i.e. the preacher or the confessor to be humble, patient and charitable. So if you yourselves are growing personally in every virtue in the way I spoke of earlier, you are being of great service to others.¹⁷⁷

¹⁷⁶ Michael J. Buckley, "Jesuit Priesthood: Its Meaning and Commitments," *Studies in the spirituality of Jesuits* 8, no. 5 (1976): 150–151. Buckley opines that in contemporary times, "the ministry of the word within the Church has developed to subsume into a more profound unity certain other aspects of ministerial priesthood, while conserving its primordial orientation towards the speaking, hearing and embodiment of the word of God." The early Jesuits already had a sense of this broad definition of the "proclamation of the Word."
¹⁷⁷ Saint Ignatius of Loyola, "Ideals for Newcomers (Students in Coimbra [of the Society of Jesus], May

¹⁷⁷ Saint Ignatius of Loyola, "Ideals for Newcomers (Students in Coimbra [of the Society of Jesus], May 7, 1547)," in *Personal Writings: Reminiscences, Spiritual Diary, Select Letters Including the Text of The Spiritual Exercises*, trans. Philip Endean and Joseph A. Munitiz (London, UK: Penguin Books, 2004), 180.

Thus, not only do the ministries that apparently "pave the way" for evangelization, are in themselves means of transmitting the Good News, the lives of the ministers themselves also express the living Word of God.

A Religious Society

Like those from other religious orders of the Roman Catholic Church, members of the Society of profess the evangelical counsels, namely the vows of chastity, poverty and obedience. A quick perusal of the *Constitutions* will show that Ignatius has only a few sparing remarks on chastity, which he states: "What pertains to the vow of chastity requires no interpretation, since it is evident how perfectly it should be preserved."¹⁷⁸ In contrast, the first general has given more extensive treatment to the other two vows, in the official documents of the society, and also in his personal writings.

From Ignatius' words in the *Constitutions*, one can gather the level of importance he placed on Jesuit observing the vow of poverty. Using military imagery, he considers "poverty" as the "defensive wall" that protects all religious order, and one that the malignant forces are continuously trying to breach.¹⁷⁹ Fearful that future generations of Jesuits might amend the foundational document to accommodate a milder expression of poverty, Ignatius makes explicit that observance of this vow can only be made more stringent.¹⁸⁰ His strict views on matters associated with living the vow of poverty was demonstrated again by the rather involved discernment process he had undergone to ascertain whether churches under the care of the society should consider receiving an income to remain financially viable.¹⁸¹

¹⁷⁸ Society of Jesus, *Constitutions*, #547, 220.

¹⁷⁹ Ibid., #553, 226.

¹⁸⁰ Ibid.

¹⁸¹ See excerpts of Saint Ignatius of Loyola, "The Spiritual Diary," in *Personal Writings: Reminiscences, Spiritual Diary, Select Letters Including the Text of The Spiritual Exercises*, trans. Joseph A. Munitiz and

Other than it being one of the evangelical counsels and a pathway to perfect oneself, Ignatius' strong position on the vow of poverty is perhaps another one of his reactions to the clerical culture of his day. As mentioned in chapter two, there were those who sought ordination as a means of securing benefices that brought about financial gains. This generally had a corrupting influence on the clergy. It is therefore likely that Ignatius stringent views on poverty was his effort to minimize the possibility of Jesuit priests falling prey to the temptation of wealth and bringing about the same malaise that had affected the clergy during his era.

For Ignatius, living evangelical poverty, like the practice of humility, assists in impression others and hopefully drawing them closer to God. In the discernment he made on poverty mentioned before, Ignatius writes that "people are generally more impressed if they see that nothing of this world is being sought."¹⁸² Also in a letter written by Juan de Polanco on Ignatius' behalf to the society in Padua, the general states that "[f]riendship with the poor makes us friends of the eternal king."¹⁸³ This statement offers an interesting juxtaposition of roles as the poor, with their limited means, in effect becomes the evangelizers to the Jesuits. The members of the society serve and befriend the poor through their ministries, and the poor in turn become a channel through which the Jesuit ministers encounter Christ. General congregation thirty-three decrees that the Jesuit "religious life has been enriched by the opportunity to 'labor with' Jesus among the poor."¹⁸⁴ It is in sharing in Christ's service to the poor, whom he loves, that the Jesuit

Philip Endean (London, UK: Penguin Books, 2004), 70–76. The society, in general, do not solicit or expect payment for their ministries. See *Constitutions*, #565, 234.

¹⁸² Ibid., 71.

¹⁸³ Saint Ignatius of Loyola and Juan Alfonso de Polanco, "Experience of Poverty (Members of the Society in Padua, August 6, 1547)," in *Personal Writings: Reminiscences, Spiritual Diary, Select Letters Including the Text of The Spiritual Exercises*, trans. Philip Endean and Joseph A. Munitiz (London, UK: Penguin Books, 2004), #5, 191.

¹⁸⁴ Society of Jesus, "Decrees of the 33rd General Congregation," in *Jesuit Life & Mission Today: The Decrees and Accompanying Documents of the 31st-35th General Congregations of the Society of Jesus*, ed. John W. Padberg (St. Louis, MO: Institute of Jesuit Sources, 2009), Decree 1, #31, 448.

ministers also meet, befriend and deepen their relationship with Jesus. While this may not be something novel in the post Vatican II era, with council promulgating the Church's "preferential option the poor," it was a rare or even unique perspective in the sixteenth century.

It is well known that the Society of Jesus place great emphasis on the vow of obedience. The *Constitutions* notes that the members are to "distinguish themselves in observing the vow of obedience, not only in matters of obligation but also the others."¹⁸⁵ As mentioned before, Ignatius demanded radical observance of obedience of Jesuits to their lawful superior, as though one is a "lifeless body" so as to be wielded for the service of Church and the common good. These are expressions of one's fidelity to Christ who acts through the superior,¹⁸⁶ and also for the more pragmatic purpose of maintaining right order for the society to function properly.¹⁸⁷ Like the observance of poverty and the practice of humility, obedience also aids Jesuits in keeping the corrosive influence of their pride in check.¹⁸⁸

Solemnly professed members of the society make a special fourth vow of obedience to the pope.¹⁸⁹ This is perhaps the clearest expression of a Jesuit's obedience to Jesus through his superior since the Holy Father is the Vicar of Christ, and also a concrete and public declaration of their aspirations of "serving the Lord alone and the Church, his spouse, under the Roman pontiff, the vicar of Christ on earth," as averred in the *Formula*.¹⁹⁰ A salient feature of this special fourth vow is that it pertains primarily to matters concerning mission. At the very inception of the society, the first companions placed themselves under the command of the pope

¹⁸⁵ Society of Jesus, Constitutions, #547, 220.

¹⁸⁶ Ibid., #547, 220-221.

¹⁸⁷ Saint Ignatius of Loyola, "Defining Obedience as an Ideal (Rector and Students of the College in Coimbra, January 14, 1548)," in *Personal Writings: Reminiscences, Spiritual Diary, Select Letters Including the Text of The Spiritual Exercises*, trans. Philip Endean and Joseph A. Munitiz (London, UK: Penguin Books, 2004), #3, 200.

¹⁸⁸ Ibid., #7, 202.

¹⁸⁹ Society of Jesus, Constitutions, #527, 204.

¹⁹⁰ Society of Jesus, "The Formula of the Institute of the Society of Jesus," #1, 3.

to be sent anywhere to serve the God, the Church and all humanity.¹⁹¹ Following this tradition, all Jesuits, not only those who have professed the special vow, are expected to be made available for the universal mission of the society and the Church. This is one defining feature of the Jesuits, distinguishing it from other religious orders, even the *preti reformati* orders which the first companions drew inspirations.

It has also been suggested that this special obedience to the pope offers a different approach to the priestly ministry. The normative understanding of the ordained ministries is that priests are subordinates to their respective bishops. The Second Vatican Council states: "Priests on their part should keep in mind the fullness of the sacrament of Order which bishops enjoy and should reverence in their persons the authority of Christ the supreme Pastor. They should therefore be attached to their bishop with sincere charity and obedience."¹⁹² Accordingly, priests associated to a particular bishop form a *presbyterium* under that bishop, sharing to care for the people and works of the diocese. There is an opinion that Jesuits, by placing themselves at the disposal of the Holy Father, have effectively formed a presbyterium under the pontiff rather than a diocesan bishop.¹⁹³ In other words, the bishop whom the Jesuits priests "are attached with sincere charity and obedience" is the Supreme Pontiff. This reflects the Jesuits' ecclesiology and missiology - the Church is universal and their mission fields transcend geographical and political borders. Therefore, obedience offered to the pope, particularly in matters concerning the Church's mission to the world, makes sense to Jesuits because they consider the Pope, the pastor

¹⁹¹ Society of Jesus, "General Congregation 32," Decree 2, #13, 293.
¹⁹² Second Vatican Council, "Presbyterorum Ordinis," #7, 877.

¹⁹³ Buckley, "Jesuit Priesthood," 146.

of the Universal Church, "the master of Christ's whole harvest," and therefore "has a greater knowledge of what is expedient for Christianity as a whole."¹⁹⁴

Jesuits' notions of the "universal mission" were unique among the orders of reformed priests. There is evidence the seed of this worldview has been germinating for a number of years in Ignatius' spiritual life before the founding of the society. The beginning of the second week of the Spiritual Exercises contains the imageries of the "Call of the King" and "on the incarnation."¹⁹⁵ In the former, one is asked to obey and follow the "eternal King," Jesus Christ and share in his mission of "conquering the whole world and every enemy."¹⁹⁶ The "call" motif in the first consideration would certainly lead one to associate it with one's personal vocation, and rightly so. The militaristic imagery of following Jesus under his banner and going into "battle" is also found in the Formula of the Institute.¹⁹⁷ While it is possible these similarities are merely coincidental, since Ignatius of Loyola was familiar with such imageries, it could also be due to his understanding that one's personal vocation aligns with the Lord's mission. After all, one is asked to "praise, reverence and serve God, and by so doing to save his or her own soul."¹⁹⁸ This sentiment is made even more explicit in the Formula in that by directing one's effort towards the goal of the society, which is to participate in Christ's mission, one travels on the "pathway to God." Thus, for Jesuits, being called to a life of holiness is also a call to be share in Jesus' mission of salvation. Another interesting point in the two images found in the Exercises is that they made clear that from Ignatius' perspective, Christ's missionary intention is directed at the entire world. This view was possibly influenced by the historical era in which Ignatius was

¹⁹⁴ Ibid., 147.

¹⁹⁵ Saint Ignatius of Loyola, "Spiritual Exercises," #91-109, 303-306.

¹⁹⁶ Ibid., #91-95, 303-304.

¹⁹⁷ Society of Jesus, "The Formula of the Institute of the Society of Jesus," #1, 3.

¹⁹⁸ Saint Ignatius of Loyola, "Spiritual Exercises," #23, 289.

situated. The end of the middle ages marked the beginning of the age of exploration with the discovery of the new lands and contact with new peoples.¹⁹⁹ These events probably had given Ignatius an expanded understanding of the world beyond Europe, and the possibilities of new horizons for evanglization. For the author of the *Exercises*, it is the whole world that Christ desires to conquer,²⁰⁰ and it is to the entire world with multitudes of different people that the second Person of the Trinity has been sent to save.²⁰¹ Jesus' salvific mission transcends physical and also national boundaries, and it is a universal mission towards all peoples.

Religious vows for Jesuits are therefore not simply observed for the benefit of one's selfperfection. Rather they serve the greater objective of the Society of Jesus, which is to propagate the Good News to the whole world for its redemption. If the Jesuit priesthood is indeed one that is primarily concerned with the ministry of the Word, then the vows of poverty and obedience not only provide the men of the society with another channel to communicate the living Word, but also the humility and freedom to be sent by Christ through his vicar and the Church to bring him and his salvific message to four corners of the world.

The Jesuit Priesthood

The bishops of the Second Vatican Council declare: "At all times the Church carries the responsibility of reading the signs of the times and of interpreting them in light of the Gospel, if it is to carry out its task."²⁰² The council recognizes the necessity for the Church to adapt to the

¹⁹⁹ As a man of his time, Ignatius' global perspective on mission, later adopted by the Society of Jesus, was possibly due to the influence of his era. He and the early Jesuits lived in the age of exploration, perhaps best exemplified by Christopher Columbus discovery of the New World in 1492 and also Vasco da Gama's discovery of the sea route to India and beyond.

²⁰⁰ Saint Ignatius of Loyola, "Spiritual Exercises," #95, 304.

²⁰¹ Ibid., #102-106, 305.

²⁰² Second Vatican Council, "Gaudium et Spes [Pastoral Constitution on the Church in the Modern World], December, 7 1965," in *Vatican Council II the Conciliar and Post Conciliar Documents*, ed. Austin Flannery, new rev. ed. (Collegeville, MN: Liturgical Press, 2014), #4, 905.

milieu that it is situated to stay relevant and effective in its mission of continuing the work of Christ on earth. In other words, the Church must be responsive to the forces of history.

From the discussion thus far, it appears that more than four hundred years prior to the Second Vatican Council, Ignatius of Loyola and his companions already had, in a way, lived their discipleship of Christ responsively to the needs of the times, whether consciously or otherwise. The early Jesuits, and also like-minded men from the *preti reformati* orders, sensed the detrimental effects associated with the prevailing clerical culture and moved to remedy them. However, unlike Protestants and more radical reformers, the Jesuits chose to work within the Church and by offering an alternative vision of the priesthood. While the society has never overtly confessed its reform agenda, the values emphasized in its *Constitutions* and other documents contain evidence to this effect. The stringent demands placed on Jesuits to interiorize and exercise humility in both their spiritual and material lives are clearly repudiation of the malaise associated with the clerical culture at that time. Moreover, the society's strict prohibition of their men from accepting ecclesial honors suggests that Jesuits consider themselves first and foremost as an order of priests, but one that is dedicated to humble service of the Church and the faithful.

As presented above, the Jesuit priesthood is not exclusively a cultic priesthood, but one that is focused on bringing the Word of God to the people, and this sentiment is also echoed by the Second Vatican Council.²⁰³ The early modern period was marked by social and political turmoil in Europe, but also offered many opportunities in the discovery of the New World and other distant civilizations. It called for a Church that would bring the estranged back to the fold and one that could also bring Christ to those who are strangers to the faith. The Society of Jesus

²⁰³ Second Vatican Council, "Presbyterorum Ordinis," #4, 868. Among the priestly functions, preaching of the word is listed first and the council also states: "The People of God is formed into one in the first place by the Word of the living God, which is quite rightly sought from the mouth of priest."

appears to have responded to the needs of the times by offering themselves to the Church as a brotherhood of priests placed at the service of the pope, and readily available to be sent by the Roman Pontiff to bring the Gospel anywhere in the world. Jesuits therefore follows the tradition of the "prophetic priesthood."²⁰⁴

As men of their times, the early members of the society exercised their prophetic ministry of communicating the living Word to peoples by other means beside formal preaching. Certainly, these also included the administration of the sacraments and through their retreat ministry. The humanistic education early Jesuits had received, especially in rhetoric, gave them the flexibility to adapt to different situations but also the inspirations to broaden their repertoire in ministering the Word. For priests of the society, personal conduct and stature, the living the evangelical counsels and genuine care for poor and marginalized are important avenues of conveying the Gospel message as they gain respect and the affection of the people. It is through these various ways of conveying the Word that the people are brought closer to God. Therefore, the Jesuit priesthood is also a priesthood of consolation, as their ministries draw people ever closer to God.²⁰⁵

Although some of the physical challenges faced by the Jesuits from the sixteenth and seventeenth centuries, such as the need of traversing vast distances, are no longer great issues in contemporary times, members of the society continue to exercise their prophetic priesthood by bringing the Jesus and his message of salvation to frontiers of the Church, whether geographical, spiritual, cultural and even existential.²⁰⁶ They continue to engage in a wide variety of ministries

²⁰⁴ Buckley, "Jesuit Priesthood," 150.

²⁰⁵ O'Malley, *The First Jesuits*, 141. O'Malley suggests that all Jesuit *consueta ministeria* should be considered ministries of consolation, as putting people on the right path and leading them closer to God are collectively must be the "primary intention" of the society.

²⁰⁶ Pope Benedict XVI, "Address of Pope Benedict XVI to the 35th General Congregation of the Society of Jesus (February 21, 2008)," in *Jesuit Life & Mission Today: The Decrees and Accompanying*

so as to provide opportunities for people to meet God in the different situations each of them is in.

The Jesuit prophetic priesthood is indeed primarily a ministry of Word through which humanity experiences the divine presence. It can also be aptly described as a ministry of encounter. It is a ministry of encounter because Jesuit priests generally ministers of Christ priesthood, sharing in Jesus' mediation by meeting people where they are. It is also a ministry of encounter as the Jesuit priests themselves experience the divine presence in the people whom they minister. Advising his early companions attending the Council of Trent, Ignatius writes:

Our main aim (to God's greater glory) during this undertaking at Trent is to put into practice (as a group that lives together in one appropriate place) preaching, confessions and readings, teaching children, giving good example, visiting the poor in the hospitals, exhorting those around us, each of us according to our different talents he may happen to have, urging as many as possible greater piety and prayer. All of this is undertaken so that they and we may implore God Our Lord that His Divine Majesty kindly infuse His divine spirit into all those due to discuss the questions proper to such a lofty gathering, in order that the Holy Spirit may descend with greater abundance of gifts and graces on this Council.²⁰⁷

Ignatius' instructions to his brothers at Trent emphasize the need for Jesuits to continue with their customary ministries even though they were at the great council, attending to matters of great importance, at the behest of the pope. The more crucial point in his advice is that ministering to the people and interacting with them are, in fact, channels to encounter God and helpful to other ministries and further the mission of the society. Thus "encountering" is not a unidirectional proposition in which the minister "gives" and the ministered "receives," but a process in which both the minister and ministered evangelize each other. From a perhaps more pragmatic perspective, these "encounters," in which Jesuits understand with more depth those

Documents of the 31st-35th General Congregations of the Society of Jesus, ed. John W. Padberg (St. Louis, MO: Institute of Jesuit Sources, 2009), #2, 822.

²⁰⁷ Saint Ignatius of Loyola, "Conduct at Trent (Members of the Society of Jesus, 1546)," in *Personal Writings: Reminiscences, Spiritual Diary, Select Letters Including the Text of The Spiritual Exercises,* trans. Philip Endean and Joseph A. Munitiz (London, UK: Penguin Books, 2004), Part 2-1, 165.

whom they serve, are opportunities for them to read the "signs of the time." In the contemporary Society of Jesus, Jesuits are continuing the ministry of encounter. The thirty-second general congregation call Jesuits to solidarity with the poor to deepen their appreciation of the issues and concerns the poor face, and perhaps with the view that through this greater understanding of the challenges the marginalized and poor experience, the society and its members can respond appropriately following the will of God.²⁰⁸ Sharing the same sentiment, the thirty-sixth general congregation in emphasizing the society's mission of reconciliation, also reminds Jesuit that is "there is no authentic familiarity with God if we do not allow ourselves to be moved to compassion and action by an encounter with the Christ who is revealed in the suffering, vulnerable faces of people, indeed in the suffering of creation."²⁰⁹ The Jesuit priesthood is therefore a priesthood of encounter.

The priests of the Society of Jesus are perhaps expected not only to act "*in persona Christi*" exclusively in liturgy but also in the way they follow and imitate Christ in humbly obeying the Father and remaining faithful to the salvific mission, and humbly serving, living with and encountering the people in their ministry of the Word. Rather than the cultic model of priesthood associated with the Old Testament, the Jesuit priesthood is more akin to the New Testament model. Even though all faithful are called to participate and share in Jesus' mediation and his mission of salvation, the Jesuits fulfill this role in a particular way through their various missionary and ministerial efforts.²¹⁰ Moreover, as ordained ministers of the Church, they "express and focus the priestly ministry of the ecclesial community."²¹¹ The ministerial model of

²⁰⁸ Society of Jesus, "General Congregation 32," #48-49, 309.

²⁰⁹ Society of Jesus, *Decrees and Documents of 36th General Congregation of the Society of Jesus* (Gujarat, INDIA: Gujarat Sahitya Prakash, 2017), Decree 1, #20, 47.

²¹⁰ Donald L. Gelpi, "Theological Reflections on the Priestly Character of Our Jesuit Vocation," *Studies in the spirituality of Jesuits* 19, no. 3 (1987): 82.

²¹¹ Ibid., 75.

priesthood of the New Testament and from the apostolic age might have provided inspiration to the first companions in answering the changes and challenges of their time. They thus adopted a more responsive, mobile and service oriented understanding of priesthood, as opposed to a more hierarchical and sacerdotal model. Contemporary Jesuits continue to be inspired by the missionary and ministerial focused model of the priesthood.

In the following chapter, a theological framework of the Jesuit priesthood is presented. It is grounded on the theology of perhaps the most well known missionary and apostle of the early Church, St. Paul. Since the Jesuit priesthood is associated with the proclamation of the Word and missionary in nature, it has been described as "kerygmatic."²¹² However, in this thesis, it will be also considered from the perspective of the Pauline theology of "kenosis." It will be presented that kenotic theology is implicit in the *Spiritual Exercises* and therefore is also a meaningful theology and scriptural framework in analyzing the Jesuit priesthood.

²¹² Thomas P. Rausch, "Priest, Community, and Eucharist," in *Finding God in All Things: Essays in Honor of Michael J. Buckley*, ed. Michael J. Himes and Stephen J. Pope (New York, NY: Crossroad Publishing Company, 1996), 263.

CHAPTER 4 THEOLOGY

It has been proposed, in the discussion thus far, that the Jesuit priesthood does not exclusively follow the cultic model. There are a number of ways to describe the ordained ministry in the Society of Jesus. The Jesuit priesthood is prophetic, a priesthood of consolation, and a priesthood of encounter. The Society of Jesus was instituted as a priestly order, and therefore, its customary ministries should arguably also be considered as priestly ministries. As discussed in the chapter on the identity of the Jesuit priesthood, there is a particular emphasis by the Jesuits on the ministry of the Word. However, for members of the society, there are diverse ways through which the living Word of God is mediated. Thus, the Jesuit priesthood is prophetic. Moreover, the proclamation of Word is directed at reconciling people to God and drawing them closer to the Creator. Therefore, it is a priesthood of consolation. Men of the society even consider their religious life, including their living out of their vows, as means of communicating the Gospel message to the people, revitalizing their faith and renewing their intimacy with God. Ever since the inception of the society, Jesuits have valued their relationship with the people they serve. They understand that being immerse in the lives of the people, encountering them where they are, would not only be a more effective way of ministering, but also be enriching for the Jesuits themselves. Jesuits are therefore "ministers and priests of encounter," since their ministries facilitate the encounter between humanity and the divine, and they also encounter God through working with the people and sharing in their lives.

Despite the fact that there is still debate on whether the Society of Jesus was founded collectively by the first ten companions or solely by Ignatius of Loyola, the great contribution of the crippled Basque nobleman in laying the foundation of the Jesuit order cannot be denied. The *Constitutions of the Society of Jesus* that guides the life and mission of its members is grounded

74

on the Spiritual Exercises authored by Ignatius and contains a distillation of his spiritual experiences. As discussed in previous chapters, the Jesuit priesthood is shaped by Ignatian spirituality. Elements such as humility, obedience and the ability to adapt, core values of Ignatian spirituality, are shared by the Jesuit expression of priesthood. The early Jesuits were are also men of their times, and as previously shown, their "way of proceeding" and even these Ignatian values were also informed by certain elements found in humanistic movement that were gaining popularity during the late fifteenth and early sixteenth centuries.

While the underlying spirituality of the Jesuit priesthood is without dispute strongly influenced by the spirituality of Ignatius of Loyola, there has been very limited theological reflection. Studies on this subject matter have generally considered ordained ministers in the Society of Jesus from the perspectives of the nature of their ministries and on how they minister. Based on historical analyses of Ignatius' and the early companions' understanding of priesthood, the consensus is that the Jesuit priesthood, at least in their eyes, is a "missionary and prophetic" priesthood following the model of St. Paul. This descriptor is derived from the fact that the ministry of Word is perceived to have primacy among the *consueta ministeria* and that Ignatius and his companions stressed the importance of mobility in the exercise of the ministries. However, is there a theology associated with the Pauline model of the priesthood that would also provide a theological basis for the Jesuit priesthood?²¹³

In this chapter, we analyze the model of the Jesuit priesthood from the perspective of the Pauline sources. First, we will consider the historical context of Paul and draw similarities with the world in which Ignatius and the first Jesuits had lived in and the historical forces that had influenced their views of priestly ministry. Second, by examining the Pauline's corpus, we will

²¹³ Some considerations of the Jesuit priesthood, particularly from the "prophetic dimension" of Paul's ministry can be found in Buckley, "Jesuit Priesthood"; Annice Callahan, "The Society of Jesus: A Priestly Order," *The Way* 70 (1991): 114–124; Harmless, "Jesuits as Priests: Crisis and Charism."

attempt to extract a "Pauline model" of priesthood. We will examine the similarities between the "Pauline" and "Jesuit" priesthoods, particularly from the aspect of the ministry of the Word, and employing the works of Karl Rahner. Third, we will consider the theology embedded in Paul's "kenotic hymn" (Phil 2:6-11) to provide a theology framework for the priesthood in order to synthesize the different essential elements specific to the Jesuit priesthood, and those associated generally with the ministerial priesthood. We will do this based on the works of T.D. Herbert, Karl Barth, Hans Urs von Balthasar and Rahner.

Ignatius, the Jesuits and St. Paul

"Peter signifies the firmness and direction in our Society, and Paul signifies for us its ministry; and both of them, as the princes of the Church, profit us,"²¹⁴ says Jerome Nadal in reference to the apostolic nature of the Society of Jesus. The society's "stability" and "apostolic orientation" is expressed in their dedication to the pope, who is the successor of St. Peter. The Jesuit fourth vow of "obedience to the pope on matters regarding mission" is a clear articulation of this principle central to the society's understanding of its spiritual foundation of being "companions of Jesus" and participating is Christ's redemptive mission. For Jesuits, their service to Christ and the Church is invariably associated with the loyalty to the Holy Father, given that he is the Vicar of Christ and the leader of the universal Church, and this fact is clearly affirmed in the society's 1550 *Formula of the Institute*.²¹⁵

While the Petrine foundation of the society's apostolic spirituality is somewhat explicit in its founding formula and the *Constitutions*, through its strong relationship with the papacy and

²¹⁴ Quoted in John W O'Malley, "To Travel to Any Part of the World: Jerónimo Nadal and the Jesuit Vocation," *Studies in the spirituality of Jesuits* 16, no. 2 (1984): 13.Translated from "*Petrus firmitatem et directionem, Paulus nobis ministerium in Societate nostra significat, et adiuvat uterque ut Ecclesiae Princeps.*"

²¹⁵ Society of Jesus, "Formulas of the Institute," #1, 3.

the Apostolic See, its Pauline basis is less conspicuous and requires some explanation. As briefly discussed in the previous chapter, the society's missionary impetus was also founded on the first companions' vision of a universal mission, in service of the common good by going to any place with the greatest need. The society's mission field is therefore not geographically localized but spans the known world. Thus, a highly mobile and itinerant lifestyle is perhaps best suited to meet the demands of such a broad and inclusive understanding of mission and evangelization. Pertaining to the missionary ideals of the order contained within the special fourth vow, the Jesuit *Constitutions* states: "it should be observed that the vow which the Society made to obey him as the supreme vicar of Christ without any excuse meant that the members were to go to any place where he judges it expedient to send them for the greater glory of God and the good of souls, whether among the faithful or unbelievers."²¹⁶ For Nadal, who was the considered "an authentic interpreter of Ignatius' mind,"²¹⁷ the adjective "apostolic," used to describe the nature of the society, has a significant ecclesiological implication. "Apostolic," for him, is in reference to the primitive church, one that existed in the age of the Apostles and one that was certainly less institutionalized.²¹⁸ Thus, despite their loyalty to the institutional and hierarchical church, Ignatius and the early Jesuits also had an ecclesiological vision that was more akin to the one that of St. Paul, the great apostle St. Paul. There are certain parallels between the worlds in which St. Paul inhabited, and that of the early Jesuits in the early modern period. Due to the expanse of the Roman Empire, Paul encountered a diversity of people with very different religious and cultural backgrounds. As mentioned in the previous chapter, Ignatius and his companions, likewise, were

²¹⁶ Society of Jesus, *Constitutions*, #603, 276.

²¹⁷ O'Malley, "Jerónimo Nadal and the Jesuit Vocation," 3. O'Malley notes that Ignatius, in reference to appointing Nadal as his representive in the promulgation of the Constitutions, has stated that the younger Jesuit "knows my mind and enjoys the same authority as myself." ²¹⁸ Ibid., 7.

offered the opportunities to go to the far reaches of the world to bring the Gospel to non-Christians as the society was founded in the period of early European Imperialism.

Other than these "historical" similarities, the Jesuits also shared Paul's understanding of his identity as an apostle and his mission. The apostleship of St. Paul contained three main aspects: the traveling preacher, the community builder and the "suffering servant."²¹⁹ It was one directed at seeking new opportunities in bringing Christianity to the many ignorant of the Good News of Jesus, in initiating and cultivating new Christian communities, and all these services performed in imitation of Christ. Paul's itinerant lifestyle and his mission as a community builder are reflected in the letters he had written to the various communities he helped found across the Roman Empire and also in the Acts of the Apostles. Paul was also persecuted for his discipleship in the Lord and his missionary effort. As indicated in scripture, he was regularly put on trial and imprisoned.²²⁰ The great apostle believed that suffering was "one way of imitating Christ."²²¹ Likewise, according to the Formula of the Institute, Jesuits are dedicated to the proclamation of the Gospel through the ministry of the Word, not only as missionaries in foreign lands, but also to rejuvenate the faiths of Christians in Europe. Members of the Society of Jesus not only built new Christian communities in the colonies of the Americas and the distant nations of Asia, but also participated in the effort to restore Catholic communities in Europe especially in the face of the Protestant Reformation.²²² As discussed in chapter 2, due to their humanistic

²¹⁹ Michael J Gorman, *Apostle of the Crucified Lord: A Theological Introduction to Paul and His Letters* (Grand Rapids, MI: Eerdmans, 2004), 65.

²²⁰ Ibid., 70.

²²¹ Ibid.

²²² Society of Jesus, "Formulas of the Institute," #3, 6-7. The 1550 formula reads: "we have nevertheless judged it to be supremely profitable that each of us and any others who will make the profession in the future should, in addition to that ordinary bond of the three vows, be bound by this special vow to carry out whatever the present and future Roman pontiffs may order which pertains to the progress of souls and the propagation of the faith; and go at once ... to whatsoever provinces they may choose to send us –

background and their incarnational spirituality, there was also a strong civic and cultural dimension in the ministries of the early Jesuits. They operated schools, participated in the scientific enterprise and contributed to the arts as means to serve the common good of the people. The Jesuits' presence in the civic and cultural spheres continues to this day in their work in education, intellectual apostolates and social ministries. Thus, in all these ways Jesuits may be construed as builders of communities, both ecclesial and civil. There are a few clear indications that sharing in the suffering of Christ is an element of Jesuit identity. In the second week of the Spiritual Exercises, the exercitant, in a threefold colloquy, is directed to asked for the grace to choose poverty, to "suffer insults and reproaches," in imitation of Jesus Christ.²²³ This desire to emulate Christ in his suffering is also found in the Jesuit *Constitutions*. In the section pertaining to the General Examen for candidates seeking entry into the society, Ignatius insisted that the candidates should be asked whether they have "the desire to suffer injuries, false accusations, and affronts, and to be held and esteemed as fools ... because of their desire to resemble and imitate in some manner our Creator and Lord Jesus Christ."224 To be a Jesuit and "become a soldier of God under the banner of the cross,"²²⁵ consists of more than participating in Jesus' mission but also in imitating Christ, including the openness to be a "suffering servant" for the sake of the Gospel. Thus, Ignatius and members of the society understand their apostolic identity and mission in categories similar to those of Paul.

Despite Nadal's assertion that Ignatius and the early Jesuits drew inspiration from St. Paul, there is hardly any mentioned of the Pauline epistles in the foundational document of Ignatian Spirituality, the *Spiritual Exercises*. A perusal of the document shows that the only

whether they decide to send us among the Turks or any other infidels, even those who live in the regions called the Indies, or among any heretics whatever, or schismatics, or any of the faithful."

²²³ Saint Ignatius of Loyola, "Spiritual Exercises," #146-147, 311-312.

²²⁴ Society of Jesus, *Constitutions*, #101, 46.

²²⁵ Society of Jesus, "Formulas of the Institute," #1, 3.

Pauline epistle listed are three short references to Paul's *First Letter to the Corinthians* and relation to the resurrected Christ appearing to Saul of Tarsus.²²⁶ The dynamics of the exercises are fundamentally founded on the gospel narratives, where exercitants are invited to contemplate on the life and ministry of Jesus, and also the paschal mystery. It is therefore reasonable that the use of the Paul's writings is sparing in the *Spiritual Exercises*. There were perhaps socio-political factors that limited the explicit references to the Pauline letters in the spiritual cornerstone of the Jesuits. At the time of the writing of the *Exercises* and the founding of the Society of Jesus, Pauline theology of justification, grace and faith were generally associated with Martin Luther and the Protestant Reformation. Thus, to include Pauline text into writings considered to be the distillation of Ignatius' spirituality would certainly invite added scrutiny and opposition from various quarters of the Church. The approval and publication of the *Exercises* were at stake. Perhaps Ignatius also proceeded with added caution due his previous confrontation with the ecclesial authority that had questioned his orthodoxy. These were thus some of the possible reasons for the general omission of Pauline text in the *Spiritual Exercises*.²²⁷

However, Ignatius readily employed the writings of St. Paul in his correspondences with the people whom he ministered, and also in letters giving advice to his fellow Jesuits. For example, in his 1547 letter to the scholastics in Coimbra, Portugal, Ignatius mentions the epistles of the great apostle no less than eight times, referring to topics ranging from the Paul's eschatological hope to the his cruciform theology.²²⁸ Similarly, in his instructions to Jesuits

²²⁶ Saint Ignatius of Loyola, "Spiritual Exercises," #308-309, #311, 347.

²²⁷ Joseph A. Fitzmyer, *Spiritual Exercises Based on Paul's Epistle to the Romans* (New York, NY: Paulist Press, 1995), 3.

²²⁸ Saint Ignatius of Loyola, "Ideals for Newcomers." Encouraging the scholastics in Coimbra, Ignatius refers to Paul's eschatological hope and writes: "These present sufferings are not of the same rank as the future glory which is to be revealed in us (Rom 8:18), because this light and momentary affliction of ours brings about in us an eternal abundance of glory, far outweighing that affliction in sublimity (2 Cor 4:17)." In his advice against the "dangers of excesses," Ignatius also alludes to Paul's cruciform

working in the German territories, the first Jesuit general alluded to Paul's wholehearted dedication to the mission of Christ as a model for the members of the society to follow.²²⁹ While the *Spiritual Exercises* partly follows the structure of the Gospel narrative from the incarnation to the resurrection of Christ, Ignatius found the words and ideas of Paul effective in encouraging and guiding his men.

Perhaps another reference to the writings of St. Paul made by Ignatius is found in the "simple and perpetual" vows formula of the society. In making his first vows of "poverty, chastity and obedience," the professing Jesuit also adds a prayer to God stating: "Therefore I suppliantly beg your immense Goodness and Clemency, through the blood of Jesus Christ, to deign to receive this holocaust in an odor of sweetness; and that just as you gave me the grace to desire and offer this, so you will also bestow abundant grace to fulfill it."²³⁰ The cultic image of a burnt offering with a rising fragrant scent used in the vow formula is also found in more than one of St. Paul's letters. Paul has used a similar image in his letters to the *Philippians* (4:18), *Ephesians* (5:2), and his second letter to the *Corinthians* (2:15-16). The metaphor of the "holocaust" producing a pleasant aroma or odor is used by Paul either to describe Jesus' self-offering to God, or those who emulate Christ's sacrifice. For instance, to the Ephesians he writes: "[B]e imitators of God, as beloved children, and live in love, as Christ loved us and gave himself up for us, a fragrant offering and sacrifice to God." Ignatius has perhaps adopted Paul's metaphor for a similar purpose, which is to describe the self-offering of the vow-professing

Christology stating: "It sometimes happens that the 'crucifixion of our former nature' (Rom 6:6) ends up being the crucifixion of the new one as well, when weakness makes one incapable of actually living out the virtues.'

²²⁹ Saint Ignatius of Loyola, "Spreading God's Word in a German University." Ignatius instructs the Jesuits there to always remember that it is not "their interests but those of Jesus Christ" (Phil 2:21) that they serve, and that they should in "humility and charity" be "all things to all" (1 Cor 9:22) for the sake of the mission to save souls.

²³⁰ Society of Jesus, *Constitutions*, #540, 209-210. Interestingly, this prayer is glaringly absent from the final vows formulae (see #527, #532, #535).

Jesuit. The notion of a Jesuit imitating Christ, "the Eternal King,"²³¹ and "serving as a soldier beneath the banner of the cross,"²³² is reinforced in the employment of Paul's metaphor. Just as Jesus' sacrifice may be understood as a holocaust with a sweet aroma offered to God, Jesuits, in imitation of Christ, also aspire to do the same.

Ignatius' employment of Paul's instructions, spirituality and theology found in his epistles to instruct the then newly founded society, and the use of the apostle as a model for his men to follow, is understandable from a practical standpoint. As previously mentioned, due to the similarities between Paul's situation and that of the early Jesuits, there were also many similar pastoral questions arising from both milieus. Thus, advice offered by Paul may also help the fledgling religious order to address their concerns. However, from the analysis of the Jesuit simple vow formula, there is evidence to suggest that Ignatius' embraced of the Pauline model went beyond practical concerns. There appears to be commonality in the apostle's spirituality and theology, and that of the Basque saint.

The Pauline Priesthood

While Paul has used the metaphorical language and images of sacrifices in his writings, he has not explicitly made mention of priests, at least in the cultic sense, in the communities he corresponded with. So how does the great apostle understand the priesthood? In his letter the Romans, Paul referring to himself and his mission writes: "Nevertheless on some points I have written to you rather boldly by way of reminder, because of the grace given me by God to be a minister of Christ Jesus to the Gentiles in the priestly service of the gospel of God, so that the offering of the Gentiles may be acceptable, sanctified by the Holy Spirit" (15:15-16). The cultic language found in this passage is quite evident. The terms "minister" (leitourgon), "priest"

²³¹ Saint Ignatius of Loyola, "Spiritual Exercises," #98, 304.
²³² Society of Jesus, *Constitutions*, #1, 3.

(*hierourgounta*), and "an offering or the act of presenting and offering" (*prosphora*), found in these verses, not only make allusions the priesthood, but associate "making offerings" and "sanctifying" to works that do not usually carry cultic connotation.²³³ Paul's figurative use of cultic language in the passage was to communicate to his audience that he considered himself a priest, despite not performing the works generally associated with priests of the Old Testament. For the apostle from Tarsus, a "priest" is one missioned by Jesus Christ to serve and proclaim the Good News to the Gentiles.²³⁴

Even though Paul was referring to himself here, it is not unreasonable to assume that his understanding of the "priesthood" may be applied to others as well. After all, in his *Letter to the Philippians*, Paul refers to Epaphroditus, his "co-worker, brother, fellow-soldier," and messenger, also as a "priestly minister" or *leitourgos* (2:25).²³⁵ The community at Philippi had sent Epaphroditus to the incarcerated Paul with gifts and to tend to his needs, and in turn, Epaphroditus became the apostle's messenger carrying his letter back to the Philippians. The labels of "co-worker" and "fellow-soldier" are not merely monikers of praise offered by Paul to his messenger but describe how Paul saw Epaphroditus. Through the use of these terms, Paul acknowledged that the envoy from Philippi not only shared in his mission in service to Christ and his Gospel, but also shared in the sufferings that Paul endured.²³⁶ Thus, it is not inconceivable that others, like Epaphroditus, who are considered colleagues and "brethren-in-

²³³ James D. G. Dunn, *The Theology of Paul the Apostle* (Grand Rapids, MI: Eerdmans, 2006), 546.

²³⁴ The *Jerusalem Bible* (1966) renders passage (Rom 15:16) as: "He has appointed me as a priest of Jesus Christ, and I am to carry out my priestly duty by bringing the Good News from God to the pagans, and so make them acceptable as an offering, made holy by the Holy Spirit." This translation emphasizes that the term "*leitourgos*" denotes a ritual minister or a priest.

²³⁵ J. Paul Sampley, *Paul in the Greco-Roman World: A Handbook* (Harrisburg, PA: Trinity Press International, 2003), 119.

²³⁶ Ibid., 119–120.

arms" of Paul, and participate in the same evangelical endeavor, and suffer similar persecutions and trials, were also recognized as leitourgos.

If St. Paul understood the priesthood in terms of its functions and activities not in the conventional cultic sense, then did he also understand it differently from other perspectives? For instance, did he or did he not share the view that priests are "set apart" from the community and become members of an exclusive, "sacralized order," as discussed in the previous chapter? A certain interpretation of Paul's writings suggests that his understanding of the "priesthood" is that it was a non-exclusive role, opened to all Christians.²³⁷ The thrust of this argument is that in his Letter to the Romans, Paul calls for all Christians to offer their "bodies as a living sacrifice, holy and acceptable to God," as an expression of "spiritual worship"(12:1). Moreover, in the same epistle, Paul asserts that all Christians have "unmediated access to God" through Jesus Christ (5:2). Thus, these may be indications that in Paul's understanding there is no necessity for an exclusive group of "priestly mediators," either to offer ritual sacrifices or to provide other works in service to the Gospel as mentioned earlier. Furthermore, given that ecclesial communities founded by Paul were then still very new and had limited membership, it is quite possible that they lacked formal structures and functioned in an organized manner. Perhaps to oppose the hierarchal structures prevalent in Greco-Roman societies, Paul asserted that members of Christians community should be able to transcend their differences in terms of gender and ethnicity as "they have been all baptized into Christ" (Gal 3:25-29).²³⁸ Thus, taken together, it appears that there was a developed sense of equality in the Pauline communities, since all members can freely be ministers. In a way, this perspective, that "all ministry and service on

²³⁷ Dunn, *The Theology of Paul the Apostle*, 546.
²³⁸ Sampley, *Paul in the Greco-Roman World*, 495.

behalf of the gospel is a priestly ministry, which all believers could engaged in,"²³⁹ is similar to common priesthood or "priesthood of the people" that has been put forth by the Second Vatican Council²⁴⁰ and briefly mentioned in the previous chapter.

However, there is also strong evidence from Paul's epistles that even though the Christian communities he founded had a greater emphasis on "equality" than the societies founded upon Greco-Roman and Jewish cultures, he continued to assert the diversity of roles among members in order to the serve their respective communities. In his First Letter to the Corinthians, Paul makes it clear to the community in Corinth that the different gifts, talents, and honor each enjoy should not cause division but unite them in Christ, since each of them is a contributing member of the "Body of Christ," and working for the common good (12:4-26). Moreover, Paul refers to the various appointments in the Church, such as "apostles," "prophets," and "teachers" (12:28). These "office bearers" may also be considered as *leitourgos*, since they minister to the community. He then rhetorically asks whether all members can fulfill these roles, so as to remind the Corinthians that despite calling for unity and equality, these "special offices" were needed for the good of the church. Paul effectively affirms the necessity of the differentiation of roles, even in the small Christian community of Corinth. These words, therefore, are indication that even though Paul advocates an "egalitarian Church" in some regards, he recognizes the existence of some form of structure, and even maintains the necessity of the differentiation of roles to the serve the needs of the community.²⁴¹ Perhaps more importantly, Paul offers a resolution to the

²³⁹ Dunn, The Theology of Paul the Apostle, 546.

²⁴⁰ Second Vatican Council, "Lumen Gentium," #10, 360-361.

²⁴¹ Benedict M. Ashley, "The Priesthood of Christ, the Baptized, and the Ordained," in *The Theology of Priesthood*, ed. Donald J. Goergen and Ann Garrido (Collegeville, MN: Liturgical Press, 2017), loc. 3389. Ashley opines that Paul recognizes the necessity of a hierarchical ecclesial structure since he uses the analogy of the human body to describe the Church. Members blessed with different gifts are to use them to serve and build up the community. Ashley further adds that since the Church is the visible "Body

supposed tension between an "egalitarian" community, and one that has some form of "functional hierarchy." Again in his First Letter to the Corinthians, Paul writes:

On the contrary, the members of the body that seem to weaker are indispensible, and those members of the body that we think less honorable we clothe with greater honor, and our less respectable members are treated with greater respect; whereas our more respectable members do not need this. But God has so arranged the body, giving the greater honor to the inferior member, that there may be no dissension within the body. but the members may have the same care for one another. If one member suffers, all suffer together with it; if one member is honored, all rejoice together with it. (12:24-26)

Thus, it can be seen from Paul's letter that there was clearly some form of hierarchy in the community at Corinth, one that differentiates "more honorable" and "inferior" members. Noting the probable community tension that existed there, Paul has also advised them to show care and concern for one another, in order to preserve the harmony within the community. But how does the community give "greater honor to the inferior member" so as to maintain the sense of equality among its people? Paul reminded them that their fates are intertwined, and as a community, they would rejoice together, and likewise, also suffer together (12:26). This perspective opposes the notions of "self-sufficiency" and "gaining honor" prevalent not only in Greco-Roman societies in Paul's time, but also among the Jews.²⁴² Paul was calling for solidarity among the members of the community. Certainly his advice would apply to even the "more honorable office holders" in the church of Corinth. The *leitourgos* should understand that despite their official roles, they must always remember to live and act united with the greater community. On the one hand, their offices differentiated them from others in the community, but on the other hand, they should stand in solidarity with the others recognizing their shared

of Christ" and "active in mission in the world, its leaders must also sacramentally signify that priestly presence within the Church." ²⁴² Sampley, *Paul in the Greco-Roman World*, 557–558.

commitment and common destiny in Christ. Their ministerial offices should emphasize the services rendered to the community, rather than the honor associated with these positions.

While the term "leitourgos" is interpreted as "minister" or "priest," it also carries the more proper translation of "public servant" or "public official."²⁴³ Thus, a *leitourgos* is one who has been tasked to perform a particular public service for the community. For instance, Paul considered certain works of mercy and charity to be acts of *leitourgia*.²⁴⁴ as they were clearly works of and for the greater Christian community. However, more importantly, a *leitourgos* is not a "public official" simply because he or she does something for the benefit of the common good, but is someone who has been commissioned by the community to fill the role. From this perspective, a *leitourgos* or minister, cannot strictly be recognized and function as one unless he or she has been given the authority by the community. For example, Epaphroditus did not become Paul's assistant based on a personal decision, but had been "commissioned by the Christian community of Philippi."²⁴⁵ The notion that the ecclesial community should grant authority for one to be a minister of the church is further supported by St. Paul's own commission as the "Apostles to the Gentiles." Very early in his life as a missionary, Paul had maintained that his commission to proclaim the Gospel was given to him directly by Jesus Christ (Gal 1:11-12). On his first visit to Jerusalem, he met with Peter and James (Gal 1:18-19). The details of the meeting remains unknown, but Paul could have used the opportunity to learn more about Jesus and the traditions handed down to the apostles and first disciples from those who had

²⁴³ Ibid., 120. The Greek work "*leitourgia*" denotes "all kinds of public service" in the Greco-Roman world of Paul, and it is the origin of the term "liturgy." Therefore, liturgy is the "public works of the Church.

²⁴⁴ Dunn, *The Theology of Paul the Apostle*, 546. Paul refers to the offerings of the Christian communities in Rome (Rom 15:27) and Corinth (2 Cor 9:12) to help the poor in Jerusalem as "public works," or acts of *leitourgia*.

²⁴⁵ R. C. H. Lenski, *The Interpretation of St. Paul's Epistles to the Ephesians and Philippians* (Minneapolis, MN: Augsburg Fortress, 2008), 820.

lived and ministered with the Messiah.²⁴⁶ Fourteen years after his first visit, and following God's revelation, Paul returned there with Barnabas and Titus, possibly for the "Council of Jerusalem" to seek recognition of his missionary activities and his ministerial role, in order to counter the criticisms leveled against him by "false believers"²⁴⁷ (Gal 2:1-5). They had gone to the City of David, to confer with the "acknowledged pillars" of the Church, namely James, Peter, and John (Gal 2:9), so that the latter trio, as leaders of Church, would officially recognize their mission to the Gentiles "as the working of God's grace."²⁴⁸ While it was a private meeting (2:2), James, Peter, and John, as leaders, undoubtedly represented the greater Church in acknowledging Paul's authority and mission. Thus, in a way, Paul and his companions were there to ask the Church to commission them, or at the very least, affirm their divine commission, as ministers in service of the Gospel. Even though Paul maintained that he has been authorized by Christ to minister to the Gentiles, he may have come to a realization that he and his companions required recognition by the community of faith in order to hopefully to stem challenges to his ministerial authority and missionary methods. It is also reported in the Acts of the Apostles that "prophets and teachers," perhaps the leaders of the church in Antioch, had prayed and fasted, and prompted by the Holy Spirit, set apart Barnabas and Saul, and laid hands on them, commissioning them to minister to the people of Cyprus and Pisidia (13:13). Thus, the ideas and practice of "setting apart" and "commissioning" were not entirely alien to the early churches during Paul's time. Therefore, considering the aforementioned three characteristics together, a "Pauline priest" may be

²⁴⁶ Gorman, Apostle of the Crucified Lord, 198.

²⁴⁷ Ibid., 188–189. The "false believers" or "agitators" were likely Christians who opposed Paul's ministry with the Gentiles or some of the practices he had introduced to them, perhaps like those Paul mentions later in his *Letter to the Galatians*, who deemed Gentile converts unworthy to share a table and break bread with Jewish Christians and demanded Gentile converts be circumcised (2:11-14). ²⁴⁸ Ibid., 199.

understood as a "public minister" of Christ commissioned by the church, in order to serve the Christian community, in various capacities so as to follow Christ's edict to proclaim the Gospel.

The above analyses of Paul's epistles does not only provide us with a greater appreciation of his views on ministry and ecclesiology, but also offers us insights into the apostle's understanding of the priesthood. The inferences drawn from the analyses provide a set of possible attributes defining the "Pauline priesthood," beyond the vague of notions "apostolic" and "itinerant" generally associated with it. Moreover, this set of character traits forms a basis of comparison between the "Pauline priesthood" and the "Jesuit priesthood" presented in the previous two chapters. The first of these attributes is that, for Paul, a priest is a public minister serving the needs of the ecclesial community. Accordingly, the priesthood is not necessarily associated with any particular ministry, as long as the ministerial work is done in service to the Good News of Jesus. Likewise, Jesuits consider themselves "ministers of the Word," performing works "according to what will seem expedient for the glory of God and the common good."²⁴⁹ Notwithstanding their customary ministries, such as preaching, hearing confessions, giving retreats and ministering the sacraments, like Paul, Ignatius, his early companions and subsequent generations of Jesuits welcomed other works and ministries as legitimate means to serve Christians, rejuvenate the faith in the estranged, and introduce the Gospel to non-believers. Second, Paul possibly perceives an inherent tension within the role of a priest or minister. It is a special role differentiated from the other church members. However, Paul also subscribes to a rather egalitarian ecclesiology in which all members constitute and contribute to the "body" of the Christian community enjoy some semblance of equality. To resolve this tension, Paul suggests that priesthood and ministerships are offices of service and solidarity with the community, rather than positions primarily associated with power and honor. Ignatius of Loyola

²⁴⁹ Society of Jesus, "Formulas of the Institute," #1, 4.

and the early Jesuits shared a similar vision of the priesthood and ministry as Paul. As presented in chapter two, Ignatius lived in a milieu in which many felt alienated from the Church likely due to the "hyper-clericalized" culture. Therefore, perhaps as an antidote to such an environment, he not only demanded his men to reject positions of honor and live in humility, but also insisted that they be among the people, and serving their needs. However, Ignatius and his men continued to respect the authority of the Church hierarchy. While advocating a sense of personal freedom and equality in certain regards, he continued to demand one's obedience and respect for the ecclesial hierarchy and legitimate authority. Like St. Paul, Ignatius and his men acknowledged the importance of the differentiation of roles and church structure, and at the same time saw their priestly and ministerial roles as a calling to build up the "Body of Christ." Third, St. Paul understood a priest to be a "public minister" of the community, and therefore should rightfully be commissioned by the church. Obviously the notion and practice of sacramental ordination as we know it today may not have existed in Paul's milieu. However, the commissioning of ministers, at least in the most rudimentary way, was part of early church practices as Paul had experienced in Jerusalem (Gal 2:2) and Antioch (Acts 13:13). Commissioning was perhaps necessary, even then, to duly authorize officials of the church, and to offer them the credentials to fend off challenges from detractors and pretenders. Likewise, as discussed in chapter three, Ignatius saw the value and necessity of receiving "official sanction" in order to perform public ministry. Sacramental ordination provides the Jesuits with the required "ecclesiastical license" to function as ministers, and avoid the troubles Ignatius had faced with the Inquisition and the various church tribunals. It also offers them with the credibility and esteem that not only help them gain entry to prospective mission fields, but also open the hearts and minds of those whom they minister, so that they become more receptive to the Word of God. By placing themselves at the

disposal of the Holy Father, the Vicar of Christ on earth, the first Jesuits affirmed their call to serve to the Lord, but were also effectively seeking approval from the pope to minister, not only to a local community but to the Universal Church.

The above systematic comparisons show that there are certainly similar characteristics found in the "Pauline priesthood" and those associated with the "Jesuit priesthood." Both Paul and the Jesuits consider a priest as a minister of the Word, commissioned by the ecclesial community or Church, to proclaim the Gospel and serve the needs of the greater community.

A Rahnerian Reading of the Pauline and Jesuit Priesthoods

Acting as a messenger of God's word and servant of the Gospel, and being officially commissioned by the community, are not merely functional qualities of a priest, but arguably attributes associated with the heart of the priesthood. The "Pauline" and "Jesuit" model of the priesthood also corresponds to the one proposed by Jesuit theologian Karl Rahner.²⁵⁰ Indeed, Rahner, while not denying the cultic, sacramental and even leadership functions of the Catholic priesthood, with reference to Paul's writings, maintains that it is more importantly a "prophetic office," a "ministry of the Word."²⁵¹ Accordingly, a priest is called to continue Jesus' mission of

²⁵⁰ Karl Rahner, "The Point of Departure in Theology for Determining the Nature of the Priestly Office," in *Theological Investigations*, trans. Karl. H Kruger and Boniface Kruger, vol. 12 (New York, NY: Crossroad, 1974), 36. On the priesthood, Rahner writes: "The priest is the proclaimer of the word of God, officially commissioned and appointed as such by the Church as a whole in such a way that this word is entrusted to him in the supreme degree of sacramental intensity present in it. His work as proclaimer of the word is in this sense essentially directed towards the community (which is at least potentially in existence). To express the matter quite simply, he is the one sent by the Church to proclaim the gospel in her name."

²⁵¹ Karl Rahner, *The Priesthood*, trans. Edward Quinn (New York, NY: Seabury Press, 1973), 105. On the different Pauline terminologies in describing a priest, Rahner states: "He is an envoy, the representative of Christ and the Father, steward of the mysteries of God (1 Cor 4:1); he is the fellow-worker of God (1 Cor 3:9) [...] they are the heralds, the preachers of the word of God (Rom 15:16) [...] They preach the good news, by Christ's mandate, as his envoys (Eph 3:8). Their task is described as the ministry of the word. They are the dispensers of the sacraments (2 Cor 5:18)."

proclamation of God's presence in the world.²⁵² Rahner asserts that the "word" proclaimed by a priest is "efficacious" and "sacramental." By virtue of his "prophetic office," words spoken by a priest is unlike those of an author or theologian because he has been mandated to speak not his own words, but those belonging to God, in order to proclaim the "Word of God," Jesus Christ. The "word" conveyed by a priest is thus efficacious and sacramental because it announces the Lord's saving grace offered. The "word" expresses God's love that is freely given to all. Like the Jesuit and Pauline models, Rahner also understands "priest as minister of the Word" in an expanded sense of the term. Commenting on how a priest lives up to his role as prophet and "efficacious word" he has been entrusted to speak, Rahner writes: "But we have to speak him in many different ways. We cannot with all our words say him completely, although he has confided to us a multitude of words [...] We have to speak him into the undelimited dimensions of human existence, into all the heights and depths of our life."²⁵³ Rahner further adds that these "efficacious words" come in various concentrations depending on the situation and the mode of communication. For a Catholic priest, the most effective words are spoken within the context of the sacraments, especially the Eucharist in which the focus is entirely on the Lord, and the divine reality is communicated.²⁵⁴ However, it does not mean that this sacred word entrusted to a priest cannot be transmitted through other channels. As Rahner claims, not only should priests and ministers proclaim Christ "in many different ways," they should do so in ways that these words should penetrate all aspects of human life. The proclamation of the Good News must not be done in abstraction, but should be concrete and meaningful to the audience. Similarly, as presented in

²⁵² Karl Rahner, "Priest and Poet," in *Theological Investigations*, trans. Karl. H Kruger and Boniface Kruger, vol. 3 (New York, NY: Crossroad, 1982), 304, 307. In defining the "word which makes God present in the world as God," Rahner writes: "It cannot be gained from the world. It is an event. It must be spoken: through Christ and – through those whom he sends […] The efficacious word has been entrusted to the priest. To him has been given *the* word of God. That makes him a priest."

²⁵⁴ Ibid.

the chapter three, a Jesuit priest is one who proclaims the Word of God and brings Christ to others in various ways, such as through ministering of the sacraments, in giving the Spiritual *Exercises*, during spiritual conversations, and even in the day-to-day interactions in the various Jesuit ministries. For Jesuits, any opportunity to interact with others, is an opportunity for an encounter with the Lord. Jesuits consider themselves as ministers of consolation and reconciliation, because they see their mission as one involving bringing people closer to God in their given situation, helping them "find God in all things," and discover Jesus' presence in their lives. Rahner also asserts that a priest's cannot proclaim God's "truth and love" without official sanction by the Church, because after all, the Church is the sacrament of Jesus' presence in the world,²⁵⁵ and that God has promised that the Church never errs.²⁵⁶ Thus, a priest is not only commissioned by the Church to be an emissary bringing the love of Christ to the world, but his words and deeds are supported by the unerring and holy Church. Sacramentally speaking, even if the priest is sinful and unworthy, the message he brings to the people remains efficacious because it is done in the name of the Church.²⁵⁷ The flawed priest's words remain a channel through which God's truth and love are offered because he has been commissioned and backed the Church, and the Church is objectively and institutionally holy. However, Rahner also argues that despite the fact that "sacramentally," a priest's words remain "valid and efficacious" regardless of his personally virtue, he ought to be righteous, for it does not make sense that the Church is holy, but her members, especially the official ministers, are far from being virtuous. Rahner insists that if a priest is indeed acting properly as God's prophet, then his "entire

²⁵⁵ Second Vatican Council, "Lumen Gentium," #48, 407.

²⁵⁶ Rahner, "Priest and Poet," 311.

²⁵⁷ Ibid. Rahner writes: "But it overlooks the fact that the individual, perhaps sinful, priest always speaks and acts in the name of the Church. He always has the Church as a whole behind him."

existence and humanity" should be consumed by the word he preaches.²⁵⁸ Although a priest is an official minister of the Church, and he is "backed" by her authority and credibility, it does not exempt him from striving to live up to the ideals he preaches. But precisely due to the fact that he is a minister of the Church, and therefore also represents her, the sacrament of Jesus' presence, to the world, he must live up to the moral demands of is priesthood. It is not an additional requirement to live and act in an upright manner, but something which is in the nature of the office. Thus, it is a dissonant situation if in general, the priests, who are ministers most likely associated with the Church, do not live up to, or do not even strive to live up to the demands of their vocation, not only in terms of functions, but in all aspects of life. According to Rahner, there should be a unity of the "objective and subjective," "institutional and existential" holiness of the Church. Thus, a priest as proclaimer of the "word" ought to be holy, just as the Church is holy. As presented in chapter three, Ignatius was insistent that the men of the society were virtuous. One piece of early advice the first superior general had given the Flemish Jesuits regarding admission to the society is that the candidates are shown to have been living "upright lives."²⁵⁹ Moreover, as mentioned previously, the founders of the society demanded that members lead virtuous and exemplary lives not only as a means of self-perfection, but considered this one of the most important ways to "save souls." Likewise, Rahner also broached the question of whether a priest's mission to preach the Good News is "fruitful" if he cannot live up to the demands issued from his own mouth. In his discussion, he points to St. Paul's view on the ministry, and writes:

²⁵⁸ Ibid., 313.

²⁵⁹ Saint Ignatius of Loyola and Juan Alfonso de Polanco, "En Route to the Constitutions (from Rome, December 24, 1547)," in *Personal Writings: Reminiscences, Spiritual Diary, Select Letters Including the Text of The Spiritual Exercises*, trans. Philip Endean and Joseph A. Munitiz (London, UK: Penguin Books, 2004), #3, 196.

Paul does not think at all simply and primarily in terms of the objective administration of the sacraments: properly speaking, his thought is dominated by the proof of the dynamism of the Spirit, by his preaching, in which his whole person is existentially involved (2 Cor 4:2, Eph 3:7) and only because of this is not indeed authorized, but becomes credible for the person who is to hear it.²⁶⁰

Therefore, it appears that St. Paul and Rahner share in Ignatius' view of the importance of the minister's "existential holiness" because it has a bearing on his ministerial effectiveness. It is highly unlikely that a priest who does not live what he preaches can be successful in his prophetic endeavors. His behaviors, actions and public life are avenues through which Christ is proclaimed.

Kenosis: Drama, Sacrifice and Mediation

As discussed previously, Jesuits consider themselves priestly ministers of the Word. However, priesthood is more commonly understood from the cultic perspective – a priest is one who represents Jesus Christ in the offering of sacrifice. So how does one reconcile the two different notions of the priestly ministry? In this section, we will attempt to address this question based on St. Paul's "kenotic theology." In his detailed study of the relationship between the priesthood and kenosis, addressing the issues raised by Protestants pertaining to the sacramental priesthood and the ordained ministry, Protestant theologian T.D. Herbert also analyzed the association between sacrifice and encounter based on the works of Karl Barth, Hans Urs von Balthasar and others.

If vocation is a call to 'the kenosis of radical discipleship,' priesthood is the externalization of kenosis not as a pernicious sacrifice but as resurrection $\pi\lambda\eta\rho\delta\omega$. It announces that the divine-human *diastasis* has been overcome, 'God and man at table are sat down', both retain their identity but yet each can participate in the other. It does not

²⁶⁰ Rahner, *The Priesthood*, 112–113.

dissolve the *diastasis* but it demonstrates the Chalcedonian pattern whereby it is possible for the truly divine and the truly human to encounter one another, without confusion.²⁶¹

Basically, for Herbert, the priesthood involves an imitation of Christ in his kenosis, and through this the Gospel is also proclaimed. Thus, the notions of kenosis, sacrifice, mediation, and the priesthood are closely related. In this section, we will attempt to show that Herbert's ideas are echoed in Ignatian Spirituality, the Jesuit Constitution and the Jesuit priesthood.

The "kenotic hymn" presented by St. Paul in his *Letter to the Philippians* (2:6-11) is perhaps "one of the most well-known and studied texts" among his writings,²⁶² revealing his understand of the person of Jesus Christ. In *Philippians*, Paul, referring to Jesus Christ and following the motif of the suffering servant hymn of the Prophet Isaiah (Isa 52:13-53:12),²⁶³, writes:

[T]hough he was in the form of God, did not regard equality with God, as something to be exploited, but emptied himself, taking the form of a slave, being born in human likeness. And being found in human form, he humbled himself and became obedient to the point of death – even death on a cross. (Phil 2:6-8)

Paul's hymn makes clear allusion to the central paschal mysteries, namely, Jesus' humiliation, suffering and death on the cross. The passage also affirms one of the central mysteries of the Christian faith – the Incarnation. Paul's passage is usually known as the "kenotic hymn" because the term "to empty oneself" or "self-emptying" is the rendering of the Greek word "kenosis" ($\kappa \epsilon v o \omega$). The hymn thus has important Christological and soteriological implications. Some early Church fathers, in their exegeses and commentaries on Paul's hymn, have used it to consider and theologize on Jesus' humility and sacrifice, and affirm the Chalcedonian Christological

²⁶¹ T. D. Herbert, *Kenosis and Priesthood: Towards a Protestant Re-Evaluation of the Ordained Ministry*, Patermoster Theological Monographs (Eugene, OR: Wipf and Stock Publishers, 2008), 268.

²⁶² Gorman, *Apostle of the Crucified Lord*, 412.

²⁶³ Ibid., 422.

definition.²⁶⁴ The fundamental problem "kenotic theologians" generally consider and attempt to address is "how the Christ, the Second Person of the Godhead, the Divine Logos, could have emptied himself and taken human form? In the nineteenth century, the theological discourse on this topic started focusing on God's by renouncing of the "divine attributes," such as infiniteness and omnipotence, because such traits do not properly belong to humanity.²⁶⁵ However, the crux of the problem is that even with Christ's voluntary self-limitation in assuming the human condition, he continued to remain fully divine. Perhaps one approach to resolving this conundrum is to reconsider the meaning the "self-emptying." Protestant theologian Karl Barth asserts that it does not entail Jesus being dispossessed of certain divine attributes in order to become a human person.²⁶⁶ Kenosis is an act of grace making it possible for authentic encounter between God and humanity through the person of Jesus. Barth maintains that the kenosis is an "intra-Trinitarian event" beyond human comprehension, that has been communicated to humanity through the person of Jesus as "self-sacrifice and self-emptying." As an "intra-Trinitarian event," then it must be proper to God's nature, but communicated to us through the obedience, humility and radical altruism of Jesus. It is a dialectical solution to the question of God's immutability and God's act of self-emptying. Thus, the "kenotic language becomes the means by which it is possible to represent that which cannot be said."²⁶⁷ Jesus' kenosis is

²⁶⁴ For example, Gregory of Nyssa, in *Against Eunomius*, writes: "The Word who appeared in the flesh was the same as the Word that was with God. But the earthly flesh he assumed was not the same as the Godhead until this too was changed into Godhead, so that necessarily come attributes belonged to God the Word, others to the form of a slave." Quoted in Mark J. Edwards and Thomas C. Oden, eds., *Galatians, Ephesians, Philippians*, Ancient Christian Commentary on Scripture - New Testament VIII (Downers Grove, IL: Inter Varsity Press, 2005), 234.

²⁶⁵ David R. Law, "Kenotic Christology," in *The Blackwell Companion to Nineteenth-Century Theology*, ed. David Fergusson, Blackwell companions to religion (Chichester, UK. ; Malden, MA: Wiley-Blackwell, 2010), 257. The theologian engaging in kenotic theology very early in the nineteenth century is Gottfried Thomasius.

²⁶⁶ Karl Barth, *The Church Dogmatics*, ed. Geoffrey William Bromiley and Thomas Forsyth Torrance, trans. Geoffrey William Bromiley, vol. 4 (Edinburgh, UK: T & T Clark, 1956), 178.
²⁶⁷ Herbert, *Kenosis and Priesthood*, 54.

revelatory in that our understanding of it informs us of God and who God is to us. Jesus Christ's willingness to become human, and endure humiliation, suffering and death, also reveal to humanity insights into the Divine mystery. Rahner shares the same view, writing:

But when the Word becomes man, his humanity is not prior. It is something that comes to be and is constituted in essence and existence when and in so far as the Logos empties himself. This man is, as such, the self-utterance of God in its self-emptying, because God expresses *himself* when he empties himself. He proclaims *himself* as love when he hides the majesty of this love and shows himself in the ordinary way of men.²⁶⁸

Like Barth, Rahner maintains the immutability of God, even though God has taken on human form existing in history, by offering a dialectical answer: "The mystery of the Incarnation must be in God himself, and precisely in the fact that, although he is immutable in and of himself, he *himself* can become something in another."²⁶⁹ Just as important, it is through Jesus' self-sacrifice and self-emptying, God's boundless love and who is love, are communicated to humanity and creation. Thus, in God's self-emptying lies the locus of encounter between Jesus and humanity.

While we generally associate Jesus' sacrifice with the betrayal and torment he had to suffer that led to his death, Paul's hymn perhaps offers a more nuanced and expanded understanding of Christ's sacrifice. The brief narrative of the hymn does not focus merely on the events associated with the Paschal Mystery but begins with the incarnation of Christ. Out of obedience to the Father, Jesus Christ, the Second Person of the Godhead, took on human form to complete God's salvific plan in order to redeem humanity from their fallen state. In a way, this mirrors the movement of the *Spiritual Exercises*, in which the exercitant is asked to contemplate on the life and mission of Christ, starting with the "Contemplation on the Incarnation."²⁷⁰ Even

²⁶⁸ Karl Rahner, "On the Theology of the Incarnation," in *A Rahner Reader*, ed. Gerard A. McCool (New York, NY: Crossroad, 1975), 152.

²⁶⁹ Karl Rahner, *Foundations of Christian Faith: An Introduction to the Idea of Christianity*, trans. William V. Dych (New York, NY: Crossroad, 1985), 221.

²⁷⁰ Saint Ignatius of Loyola, "Spiritual Exercises," #101-109, 305-306. In the "Contemplation of the Incarnation," the exercitant is asked to first consider the Holy Trinity looking down upon the state of the

though Catholic tradition holds that humanity's salvation rests on Jesus' sacrifice on the cross and also the events associated with the Paschal Mystery, it is arguable that Jesus' sacrifice may have started even earlier. Rahner, analyzing the Spiritual Exercises, commenting of the event of Annunciation, and alluding the Paul's hymn writes:

But the scandalous character of the Incarnation begins with this announcement: From now on, we find glory in humiliation, fullness in emptiness, riches in poverty, life in death. This is what St. Paul means when, speaking of the Incarnation, he says that the Word came in the flesh of sin, under the law, in the form of a slave, and under the power of death. His failure and agony begin already when He is received by Mary. At that moment, the descent and the kenosis truly begin for him.²⁷¹

Likewise, Hans Urs von Balthasar argues that while the events associated with Christ's passion have great significance in Christ's redemptive mission, we should also consider it as but a single phase in "different phases in in the continuity of a single drama of salvation."²⁷² Thus, Christ's incarnation, and his earthly ministerial activities, proclaiming the "Kingdom of God" were not superfluous but part of God's economy of salvation. God who is infinite and transcendent has freely chosen to become finite and immanent in order communicate with humanity and for human beings to encounter him. And within the limitations of our epistemic capabilities, the divine sharing in our humanity is understood as sacrifice – not only as an act of sacrifice, but part of a greater "kenotic drama" of sacrifice. As summarized in Paul's hymn, Jesus had sacrificed himself in that he obeyed God the Father, to assume human form and be sent to live among humans, experienced the human condition, and to suffer and die for the redemption of humankind. Humanity's experiences and understanding of the incarnated Jesus are revelatory, and therefore also expiatory as it bridges the divine-human divide. In other words, Jesus' earthly

world and decides to "bring about the redemption of the human race" through the incarnation of the Divine Word."

²⁷¹ Karl Rahner, *Spiritual Exercises*, trans. Kenneth Baker (New York, NY: Herder and Herder, 1965), 143.

²⁷² Hans Urs von Balthasar, *Mysterium Paschale: The Mystery of Easter*, trans. Aidan Nichols (San Francisco, CA: Ignatius Press, 1990), loc. 475; Herbert, *Kenosis and Priesthood*, 62.

mission in proclaiming the Good News, in his public ministry and in offering encounters between God and humanity are kenotic, and also sacrificial and mediatory.

Other than a statement with Christological import, Paul's kenotic hymn is also a set of ethical instructions. Paul calls on the Philippians to "look beyond their self-interests, but of others," and advising them to imitate Jesus (2:4-5), and then directing them to the hymn. But how does one imitate Christ in this regard? In other words, "what is human kenosis?" From his analysis of *Philippians*, based on the works of Barth and Balthasar, Herbert argues that the epistle itself is a "mimetic narrative of priestly identity."²⁷³ He opines that in his letter, the apostle Paul is encouraging the members of the church in Philippi to be "Christ-like" by emulating Jesus' obedience to God the Father. In other words, for Herbert, "human kenosis" entails imitation of Christ in representing the "kenotic drama," not in exactly the same way, but analogically. Herbert was careful to point out that the sacrifice associated with "human kenosis" is a "non-pernicious sacrifice" that expresses gratitude to God and responsive to God's grace, and by so doing, also announces to others of redemptive offer.²⁷⁴ More importantly, he makes the assertion that "kenosis provides an analogy for the priesthood" because it is related to mediation between the divine and humanity, is analogous to "sacrifice, and thus serve as a way to identify oneself with Christ.²⁷⁵ Paul points to himself as an example of obedience to the will of God in his ministerial endeavors, in preaching the Good News.²⁷⁶ His submission to the divine to serve the mission is thus an act analogous to "sacrifice." God is revealed to others through Paul's love for Jesus through his dedication in following his vocation as an apostle of Christ and obeying his

²⁷³ Herbert, *Kenosis and Priesthood*, 101–103.

²⁷⁴ Ibid., 265, 268.

²⁷⁵ Ibid., 103.

²⁷⁶ Ibid., 102. Herbert writes: "As Christ gives himself for others, so Paul gives himself for Christ in the gospel. Here Paul traces in his own ministry a resemblance to the kenosis of Christ but does so explicitly in priestly terms."

missionary command. Thus, by using cultic language to describe his ministry in *Philippians* and his other letters, Paul has provided an alternative understanding of the priesthood: a priest is one who imitates Jesus Christ, not in the exact manner, but by living out the "kenotic drama" that involves acts of obedience, sacrifice and being missioned.

Herbert's proposition pertaining to the priesthood and its relationship to kenosis is also reflected in Ignatian and Jesuit Spirituality. It has been suggested that the "kenotic attitude" of "self-emptying" is also found in the Spiritual Exercises.²⁷⁷ The primary objective of the exercises is "the overcoming of self and the ordering of one's life on the basis of a decision made in freedom from any ill-ordered attachment."²⁷⁸ From an Ignatian perspective, one's life is rightly ordered if it is directed towards God, in God's praise and service. Also, a "disordered life" is one that is disproportionately focused on needs of the self. The process of the exercises, through a series of prayers and reflections, facilitates one to gradually shed these "ill-ordered attachments" and grow in knowledge and intimacy of Jesus including the trials and tribulations he faced, so as to imitate Jesus.²⁷⁹ Christ has provided humanity with the perfect model to follow (1 Peter 2:21), as his earthly life and deeds were fully dedicated to the will of God, the Father (John 6:38). The Spiritual Exercises invites the exercitant to imaginatively enter into and share in Christ's "kenotic drama" in a retreat setting, following the life of Jesus from the Incarnation until his resurrection. On successful completion of the exercises, the exercitant should have experienced a conversion process and increased his or her identification with Christ. Humility, and material and

²⁷⁷ Ingvild Røsok, "Unconditional Surrender and Love: How Spirituality Illuminates the Theology of Karl Rahner," *The Way* 50, no. 4 (2011): 125.

²⁷⁸ Saint Ignatius of Loyola, "Spiritual Exercises," #21, 289.

²⁷⁹ Ibid., #167, 315. In the meditation on the "Three kinds of humility," Ignatius, noting the "most perfect kind of humility," writes: "[I]n order to imitate Christ Our Lord and to be actually more like him, I want and choose poverty with Christ poor rather than wealth, and ignominy with Christ in great ignominy rather than fame, and I desire more to be thought a fool and an idiot for Christ, who first was taken to be such, rather than to be thought wise and prudent in this world."

spiritual poverty, are some of the fruits of the conversion. The dynamics of the Spiritual *Exercises* lead the exercitant to accept the grace and nurture the desire to be able to share in Jesus' cross and suffer the humiliation and poverty that Christ had endured. In other words, one is called to imbue oneself with the kenotic attitudes such as poverty and humility, and to follow Jesus by emulating in his kenotic acts. However, these "self-emptying" acts are supported by the more fundamental attitude of freedom - of "radically surrendering" oneself to God.²⁸⁰ This attitude is known Ignatian indifference, or "self-abnegation," two terms that have long been associated with Ignatian Spirituality and the Society of Jesus.²⁸¹ It is concretely expressed in that whatever choices one makes, it is ultimately to follow and do God's will. Just as Jesus in his humility and obedience, had followed God's will even unto suffering and death, a similar attitude and actions are expected from one who is completely possessed by God. Rahner also considers this as the attitude of "abandonment of oneself to the mystery of God."²⁸² From this perspective, human kenosis involves the faithful imitation of Jesus, and "self-emptying" is understood as "giving over of the self" to the other out of love. A person who has reached this level of "interior freedom" places his or her entire person at God's disposal.

Ignatius demanded his men to be instilled with the attitude of "Ignatian indifference" or "self-abnegation" so that they have the "interior freedom and availability" necessary to be sent on mission.²⁸³ As ministers of the Word, Jesuits' priestly mission is in proclaiming God's Kingdom, in representing the Church and facilitating others in encountering the Lord. The Jesuit

²⁸⁰ Røsok, "Unconditional Surrender and Love," 124.

²⁸¹ Saint Ignatius of Loyola, "Spiritual Exercises," #23, 289; Richard J. Baumann, "Our Jesuit Constitutions: Cooperation as Union," *Studies in the spirituality of Jesuits* 49, no. 4 (2017): 30.

²⁸² Rahner, *Foundations of Christian Faith: An Introduction to the Idea of Christianity*, 217; Røsok, "Unconditional Surrender and Love," 123. Writing on the incarnation, Rahner asserts: "It is its very *meaning*, and not just an accidental side activity which it could also do without, to be given away and to be handed over, to be that being who realizes himself and finds himself by losing himself once and for all in the incomprehensible."

²⁸³ Baumann, "Our Jesuit Constitutions," 31.

Constitution instructs novices and those in formation to "try and desire to give the advantage to the others, esteeming them all in their hearts as if they were their superiors [Phil 2:3]," and "to strive to recognize in the other as in his image."²⁸⁴ Such practices of self-denial are not mere exercises of asceticism but a way to gradually gain the interior freedom required to be Christlike, and to share and participate in the mission. Just as Jesus lovingly surrendered to God the Father, a Jesuit is called to imitate the Lord in participating in a similar "kenotic drama." As St. Paul has recounted in Philippians, a Jesuit is called to emulate Christ in his life, ministry and passion, not exactly in the same way, but only in a mimetic fashion, expressed by the key movements in drama, namely obedience, sacrifice and being sent forth for mission. Thus, he does so by surrendering his will to God by obeying the instructions of his superior, in order to be sent on mission to proclaim the Gospel. This ideal is reflected in the society's special fourth vow to the Holy Father, who is the Vicar of Christ on earth, as mentioned in the previous chapter. Moreover, a Jesuit also lives out his kenotic attitude through the practice of "account of conscience," in which he is obliged to be honest and transparent with his superior on all matters, so as to assist in the discernment process in regards to the missioning of the Jesuit. Jesus "humbled and emptied himself" to be incarnated for the salvific mission and to announce God's loving message. The Second Divine Person became a man and inserted himself into the human milieu to intimately reveal God to the world. Jesus took human form so that mediation between God and humanity could occur. Like Jesus, who had entered into the created world so that humanity could encounter him, and through him God, Jesuits also see the necessity of entering the milieu of the others to meet them where they are, in order to bring the Word of God to them. In advising two Portuguese Jesuits who were unwilling undertake a ministry for fear of their personal safety, Ignatius sternly writes:

²⁸⁴ Society of Jesus, *Constitutions*, #250, 112.

Obviously if our religious profession had no other purpose but to ensure our security, and if we were supposed to subordinate the good we do to keeping clear of danger, then we would not have to live among people and have contact with them. But according to our vocation, we have contact with everyone. As St. Paul said, 'We ought to become all things to all people, so that we may gain all in Christ'. If we go about with our intention upright and pure, 'seeking not our own gain but that of Christ', then Christ Himself will look after us in His infinite goodness.²⁸⁵

Here, Ignatius refers to Paul's reminder to the members of the Corinth church of his uncompromising dedication to his God-given mission by sacrificing his rights and privileges as an apostle, and allowing himself to "be a slave to all so as to win more of them" (9:1-23). Ignatius was thus insisting that Jesuits be imbued with this same spirit. This is evidence that for Ignatius, self-abnegation as practiced by Jesuits is for the purpose of mission of engaging others to make Christ present to them. . Perhaps Paul also understood that the liberty accompanying such sacrifices and humility, is also the freedom that allowed him to be able to accommodate himself to "Jews, gentiles and the weak." In other words, his kenotic attitude permitted him to meet people where they were so that he could preach the Good News to them more effectively. Similarly, a Jesuit is called to empty himself in order to be "all things to all people" to facilitate evangelization. As previously discussed, ordained members of the society do not restrict themselves strictly to sacramental ministries, but consider all forms of ministry, such as education, intellectual apostolates and their involvements with the arts, as loci of engagement, providing opportunities for their missionary endeavors. Thus, following the "kenotic model" of the priesthood, Jesuits ideally offer sacrifices through self-abnegation and radical obedience to the will of God, and allow themselves to serve in any capacity and to be placed anywhere, in order to share in Christ's mission and help others encounter Jesus.

²⁸⁵ Saint Ignatius of Loyola, "Agreeing to Be Royal Confessors (from Rome, February 1, 1553)," in *Personal Writings: Reminiscences, Spiritual Diary, Select Letters Including the Text of The Spiritual Exercises*, trans. Philip Endean and Joseph A. Munitiz (London, UK: Penguin Books, 2004), #4, 249.

Jesuit Priesthood: Self-Abnegation and Encounter

In this chapter, we have considered the Jesuit priesthood through the lens of the letters of St. Paul and the theology implicit in his writings. We examined the influence of St. Paul the apostle on Ignatius of Loyola and the Society of Jesus by revisiting the Spiritual Exercises, the foundational document of Ignatian Spirituality, the Jesuit *Constitutions*, and other writings of Ignatius. Ignatius and the early society drew inspiration from Paul's approach to ministry and the priesthood possibly due to the similarities in their environments. The apostle ministered to gentiles, many who were unfamiliar with the monotheistic God of Israel and Jesus Christ. Likewise, Ignatius and the early Jesuits lived in the era of exploration and European expansion, and saw their calling to evangelize the foreign lands and the New World. Jesuits understand themselves as priestly minister of the Word. Thus, following the example of St. Paul, Jesuits see themselves as itinerant preachers and missionaries, working at the peripheries of the Church. While the Pauline churches have very rudimentary institutional structures, the apostle acknowledged the necessity for public recognition of ecclesial ministers. Likewise, while the Society of Jesus consider itself a missionary order, Jesuit priests maintain that ordination and ecclesial recognition are important to give credibility to their mission. Paul's "kenotic theology" provides another way of understanding the Jesuit priest, bridging its more apostolic orientation with the more general cultic notion of priesthood. From this perspective, a priest is one who is asked to imitate Christ in his kenosis in an analogical way. We suggest that "human kenosis" consists of following Jesus by concrete expressions of obedience, sacrifice and mission. Thus, for a Jesuit priest, this is performed in his companionship with and emulation of Jesus Christ in his radical obedience to God, who acts through their superiors, and in sacrificing his own will for the sake of continuing Jesus' evangelical mission of encounter. Thus, following St. Paul who is

willing to empty himself and make himself "a slave to all," to "become a Jew to win Jews, to become gentiles to win gentiles, to become weak to win the weak, and to become all things to all people," (1 Cor 9:19-22) in order to help others experience Jesus Christ.

CHAPTER 5 CONCLUSION

What is the Jesuit priesthood? One major difficulty in addressing this question of identity is that the Society of Jesus effectively has two identities: it is both a religious institute and an order of priest. Its identity must therefore not only reflect its religious character, but it must be harmonized with its priestly identity. Perhaps a straightforward, albeit disingenious answer, is simply to place the traits associated with society's religious heritage side-by-side with its priestly character. But this is certainly not an integrated approach. Moreover, even with an acceptable and integrated model of the Jesuit priesthood, it must also be supported theologically. This thesis addresses the question regarding the priestly identity of the Society of Jesus, by offering a model synthesizing elements from its religious identity, and character traits generally associated with the priesthood. A theological basis of the Jesuit priesthood, based on St. Paul's theology, is also provided.

The Jesuit priesthood is a "priesthood of encounter." The founding of the Society of Jesus coincided with the advent of modernity, the "age of discovery," and also the period of the Protestant Reformation. Although it was a time in which the Church's authority was challenged by the reformers, it was also a period she was offered opportunities to extend her influence over the "New World." Emulating the other orders of reformed priests prevalent at the time of the society's founding, the first Jesuits were dedicated to "reconciling the estranged." Likewise, they saw themselves as missionaries in order to evangelize uncharted territories and re-evangelize those who had become tepid in their faith. The wide variety of ministries and works Jesuit engage in, are directed towards their evangelization and reconciliation effort. They were, thus, ministers of the word, because by proclaiming the word through different channels, they brought Jesus, the living Word, to others. Members of the society facilitated the divine-human encounter.

While Jesus Christ remains the only mediator, Jesuits, through their ministries and as companions of Jesus, are facilitators of that mediation. Although the ministerial priesthood is generally associated with the celebration of the Eucharistic sacrifice and other sacraments, a priest is also a minister of Christ's mission of mediating between humanity and the divine. Thus, the Jesuit priesthood is a priesthood of the "word," "mediation" and "encounter."

Certain qualities, strongly associated with the charism and spirituality of the Society of Jesus, also define the Jesuit priesthood. St. Ignatius of Loyola constantly emphasized the importance of humility, not only in the way Jesuits lived, but also in how they exercised their ministries. It was perhaps the arrogance entrenched in the "hyper-clerical" church culture that estranged many and led to the Protestant Reformation. Thus, the first general insisted that his men practised humility, exercising spiritual and material poverty, placing their trust in God's providence, and living and working with the poorest and weakest, not only as a means for selfperfection, but also as a way to edify others and draw them back to the faith. Another essential characteristic of Jesuits and their expression of the priesthood is "obedience." Perhaps reacting to the anti-ecclesial sentiments of their time, Ignatius and his men stressed the importance of "obedience." Jesuits are called to follow the will of God by obeying their superiors. Thus, they serve as models to others in building and maintaining solidarity in the Church. As men imbued with the missionary spirit, they are expected to accept directives from their superiors readily. This is reflected in the Jesuits' fourth vow of obedience to the Holy Father on matters of mission. Therefore, the qualities of "humility" and "obedience" espoused and lived by men of the society, are not only for self-perfection, but also in serving their mission in bringing the Word to the world, and in exercising their "priesthood of encounter."

The writings of St. Paul provide a scriptural basis and theological framework in synthesizing the elements of the Jesuit priesthood. The ministerial priesthood is usually associated with cultic worship and sacramental services, in particular the Eucharistic sacrifice. However, based on Paul's epistles, a "priestly minister" is one who is duly authorized by the Church to serve the Gospel and building up the Body Christ and God's kingdom, and not necssarily performing duties related to cultic worship. Paul's expanded notion of the priestly ministry is similar to the understanding of the priesthood in the Society of Jesus. Jesuit priests are ordained ministers of the Church who work in a variety of ministries to the proclaim the Word, build community and help people encounter God. Paul maintains the relationship between the priesthood and sacrifice, but he offers a different interpretation of the latter. The apostle refers to himself as a model of a "priestly minister," willingly sacrificing security, comfort and even his life, for the sake of the gospel. The notion of priestly sacrifice is not limited to the celebration of the Eucharist in persona Christi capitis or alter Christus, but understood as the offering of oneself in the service and imitation of Christ, and sharing and continuing the Lord's evangelical and salvific mission. From this perspective, Jesus' sacrifice is not limited only to the events associated with his betrayal, suffering and death on the cross. The Christology of "kenosis," found in Paul's Letter to the Philippians, offers a theological framework supporting this understanding of Jesus' sacrifice. Accordingly, Jesus, the second person of the Holy Trinity, in obedience to God the Father, humbly "emptied himself," to take on human form, in order to save humanity and the world. The infinite has chosen to take on the finitude of a creature, and then experiencing the vagarues of life like a creature. Jesus' "kenosis" or "self-emptying," is in itself, a great sacrifice. Thus, his incarnation, his life among the people and his mission in teaching, healing and preaching the Good News, may be considered parts of that sacrifice. Using

"kenosis" as the theological basis, "humility," "obedience," and "mission," essential qualities of the Society of Jesus, are synthesized with the notion of "sacrifice" that is fundamental to the priesthood. Thus, the Jesuit priesthood follows the same Pauline model of the priesthood, and founded on kenotic theology. A Jesuit priest is not only an ordained and authorized minister of the Church, and companion of Jesus, but is also called to emulate Christ in "kenosis," and share in his mission. Ideally, he lives out his priesthood in imitation of the radical obedience of Christ to the will of Father, offering himself to the Lord, willingly sacrificing "his liberty, memory, understanding, entire will, and all his possessions," for the sake of continuing the Lord's mission of proclaiming the Gospel and saving souls. In emulating Jesus who had in humility accepted his role in God's plan of salvation, a Jesuit priest also humbly accepts his mission, whatever it may be, to help bring people closer to God. Following the example of Jesus, who befriended and helped sinners, the marginalized, the poor, the sick, pagans and gentiles, a priest of the society should be willing to go meet people where they are, in order to minister to them. Just as Christ's sacrifice is revelatory and communicates the love of God to the world, a Jesuit priest's sacrifice for his mission should, likewise facilitate the divine-human encounter.

BIBLIOGRAPHY

- Adams, Abigail, John Adams, and Thomas Jefferson. *The Adams-Jefferson Letters: The Complete Correspondence Between Thomas Jefferson and Abigail and John Adams*. Edited by Lester J. Cappon. Chapel Hill, NC: University of North Carolina Press, 2012.
- Aquinas, Thomas. *Summa Contra Gentiles, Book IV*. Translated by Charles J. O'Neil. Notre Dame, IN: Univ. of Notre Dame Press, 1975.
- *——. Summa Theologiae.* Translated by Fathers of the English Dominican Province. Benzinger Bros. (Online)., 1947. http://dhspriory.org/thomas/english/summa/index.html.
- Aristotle. *On rhetoric: a theory of civic discourse*. Translated by George A Kennedy. New York, NY: Oxford University Press, 1991.
- Ashley, Benedict M. "The Priesthood of Christ, the Baptized, and the Ordained." In *The Theology of Priesthood*, edited by Donald J. Goergen and Ann Garrido. Collegeville, MN: Liturgical Press, 2017.
- Balthasar, Hans Urs von. *Mysterium Paschale: The Mystery of Easter*. Translated by Aidan Nichols. San Francisco, CA: Ignatius Press, 1990.
- Barry, William A., and Robert G. Doherty. *Contemplatives in Action: The Jesuit Way*. New York, NY: Paulist Press, 2002.
- Barth, Karl. *The Church Dogmatics*. Edited by Geoffrey William Bromiley and Thomas Forsyth Torrance. Translated by Geoffrey William Bromiley. Vol. 4. Edinburgh, UK: T & T Clark, 1956.
- Baumann, Richard J. "Our Jesuit Constitutions: Cooperation as Union." *Studies in the Spirituality of Jesuits* 49, no. 4 (2017): 1–39.
- Brodrick, James. Saint Ignatius Loyola: The Pilgrim Years, 1491-1538. San Francisco, CA: Ignatius Press, 1998.
- Buckley, Michael J. "Jesuit Priesthood: Its Meaning and Commitments." *Studies in the Spirituality of Jesuits* 8, no. 5 (1976): 135–68.
 - —. "'Likewise You Are Priests …': Some Reflections on Jesuit Priesthood." In Spirit, Style, Story: Essays Honoring John W. Padberg, edited by Thomas M. Lucas, 3–32. Chicago, IL: Loyola Press, 2002.
- Callahan, Annice. "The Society of Jesus: A Priestly Order." The Way 70 (1991): 114-24.
- Cameron, Euan. *The European Reformation*. 2nd ed. Oxford, UK: Oxford University Press, 2012.
- Catholic Church. Catechism of the Catholic Church. London, UK: Geoffrey Chapman, 1994.
- Cicero, Marcus Tullius. *De oratore. Books I-II*. Translated by E. W Sutton. Cambridge, MA: Harvard University Press, 1948.
- Coupeau, J. Carlos. From Inspiration to Invention: Rhetoric in the Constitutions of the Society of Jesus. St. Louis, MO: Institute of Jesuit Sources, 2010.
- DeMolen, Richard L. "Preface." In *Religious Orders of the Catholic Reformation: In Honor of John C. Olin on His Seventy-Fifth Birthday*, edited by Richard L. DeMolen, xi–xix. New York, NY: Fordham University Press, 1994.
 - ———. "The First Centenary of the Barnabites (1533-1633)." In *Religious Orders of the Catholic Reformation: In Honor of John C. Olin on His Seventy-Fifth Birthday*, edited by Richard L. DeMolen, 59–96. New York, NY: Fordham University Press, 1994.
- Dickens, Arthur Geoffrey. *Reformation and Society in Sixteenth-Century Europe*. London, UK: Thames & Hudson, 1966.

- Donnelly, John Patrick. *Ignatius of Loyola: Founder of the Jesuits*. New York, NY: Longman, 2004.
- Dunn, James D. G. The Theology of Paul the Apostle. Grand Rapids, MI: Eerdmans, 2006.
- Edwards, Mark J., and Thomas C. Oden, eds. *Galatians, Ephesians, Philippians*. Ancient Christian Commentary on Scripture - New Testament VIII. Downers Grove, IL: Inter Varsity Press, 2005.
- Fitzmyer, Joseph A. *Spiritual Exercises Based on Paul's Epistle to the Romans*. New York, NY: Paulist Press, 1995.
- Geger, Barton T. "The First First Companions: The Continuing Impact of the Men Who Left Ignatius." *Studies in the Spirituality of Jesuits* 44, no. 2 (Summer 2012).
- Gelpi, Donald L. "Theological Reflections on the Priestly Character of Our Jesuit Vocation." *Studies in the Spirituality of Jesuits* 19, no. 3 (1987): 49–84.
- George A Kennedy. Classical Rhetoric & Its Christian & Secular Tradition from Ancient to Modern Times. 2nd ed., And enl.. Chapel Hill, NC: University of North Carolina Press, 1999.
- Gonçalves da Câmara, Luis. *Remembering Iñigo: Glimpses of the Life of Saint Lgnatius Loyola / The Memoriale of Luis Gonçalves Da Câmara*. Translated by Alexander Eaglestone and Joseph A. Munitiz. St. Louis, MO: Institute of Jesuit Sources, 2004.
- Gonzalez, Justo L. *The Story of Christianity, Vol. 2: The Reformation to the Present Day.* 2nd edition. New York: HarperOne, 2010.
- Gorman, Michael J. Apostle of the Crucified Lord: A Theological Introduction to Paul and His Letters. Grand Rapids, MI: Eerdmans, 2004.
- Gunderson, Erik. *The Cambridge Companion to Ancient Rhetoric*. Cambridge Companions to Literature. Cambridge, UK ; New York: Cambridge University Press, 2009.
- Harmless, J. William. "Jesuits as Priests: Crisis and Charism." *Studies in the Spirituality of Jesuits* 19, no. 3 (1987): 1–47.
- Herbert, T. D. *Kenosis and Priesthood: Towards a Protestant Re-Evaluation of the Ordained Ministry*. Patermoster Theological Monographs. Eugene, OR: Wipf and Stock Publishers, 2008.
- Jorgensen, Kenneth J. "The Theatines." In *Religious Orders of the Catholic Reformation: In* Honor of John C. Olin on His Seventy-Fifth Birthday, edited by Richard L. DeMolen, 1– 29. New York, NY: Fordham University Press, 1994.
- José García Castro Valdés. "Ignatius of Loyola and His First Companions." In *A Companion to Ignatius of Loyola: Life, Writings, Spirituality, Influence*, edited by Robert A. Maryks, 66–83. Leiden, Netherlands: Brill, 2014.
- Law, David R. "Kenotic Christology." In *The Blackwell Companion to Nineteenth-Century Theology*, edited by David Fergusson, 251–79. Blackwell Companions to Religion. Chichester, UK.; Malden, MA: Wiley-Blackwell, 2010.
- Lenski, R. C. H. *The Interpretation of St. Paul's Epistles to the Ephesians and Philippians.* Minneapolis, MN: Augsburg Fortress, 2008.
- Lewis, Mark. "The First Jesuits as 'Reformed Priests."" Archivum Historicum Societatis Iesu 65 (1996): 111–27.
- McGovern, Thomas J. *Priestly Identity: A Study in the Theology of Priesthood*. Dublin: Four Courts Press, 2002.
- Meissner, William W. Ignatius of Loyola: The Psychology of a Saint. New Haven, CT: Yale

University Press, 1992.

Modras, Ronald. Ignatian Humanism. Chicago, IL: Loyola Press, 2004.

Nicolás, Adolfo. "Invitation to Reflect on Priesthood in the Society of Jesus," June 19, 2009.

- O'Malley, John W. "One Priesthood: Two Traditions." In *A Concert of Charisms: Ordained Ministry in Religious Life*, edited by Paul Kevin Hennessy, 9–24. New York, NY: Paulist Press, 1997.
 - ------. "Priesthood, Ministry, and Religious Life: Some Historical and Historiographical Considerations." *Theological Studies* 49, no. 2 (1988): 223–257.
- ------. The First Jesuits. Cambridge, MA: Harvard University Press, 2001.
- ———. *The Jesuits: A History from Ignatius to the Present*. Lanham, MD: Rowman & Littlefield, 2014.

———. "To Travel to Any Part of the World: Jerónimo Nadal and the Jesuit Vocation." *Studies in the Spirituality of Jesuits* 16, no. 2 (1984): 1–28.

- Osborne, Kenan B. Priesthood: A History of Ordained Ministry in the Roman Catholic Church. New York, NY: Paulist Press, 1989.
- Parish, Helen. Clerical Celibacy in the West: C.1100-1700. London, UK: Routledge, 2016.
- Payne, Stanley G. Spanish Catholicism: An Historical Overview. Madison, WI: University of Wisconsin Press, 1984.
- Polanco, Juan Alfonso de. "Directives on Academic Progress (1548)." In *Jesuit pedagogy*, 1540-1616: a reader, edited by Cristiano Casalini and Claude N. Pavur, 49–54. Chestnut Hill, MA: Institute of Jesuit Sources, 2016.
 - ——. "The Importance of Humanistic Studies in Jesuit Formation (1547)." In *Jesuit pedagogy, 1540-1616: a reader*, edited by Cristiano Casalini and Claude N. Pavur, 41–47. Chestnut Hill, MA: Institute of Jesuit Sources, 2016.
- Pope Francis. "Address of His Holiness Pope Francis to the 36th General Congregation of the Society of Jesus (October 24, 2016)." In *Decrees and Documents of 36th General Congregation of the Society of Jesus*, 87–100. Gujarat, INDIA: Gujarat Sahitya Prakash, 2017.
- Pope Paul VI. "Evangelii Nuntiandi [Apostolic Exhortation to the Episcopate, to the Clergy and to All the Faith of the Entire World]." Vatican Website, December 8, 1975. http://w2.vatican.va/content/paul-vi/en/apost_exhortations/documents/hf_pvi exh 19751208 evangelii-nuntiandi.html.
- Rahner, Karl. Foundations of Christian Faith: An Introduction to the Idea of Christianity. Translated by William V. Dych. New York, NY: Crossroad, 1985.
- ————. "On the Theology of the Incarnation." In *A Rahner Reader*, edited by Gerard A. McCool, 145–53. New York, NY: Crossroad, 1975.
 - ——. "Priest and Poet." In *Theological Investigations*, translated by Karl. H Kruger and Boniface Kruger, Vol. 3. New York, NY: Crossroad, 1982.
 - ------. *Spiritual Exercises*. Translated by Kenneth Baker. New York, NY: Herder and Herder, 1965.
 - ——. "The Point of Departure in Theology for Determining the Nature of the Priestly Office." In *Theological Investigations*, translated by Karl. H Kruger and Boniface Kruger, Vol. 12. New York, NY: Crossroad, 1974.

——. The Priesthood. Translated by Edward Quinn. New York, NY: Seabury Press, 1973.

Rausch, Thomas P. "Priest, Community, and Eucharist." In Finding God in All Things: Essays in

Honor of Michael J. Buckley, edited by Michael J. Himes and Stephen J. Pope, 262–75. New York, NY: Crossroad Publishing Company, 1996.

- Ribadeneira, Pedro de. *The Life of Ignatius of Loyola*. Translated by Claude Pavur. Saint Louis, MO: Institute of Jesuit Sources, 2014.
- Røsok, Ingvild. "Unconditional Surrender and Love: How Spirituality Illuminates the Theology of Karl Rahner." *The Way* 50, no. 4 (2011): 121–32.
- Sabina Pavone. "A Saint under Trial: Ignatius of Loyola between Alcalá and Rome." In *A Companion to Ignatius of Loyola: Life, Writings, Spirituality, Influence*, edited by Robert A. Maryks, 45–65. Leiden, Netherlands: Brill, 2014.
- Saint Francis Xavier. "To Juan de Azpilcueta, in Obanos (from Paris, March 25, 1535)." In *The Letters and Instructions of Francis Xavier*, translated by M. Joseph Costelloe. St. Louis, MO: Institute of Jesuit Sources, 1992.
- Saint Ignatius of Loyola. *Personal Writings: Reminiscences, Spiritual Diary, Select Letters Including the Text of The Spiritual Exercises*. Translated by Philip Endean and Joseph A. Munitiz. London, UK: Penguin Books, 2004.
 - ——. "To John of Avila (from Rome, January 24, 1549)." In *Letters of St. Ignatius of Loyola*, translated by William J. Young, 182–84. Chicago, IL: Loyola University Press, 1959.
- Sampley, J. Paul. *Paul in the Greco-Roman World: A Handbook*. Harrisburg, PA: Trinity Press International, 2003.
- Second Vatican Council. Vatican Council II the Conciliar and Post Conciliar Documents. Edited by Austin Flannery. New rev. ed. Collegeville, MN: Liturgical Press, 2014.
- Society of Jesus. *Decrees and Documents of 36th General Congregation of the Society of Jesus*. Gujarat, INDIA: Gujarat Sahitya Prakash, 2017.
- - ——. Jesuit Life & Mission Today: The Decrees and Accompanying Documents of the 31st-35th General Congregations of the Society of Jesus. Edited by John W. Padberg. St. Louis, MO: Institute of Jesuit Sources, 2009.
 - ------. The Constitutions of the Society of Jesus and Their Complementary Norms: A Complete English Translation of the Official Latin Texts. St. Louis, MO: Institute of Jesuit Sources, 1996.
 - —. "The Official Directory of 1599." In On Giving the Spiritual Exercises: The Early Jesuit Manuscript Directories and the Official Directory of 1599, edited by Martin E. Palmer, 349–89. St. Louis, MO: Institute of Jesuit Sources, 1996.
- *———. The Ratio Studiorum: The Official Plan for Jesuit Education.* Translated by Claude N. Pavur. St. Louis, MO: Institute of Jesuit Sources, 2005.
- Traub, George W. "Do You Speak Ignatian? A Glossary of Terms Used in Ignatian and Jesuit Circles." In *A Jesuit Education Reader*, edited by George W. Traub, 390–409. Chicago, IL: Loyola Press, 2008.
- Wallace, Peter G. *The Long European Reformation: Religion, Political Conflict, and the Search for Conformity, 1350-1750.* 2nd ed. New York, NY: Palgrave Macmillan, 2012.